DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 475 683 CE 084 752

AUTHOR	Ferro, Trenton R., Ed.
TITLE	Proceedings of the Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference (6th, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003).
SPONS AGENCY	Temple Univ., Philadelphia, PA.; Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education.
PUB DATE	2003-03-15
NOTE	145p.
PUB TYPE	Collected Works - Proceedings (021)
EDRS PRICE	EDRS Price MF01/PC06 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Access to Education; Activism; *Adult Education; Adult Learning; Adult Literacy; Correctional Education; Critical Thinking; Developing Nations; Distance Education; Education Work Relationship; *Educational Research; *Equal Education; *Experiential Learning; Foreign Countries; Higher Education; Learning Experience; *Literacy Education; Marketing; Models; Multicultural Education; Nonformal Education; Nurses; *Organizational Climate; Phenomenology; Relevance (Education); Religious Education; Research and Development; Spiritual Development; Spirituality; Study Abroad; Telecommunications; Theory Practice Relationship; Womens Education; Work Experience
IDENTIFIERS	Breast Examination; Korea; Reflective Practice

ABSTRACT

These 21 papers share research findings on the link between practice and research in adult, continuing, community, and distance education. Nine invited papers are "Evolution of Activists" (Baird); "Toward a Phenomenology of Adults' Learning Experiences" (Baptiste et al.); "Quest for the Grail? Searching for Critical Thinking in Adult Education" (Boxler); "Adult Education as Snake Oil Under the Guise of Democracy" (Carr-Chellman, Carr-Chellman); "Production of Knowledge in Work Teams" (Howell); "Life Since Then: Reconstructing Korean Women's Educational Experiences and Their Lives" (Hyun); "Form or Flesh: Social Factors That Impact Women's Practice of Breast Self-Examination" (London); "Marketing God: Critical Inquiry into Spirituality in the Workplace" (Milacci, Howell); and "From Symbols, Stories, and Social Artifacts to Social Architecture and Agency" (Siegel). Twelve refereed papers are "Adult Learners' Perceptions of Teaching and Learning During Times of Crisis" (Amann); "Healthcare and Adult Education" (Beck); "Effectiveness of Workplace Diversity Training" (Bettinger); "Synthesis of Empirical Literature: In Distance Education What Is the Relationship Between Asynchronous Computer-Mediated Communication and the Adult Learning Process?" (Linda M. Black); "Identifying Theories on Practice in Adult Literacy Education" (Coro); "Use of Critical Thinking and Reflective Practice with an Experienced Occupational Therapy Assistant: Case Study" (Humbert); "Four Adult Literacy Classrooms" (Medina); "Contributions of Literacy to Employment" (Passmore et al.); "'From Many, One': Exploration of Religious Pluralism and the Religious Education of Young Adults" (Ritchey); "Factors Deterring Adult Undergraduate Students from Participation in Study Abroad" (Surridge); "Making Meaning of Nonformal Education in State and Local Parks" (Taylor); and "From Research to Practice: Toward a Spiritually Grounded and Culturally Relevant Pedagogy" (Tisdell). (YLB)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 475 683

Proceedings

of the

6th Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

March 15, 2003

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
T. Ferro
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
1

Edited by
Trenton R. Ferro

Co-Sponsored by
Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education
Temple University

Held at
Temple University-Harrisburg

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Proceedings

of the

6th Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

March 15, 2003

Edited by
Trenton R. Ferro

Proceedings Printed by the
Department of Adult and Community Education
Indiana University of Pennsylvania

Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Temple University-Harrisburg

March 15, 2003

Introduction

Welcome to the 6th Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference! Today you are participating in the only conference in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania dedicated to research in the field of adult education—and, to the best of our knowledge, the only statewide conference of its kind in the United States. Its purpose is to provide participants a forum for sharing research findings that focus on the link between practice and research in adult, continuing, community, and distance education.

The first such conference, held in the fall of 1994, was conceived as a way for students who were unable to travel to the Adult Education Research Conference (AERC) to hear adult educators from Pennsylvania who had made presentations at AERC. As the planning progressed, the decision was made also to invite proposals, especially from students and practitioners, to flesh out a full-day conference. Over the years the conference has expanded to include, on various occasions, poster session, symposia, and keynote speakers.

Each conference has been hosted by one of the institutions in the commonwealth that offers a program in adult, continuing, community, and distance education. The Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education (PAACE) has also become an active sponsor of the conference. We thank Temple University-Harrisburg and PAACE for their involvement in, and support of, this year's conference.

Good practice both informs, and is informed by, good and relevant research. It is the hope of the planners of this conference that you, the participant, will develop as a practitioner and researcher by learning from, and contributing to, an expanding knowledge and research base, represented in part by the efforts of the contributors included in this volume.

Trenton R. Ferro
Proceedings Editor

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Temple University-Harrisburg

March 15, 2003

Program Committee

Kathleen Kramer, Chair, Temple University-Harrisburg
Gary J. Dean, Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Trenton R. Ferro, Indiana University of Pennsylvania

Proposal Reviewers

Gary J. Dean, Chair, Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Nurun Begum, Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Christopher M. Coro, Northampton Community College
Val Helterbran, Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Gaye Ranck Jenkins, Allenwood, PA
Carey Roth, Norristown, PA
Edward W. Taylor, Pennsylvania State University, Capital College

Local Planning Committee: Temple University-Harrisburg

Lydia Husband, Office Manager
Darlene Spengler, Academic Advisor
Tia Gilbert-Beverly, Secretary
Pamela Reynolds, Secretary
Peggy McCready, Computer Specialist

Conference Sponsors

Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education
Temple University

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Temple University-Harrisburg

March 15, 2003

Program

8:30 a.m. – 9:00 a.m. **Registration & Refreshments**

9:00 a.m. – 9:30 a.m. **Welcome and Announcements**

Dr. Kathleen Kramer, Temple University-Harrisburg
Dr. Gary J. Dean, Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Dr. Trenton R. Ferro, Indiana University of Pennsylvania

9:45 a.m. – 10:30 a.m. **Concurrent Session I**

Humbert, Tamera K. "The Use of Critical Thinking and Reflective Practice with an Experienced Occupational Therapy Assistant: A Case Study"

London, Patricia A. "Form or Flesh: Social Factors that Impact Women's Practice of Breast Self-Examination"

Passmore, David L., Lin, Chang-Jung, Chen, Ying-Ni, Bevans-Gonzales, Theresa, Cebici, Evin Dogan, & Brna, Michael J., Jr. "Contributions of Literacy to Employment: Theoretical Perspective and Preliminary Estimates"

Surridge, Robert W. "Factors Deterring Adult Undergraduate Students from Participation in Study Abroad"

Tisdell, Elizabeth J. "From Research to Practice: Toward A Spiritually Grounded and Culturally Relevant Pedagogy"

10:30 a.m. – 11:00 a.m. **Break**

11:00 a.m. – 11:45 a.m. **Concurrent Session II**

Baptiste, Ian, Lalley, Kristine, Milacci, Fred, & Mushi, Honoratha. "Toward a Phenomenology of Adults' Learning Experiences"

Bettinger, Thomas V. "Effectiveness of Workplace Diversity Training: A Review of the Empirical Literature"

Boxler, Heather M. "Quest for the Grail? Searching for Critical Thinking in Adult Education"

Coro, Christopher M. "Identifying Theories on Practice in Adult Literacy Education"

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Hyun, Kyungmi. "Life Since Then: Reconstructing Korean Women's Educational Experiences and their Lives"

Ritchey, Jeffrey A. "'From Many, One': An Exploration of Religious Pluralism and the Religious Education of Young Adults"

12:00 noon – 1:00 p.m. **Lunch**

1:00 p.m. – 1:45 p.m. **Poster Sessions**

2:00 p.m. – 2:45 p.m. **Concurrent Session III**

Beck, Julie A. "Healthcare and Adult Education: Magnet Hospitals as an Exemplar Continuing Education Setting for Nurses"

Black, Linda M. "A Synthesis of Empirical Literature: In Distance Education What Is the Relationship Between Asynchronous Computer-Mediated Communication and the Adult Learning Process?"

Howell, Sharon L. "The Production of Knowledge in Work Teams: The View from Below"

Medina, Patsy. "Four Adult Literacy Classrooms: Two Types of Learner Voice"

Taylor, Edward W. "Making Meaning of Nonformal Education in State and Local Parks"

2:45 p.m. – 3:15 p.m. **Break**

3:15 p.m. – 4:00 p.m. **Concurrent Session IV**

Amann, Tara L. "Adult Learners' Perceptions of Teaching and Learning During Times of Crisis"

Baird, Irene C. "Evolution of Activists: Prison Women's Writings as Change Agent for Their Communities"

Carr-Chellman, Alison A., & Carr-Chellman, Davin J. "Adult Education as Snake Oil under the Guise of Democracy"

Milacci, Fred, & Howell, Sharon L. "Marketing God: A Critical Inquiry into Spirituality in the Workplace"

Siegel, Irwin H. "From Symbols, Stories and Social Artifacts to Social Architecture and Agency: The Discourse of Learning and the Decline of 'Organizational Culture' in the 'New Work Order'"

Proceedings of the
Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

March 15, 2003

Invited Papers

Baird, Irene C.	Evolution of Activists: Prison Women's Writings as Change Agent for Their Communities	1
Baptiste, Ian, Lalley, Kristine, Milacci, Fred, & Mushi, Honoratha	Toward a Phenomenology of Adults' Learning Experiences	7
Boxler, Heather M.	Quest for the Grail? Searching for Critical Thinking in Adult Education	14
Carr-Chellman, Alison A., & Carr-Chellman, Davin J.	Adult Education as Snake Oil under the Guise of Democracy	21
Howell, Sharon L.	The Production of Knowledge in Work Teams: The View from Below	28
Hyun, Kyungmi	Life Since Then: Reconstructing Korean Women's Educational Experiences and their Lives	35
London, Patricia A.	Form or Flesh: Social Factors that Impact Women's Practice of Breast Self-Examination	41
Milacci, Fred, & Howell, Sharon L.	Marketing God: A Critical Inquiry into Spirituality in the Workplace	47
Siegel, Irwin H.	From Symbols, Stories and Social Artifacts to Social Architecture and Agency: The Discourse of Learning and the Decline of "Organizational Culture" in the "New Work Order"	54

Refereed Papers

Amann, Tara L.	Adult Learners' Perceptions of Teaching and Learning During Times of Crisis	60
Beck, Julie A.	Healthcare and Adult Education: Magnet Hospitals as an Exemplar Continuing Education Setting for Nurses	67

Bettinger, Thomas V.	Effectiveness of Workplace Diversity Training: A Review of the Empirical Literature	73
Black, Linda M.	A Synthesis of Empirical Literature: In Distance Education What Is the Relationship Between Asynchronous Computer-Mediated Communication and the Adult Learning Process?	79
Coro, Christopher M.	Identifying Theories on Practice in Adult Literacy Education	85
Humbert, Tamera K.	The Use of Critical Thinking and Reflective Practice with an Experienced Occupational Therapy Assistant: A Case Study	92
Medina, Patsy	Four Adult Literacy Classrooms: Two Types of Learner Voice	98
Passmore, David L., Lin, Chang-Jung, Chen, Ying-Ni, Bevans-Gonzales, Theresa, Cebici, Evin Dogan, & Brna, Michael J., Jr.	Contributions of Literacy to Employment: Theoretical Perspective and Preliminary Estimates	105
Ritchey, Jeffrey A.	"From Many, One": An Exploration of Religious Pluralism and the Religious Education of Young Adults	111
Surridge, Robert W.	Factors Deterring Adult Undergraduate Students from Participation in Study Abroad	118
Taylor, Edward W.	Making Meaning of Nonformal Education in State and Local Parks	125
Tisdell, Elizabeth J.	From Research to Practice: Toward A Spiritually Grounded and Culturally Relevant Pedagogy	132

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Evolution of Activists: Prison Women's Writings as Change Agent for Their Communities

Irene C. Baird

Abstract: Within the context of a Freirian/humanities adult education program for incarcerated women, 1972 militant women's poetry serendipitously precipitated the emergence of an activist perspective among "repeaters" for effecting change within their community, confirming theoretical constructs regarding the development of a confident, meaningful "voice" for social engagement.

Introduction

From an adult education perspective, since 1994 groups of women at a county jail have explored women's literature as a medium for understanding and addressing the crises that inhibit their self-actualization. Subsequent creative expression reinforces the reflection and discussion, thereby shattering "the culture of silence" (Freire, 1995) of these oppressed women and empowering them through the use of their own words (Baird, 1997). In addition to an acknowledged oral history tradition among African Americans, black feminist scholars such as Hill Collins (1997) have underscored the need for and efficacy of sharing personal histories to authenticate and, according to hooks (1994), to provide "a firm grounding in self and identity" (p. 452). Current studies within higher education and the medical community also focus on the power of narratives, theirs as a healing dimension (Anderson & MacCurdy, 1997). Given this increasing and varied interest in the writing process, the original intent was to examine the outcomes of the Freirian/humanities-oriented program for incarcerated women in which self-expression was an integral, significant aspect of identity formation. Participation was voluntary; five of the women were frequent "residents" of the jail and always involved themselves in the program. They claimed that the learning model was effective for continuing to work through deep-seated problems. As the program evolved, however, influenced by Giovanni's (1972) activist poetry these five chose to redirect their attention from the personal identity-formation dialogue of the group to community identity perspectives. As a result, a creative social activist voice emerged that defined their community, with the purpose of generating healthy change. This serendipitous outcome, therefore, became the purpose of the study.

Methodology

Fifteen Anglo-, African-American and Latina women, between the ages of 19 and 40, volunteered to participate in a series of three ten-week sessions, with each meeting lasting 90 minutes. The process was based on a model created for a pilot study with homeless women as a non-threatening mechanism for addressing personal crises (Baird, 1997, 1994). Drawing on the

aspect of the humanities that stress cognitive skills for examining personal identity, values and community building, the model involved reading, reflection and discussion of poetry and prose selections of successful female authors of similar race, class and experience as a method for understanding and addressing their own traumas. The women were appraised beforehand of the process which incorporated creative expression on issues relevant to each one. As a result, they requested authors they chose to serve as "mentors," as role models for their writing. Maya Angelou, Patrice Gaines and Nikki Giovanni were the authors of choice. At the culmination of a ten-week segment, the women selected their favorite writing samples for inclusion in their book as tangible evidence of identity, esteem and empowerment building. Data gathered during the course of the study included annotated observations of the class interaction, written and oral evaluations and an analysis of the women's writing for thematic constructs.

Theory

This study was framed in the context of the oppressive conditions and status of incarcerated women. They are defined as a disturbing statistic and classified by a prison number. Recognized feminist corrections research chronicles the race, class and gender factors that form the basis of the stigma and marginalization (Belknap, 1996; Owen, 1998; Watterson, 1996). Chesney-Lind's (1997) work especially focuses on the societal attitudes and policy that contribute to the potential for girls to become offenders. This research also confirms some adult education perspectives on the education and marginalization of incarcerated women (Baird, 2001).

Given this context, Freirian theory was the most appropriate lens through which to analyze the outcomes. As a learning issue, it supported the humanities orientation of exercising cognitive skills to address identity, values and community building. Its precise focus, however, was on the issue of oppression. Succinctly, Freire's commitment was to provide illiterate peasants, *objects* of oppression, with a process for humanization, empowerment and liberation. It evolved from the lowest "intransitive, *object*" stage, the "culture of silence" and self-blame level, to the highest "transitive, *subject*" stage of self-confidence and a sense of responsibility. Inherent was the acquisition of a voice, a vocabulary of the learners' words to identify themselves, their status and to take action, to face the oppressor.

Black feminist theory, especially the work of Hill Collins (1997), echoed the same necessity for taking responsibility for identity formation and socialization for liberation. She reinforced this theory, quoting bell hooks (as cited in Hill Collins, 1997), "Oppressed people resist by identifying themselves as ***subjects*** [italics added] . . . by shaping their identity, naming their history, telling their story. Because self-definition is key to individual and group empowerment, . . . ce[ding] this to other groups . . . in essence perpetuates black women's subordination" (p. 254). This is especially significant given the fact that the five "emerging activists" were African-American.

Findings

The majority of the women, in their writing and discussion, were receptive to the model. The following responses were similar to and consistent with previous outcomes regarding identity formation:

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

> You can just imagine all kinds of personalities that you are open to collect
> You will struggle with yourself to figure out what your purpose truly can be
> if you are not clear about yourself
> your life will be chaotic and a continuing search for help.

Another reflected:

> I am a mere image of my former self
> I take inventory and find nothing on the shelf
> I have a future I need to make last
> I must see another day, another way

The serendipitous outcome, however, was the emergence of a different, an activist voice. The following excerpts are an appropriate introduction to this new direction and its influences:

> Nikki Giovanni taught me never to give up
> while Maya Angelou taught me to never shut up.
> . . .
> While Nikki Giovanni encouraged me to stick and stay
> Two highly critically acclaimed poets
> I want to follow in their footsteps wouldn't you know it
> Maya Angelou said "I'm the Reason Why the Caged Bird Sings"
> and Nikki Giovanni said "CHANGE SOME THINGS!"

Though written independently from the other four women's creative input, this signaled a turning point from reflections during previous periods of incarceration and program participation. This time it was Giovanni's 1972 militant poetry that resonated for them. Their own writing, in contrast however, turned into messages to their community, using the "safety net" of literature to teach, to help, to discourage a cycle of incarceration.

One woman, in particular, was amassing a collection entitled "Bitter Sweet." Her preface reads:

> A. seeks to reach out to the Black Community to rebuild what she helped to tear down and to encourage others . . . A. has experienced growing up in a dysfunctional family, teen-age pregnancy, rape, brutal domestic violence, a heroin, cocaine and crack cocaine addition, and has spent the majority of her adult life incarcerated in some form or another . . . [her poetry] reflects on her past, her present, and her hopes and dreams for a brighter tomorrow.

Space limitations prevent sharing complete selections. Because it is essential to read the women's own words, the following excerpts are examples of how they identified with their own communities:

Open Your Eyes

Black people wake up and open your eyes,
it isn't our race that you should hate and despise.
Black people look around you, tell me what you see,
is it drugs plaguing and destroying communities.
Black people do you ask why our young black youth commit so many crimes,
are we guilty of not instilling positive images into their minds.
Black people unite, let us build up and not tear down,
let us come together and turn our lives and our children's lives around.
Black people we must educate our uneducated; preach and teach;
praying that our youths are not lost, and totally out of our reach.
Black people wake up and open your eyes
before it's <u>your</u> black baby next, who dies.

B. reflected that Giovanni's "We" influenced "Those Nights."

We

we stood there waiting
. . .
watching to see if
hope would come by
we stood there hearing
the sound of police sirens
and fire engines
the explosions
and babies crying
we listened
. . .
hearts shutting
the bodies sweating
we are seeing the revolution
screeeeeeeeeeeching
to a halt trying to find a
clever way
to be empty
[2 feb 70]

Those Nights

Restless nights
can't sleep for the shootings and fights,
drunkards staggering through the streets
while city cops walk the best
hearing the baby crying from downstairs
she has a mother that doesn't care
I remember being "out there"
the pain in my life was too much to bear
as I look down on the city's sights
I see the pestilence and remember those perilous nights
Another restless night
can I stand up and fight?
to help my sisters and my brothers
praying just to help another
the baby that was crying downstairs
here I sit rocking her and shedding my tears
the city's still blinking it's neon lights
how many more will die tonight?

Two of the women spoke to their "sistahs [sic] and brothers" about resolving conflict without violence. N., who now comfortably describes herself as a "regular cat," chronicled in detail—name, place, date—the fate of 41 people she knew who were destroyed by AIDS, drugs and street violence—their epitaph. Finally, reflections about the "hood":

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

In My Hood

Life in my hood isn't always sweet,
step up on my stoop and take a seat.
Look around with your eyes opened wide
In this neighborhood who takes pride?
. . .
There are a few of us who really do care.
Life in my hood is always sweet
let's pull together to conquer and defeat!

In the interviews, especially, the women exercised extraordinary agency, requesting the dissemination of their writing. They maintained that the alternative, open resistance to the prison system, would be personally destructive, on the inside and the outside. They were not familiar with Freirian or black feminist theory. Theoretically, however, they validated the Freirian perspective (Freire, 1995) of moving from a "culture of silence," of being "object" in their earlier writing, to a level of self-confidence, of using words that held meaning for them to assume responsibility for their communities by trying to humanize and liberate them. In essence, their use of literature was a way of reinforcing hooks's (1994) admonition of "choosing 'wellness' [for their community] as a form of political resistance" (p. 452).

Implications and Conclusions

Because six years of learning with, from and about incarcerated women with their deeply-rooted problems, exacerbated by drugs and lack of community support and resources, questions arose regarding the outcomes in spite of the stunning correspondence with theory. Among the incarcerated, often there is fear of change and lack of trust as a result of their real-life experiences. During an interview, one woman said, "I could change the world if I could change myself." Only five, all repeaters in the program, felt comfortable doing so. The question that remained unanswered, therefore, was whether the new direction of the "activists" was the result of their having evolved and defined themselves and their role in their communities to the extent that they achieved the Freirian "self-confident stage" for assuming responsibility as change agents. Or, as has been attributed to Giovanni's militancy, was the activist voice still a personal "revolution," a gesture that heals? The strongest implication is that this limited research needs to be repeated, especially if, as adult educators, we are to develop and take to the oppressed programs that support them in their achievement of humanization, empowerment and liberation.

References

Anderson, C. M., & MacCurdy, M. A. (Eds.). (1997). *Writing and healing: Toward an informed practice*. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English.

Angelou, M. (1970). *I know why the caged bird sings*. New York: Bantam.

Baird I. C. (1994). The humanities for homeless women: A paradox in learning. *Adult Learning*, *5*(3), 13, 15.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Baird, I. C. (1997). *Unlocking the cell: A humanities model for marginalized women*. Washington, DC: American Association for Adult and Continuing Education.

Baird, I. C. (2001). Education, incarceration and the marginalization of women. In P. Sissel & V. Sheared (Eds.), *Making space: Reframing practice in adult education* (pp. 168-181). Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group.

Belknap, J. (1996). *The invisible woman*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Chesney-Lind, M. (1997). *The female offender*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Freire, P. (1995). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum. (Original work published 1970)

Gaines, P. (1995). *Laughing in the dark: From colored girl to woman of color—A journey from prison to power*. New York: Anchor.

Giovanni, N. (1972). *My house*. New York: Quill

Hill Collins, P. (1997). Defining black feminist thought. In L. Nicholson (Ed.), *The second wave: A reader in feminist theory* (pp. 241-259). New York: Routledge.

hooks, b. (1994). Writing autobiography. In S. Cahill (Ed.), *Writing women's lives* (pp. 451-457). New York: Harper Perennial.

Kinchloe, J. L. (1991). *Teachers as researchers: Qualitative inquiry as a path for empowerment*. London, NY: Falmer Press.

Owen, B. (1998). *In the mix*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Patton, M. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Watterson, K. (1996). *Women in prison: Inside the concrete tomb* (Rev. ed.). B oston: Northeastern University Press.

Irene C. Baird, D.Ed., The Pennsylvania State University at Harrisburg, Affiliate in Education and Director of PSH Women's Enrichment Center, 234 North Third Street, Harrisburg, PA 17101; icb100@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Toward A Phenomenology of Adults' Learning Experiences

Ian Baptiste, Kristine Lalley, Fred Milacci, and Honoratha Mushi

Abstract: Four researchers conduct phenomenological interviews to find out how adults describe their learning experiences and what meanings they attach to those descriptions. The study proposes common structural and functional features of adults' learning experiences, while noting important substantive differences between and among the participants interviewed. It raises questions concerning the differences between experiences in general and learning experiences in particular and between learning and performance, and it questions the meaning and validity of the construct, group learning; it draws several implications regarding the teaching of adults; and it proposes a way to reconcile the apparent chasm between the two dominant phenomenological schools: transcendental and existential phenomenology.

Purpose of the Study

Our ability as educators to assist learners would be enhanced by knowing how the learners construe and construct learning experiences. Research that focuses directly on adult learning has given only cursory attention to the lived experiences of adult learners. Consequently, most research on adult learning is long on speculations and theoretical propositions about what adult learning is or should be, but short on information about the meanings adults confer upon their lived experiences as learners (Knowles, Holton, & Swanson, 1998; Jarvis, 1992; Merriam & Cafferella, 1999; Mezirow, 1991; Smith & Pourchot, 1998; Tennant & Pogson, 1995). Although there are studies in the phenomenological literature in which the primary focus was the existential experiences of adults, in none of these studies was the phenomenon, adult learning, a primary focus. These studies explored such related concepts and ideas as adult education, professional adult educator, lifelong learning, collaborative inquiry, and intuition (Bray, 1995; Chalmers, 1997; Mott, 1995; Stanage, 1989; York, 1995). Finally only a single study was found where adult learning and phenomenology intersect—Tempesta (2001). However, despite its title, that study was not a phenomenological description of adults' learning experiences. Rather, it was an accounting for how learning contributes to leadership in social movements. We conclude, therefore, that adults' learning experiences are not addressed adequately in the literature. This study, a small step in filling that void, seeks to construct a phenomenology of adult learning by examining closely experiences adults associate with the term learning.

Theoretical Perspective and Research Design

Phenomenology is concerned with understanding phenomena from the perspective of those who have experienced them. Phenomenologists agree that a rich, full understanding of any human phenomenon requires a deep, probing examination of people's lived experiences (Gadamer, 1990; Heidegger, 1962, 1972; Husserl, 1931, 1970, 1973; Moustakas, 1994, Van

Manen, 1990). Since the purpose of this study was to gain a richer, fuller understanding of the phenomenon *adult learning,* phenomenological inquiry seemed most appropriate.

The four researchers conducting this study all subscribe to the interpretivist as opposed to the transcendental view of phenomenology. (This distinction is addressed in our discussion section below.) With Heidegger we believe that all human experiences are by definition interpretive. This inevitability of interpretation precluded our bracketing or suspension of our assumptions, as Husserl (and the transcendentalists) advocate. We found that it was impossible for us to proceed without making some preliminary (though tentative) assumptions about what constitutes a *learning* experience, for instance. So instead of attempting to bracket our presuppositions, we continuously shared them. This sharing allowed us to make more transparent our biases, permitting us to identify areas of agreement and disagreement, be less proprietary about our individual positions, and be more open to being challenged by the emerging data. Our interpretivist stance also framed the nature of our task: to construct a plausible understanding of the adult learning phenomenon, rather than to uncover and describe its pure, objective essence.

Research Questions

Our initial research questions were: (a) What do adults mean when they say that they have really learned something? (b) How do their descriptions of what it means to really learn something change with maturation? To address these questions, research participants were presented with the following prompts:

- Describe a time, when, as an adult, you felt you really learned something.
- How did the experience affect you and what changes associated with the experiences did you observe?
- What thoughts, emotions, etc., were generated by the experience?
- How did the experience alter your relationship to self and/or others?
- What else, significant to this experience, would you like to share?

Participants were then asked to compare their *adult* experience of really learning something with a learning experience they had during childhood or adolescence. For reasons we will discuss later, we modified our research question during the data analysis process. The new question was: *How do adults describe their learning experiences and what meanings do they attach to those descriptions*?

Case Selection, Data Collection and Analysis

The study was conducted in Pennsylvania by four researchers--one faculty and three graduate students— jointly involved in a graduate program in adult education. We represent three different nationalities (United States, Tanzania, and Trinidad and Tobago). Two of us are white, and two are black; two are women, and two, men. The participants selected were laypersons (*not* self-described professional adult educators) whom we regularly encountered; who had little to no professional knowledge regarding adult learning; and who, presumably, had no vested interest in either promoting or denying any theory of adult learning. In the selection process we strove for diversity in gender, age, race/ethnicity, and occupation. Time allowed us to interview only four male participants. As with all phenomenological inquiry, our primary method of data collection was unstructured, individual interviews. In conducting the interviews (and later analysis) we drew on the following works: Coffey & Atkinson, 1996; Dey, 1993; Feldman, 1995; Glaser, 1978; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Moustakas, 1994, Strauss & Corbin, 1998.

For the analysis, we listened as a group to each tape-recorded interview, making individual summaries throughout this process. During this (and subsequent phases) we openly shared and recorded our feelings and insights---quite often comparing and contrasting our learning experiences with those of our participants and/or the literature. In short, heuristic inquiry, which asks, "What is *my* experience of this phenomenon and the essential experience of others who also experience this phenomenon intensely?" was an integral part of our data collection and analysis (Patton, 1990, p. 71).

We compiled our individual summaries (of each interview) into team summaries for each of our four participants. Using the team summaries, the primary data source used in conducting our analysis, we tagged and labeled meaning units onto separate flipchart paper. In the literature this process is referred to as open coding (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). We then grouped our meaning units into categories, continuously refining them through constant comparison until all meaning units were incorporated or accounted for (axial and selective coding). To enhance the trustworthiness of this study, we conducted our analysis collaboratively, that is, all four researchers were present for all phases of the analysis. Where possible we also shared our findings with our participants (member checking). Writing was as collaborative as the rest of the process. We literally wrote together, always feeding off one another.

Findings

From our participants' responses we constructed a normative definition of what our participants meant by a learning experience. This definition is comprised of three interconnecting elements: content (CT), context (CX) and con-fects (CF)©. However, we also noted tremendous individual differences in the ways adults interpret, inhabit, and manipulate those three elements.

Content

By content we mean what is being learned. During the earlier phases of our analysis we divided content into activities (such as swimming, driving a car, riding a bike, and how to get along with people) and subject matter (such as math, science, and business). However, under closer scrutiny, it became difficult for us to separate activity from subject matter. We concluded that all content contained both activities and subject matter—that particular content varied only in the ratio of psychomotor to mental activities particular learners perceive in that content. For instance, one participant perceived science as largely a mental activity (subject matter) while another (having had practical experience as a chemistry tutor) perceived science as a much more practical activity.

Context

Initially we distinguished conceptually and temporarily between learning contexts and learning processes. We assumed the former comprised those things that reside outside the learner—the instructional activities, and the larger physical and socio-cultural environment within which particular learning occurs, and which, consequently, shape (directly or indirectly) what is being learned. The latter, learning processes, referred to the internal mechanisms (cognitive, affective, volitional, spiritual, etc.) used by the learner to make meaning of the content. Upon deeper analysis, however, we realized that personal (internal) and non-personal (external) environments formed a dialectic union. Our participants' construal of their external

 BEST COPY AVAILABLE

environments was always influenced by their internal environments (beliefs, values, abilities, and so on) and vice versa. From a meaning making standpoint then, it did not seem instructive to us to temporally or conceptually separate a person's external and internal environments. *Context*, we concluded, is a dialectic union of personal and external forces, a dynamic (as opposed to static) notion, consisting of the materials, mechanisms, and opportunities learners use to make sense of and manipulate their learning *content*.

Regarding the personal aspect of context, we found that it consisted of the learner's ego strength along with his assessment of the cost/benefit ratio of the learning experience. By ego strength, we refer to the individual's general predispositions and propensities to learning. For example, one participant spoke of how his undergraduate experience predisposed him positively to withstand the rigors of his first year law school experience, not by equipping him with law-related knowledge or skills, but rather by imbuing him with a sense of self-efficacy.

Assessment of the cost/benefit ratio refers to (a) how the learner perceives the nature of the content, (b) what efforts mastering that content requires of him, and (c) his aptitude to master the content, as weighed against (d) the perceived benefits of his efforts. Here we cite as an example a participant who spoke of his insecurity around people with scientific knowledge. Perceiving the nature of scientific knowledge as predominantly cerebral and removed from his lived experiences, he estimated the efforts required of him to master that content as highly intellectual and, therefore, difficult. Having assessed his scientific aptitude as inadequate, he learned to feel "insecure around persons with scientific knowledge." This insecurity is part of the context that he brings with him to any scientific endeavor. The degree to which the perceived benefits outweigh these contextual costs determine the efforts he makes to learn.

We found that the environmental aspect of context consisted of physical and socio-cultural elements. These elements varied (a) by intensity and/or pervasiveness—i.e., how much of the content and context the learner was subjected t—and (b) by form—i.e., the ways in which the learner was subjected to them (content and context). As an example of intensity, one participant spoke of learning Swahili by being "immersed" in the context. As an example of form, another talked of the "rigid structure" of his college curriculum.

Constituent Effects (Con-fects ©)

The third component of the learning experience we identified as constituent effects (or con-fects). Our data led us to differentiate the consequences of learning into constituents and appanages. Constituent effects refer to the necessary impact of the experience on the learner, whereas appanages are those things that accompany or follow the experience but are not a necessary part of it. For example, losing weight is an appanage of the experience we call physical exercise, and not a constituent of it. Con-fects (the necessary consequences of a learning experience) are the changes that occur in the person who utters the words, "I have learned." They denote the *private* effects on the learner of the interplay of *content* and *context*. To illustrate: When a participant commented that his "learning of Swahili opened up new relationships with Tanzanian natives," we came to realize that "opening up new relationships" was an appanage resulting from *prior* private changes that had occurred within the participant. Those prior changes are what we have coined the con-fects of learning, and, in this case, they included the participant's greater proficiency with the Swahili language and the confidence that proficiency produced within him. As another example, a participant spoke of how learning to swim (con-

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

fect) provided the occasion and opportunity for greater intimacy with family members (appanage).

We have tentatively grouped the con-fects that our participants spoke of into the following categories: (a) attitudes—which include emotions, such as confidence and resentment; (b) psychomotor abilities, such as increased ability to ride a bike or swim; (c) awareness, i.e., gaining new insights about oneself and the world, such as coming to an appreciation that failure is inevitable in life; and (d) intellectual abilities, such as becoming more proficient at doing calculus, or becoming better at interacting with a legal text.

Discussion and Conclusion

Contribution to Phenomenology

One of our initial questions sought to gain information on whether and how the learning experiences of participants changed with maturation. However, it became apparent early on that, apart from the very spectacular, it was next to impossible for adults to provide rich constructions (required of phenomenology) of their childhood experiences. Furthermore, some of the participants noted that, even when able to reconstruct a childhood experience, it was from an adult perspective, rendering child-adult comparisons rather dubious. For these reasons we concluded that a phenomenological inquiry is an inappropriate method for examining a maturation process. Instead, longitudinal studies—either actual (such as panel or cohort, see Babbie, 1998) or simulated (such as Vygotsky's 1978 experimental-developmental method)—are more suitable.

Despite their essential similarities, phenomenologists differ in important respects. Roughly two camps have emerged—the transcendentalists and the existentialists. Transcendental phenomenologists assume that human experiences are made up of invariant, essential structures that transcend time and space. Existential, also called interpretivist or hermeneutic, phenomenologists, on the other hand, do not accord objective status to any human experience (Ray, 1994). Put differently, existential phenomenologists believe that human experiences are, by definition, interpretive, that without interpretation our world is merely one big bundle of meaningless events and occurrences.

We believe that we have found a way to reconcile the conflict between transcendental and existential phenomenology. Via heuristic inquiry (Moustakas, 1990; Patton, 1990) and deep probing of our data, we came to realize that there would be absolutely no reason to group individual entities (events, actions, ideas, etc.) under the same label if these things shared nothing in common. Things that have nothing in common are different phenom*ena*, not the same phenom*enon*. In other words, every member of a phenomenon must, by definition, share something(s) in common. We propose that members of the same phenomenon always share common *structural* and *functional* elements. To illustrate: Every house possesses similar structural elements—foundations, walls, roofs, doors, windows, and so on. Every house also possesses similar functional elements—to provide shelter, comfort and so on. It is because of their structural and functional similarity that we are able to refer to very different architectural constructions (Victorian, Ranch, Bungalow, etc.) as houses.

In much the same way, we argue, every learning experience (as a phenomenon) is made up of three elements: two structural and one functional. The structural elements of a learning experience are its content and contexts. The functional element is its con-fects. An experience that does not posses all three elements is, *in our opinion*, not a *learning* experience. We emphasize, "in our opinion," to highlight the subjective way in which all definitions of phenomena are determined. As is the case with houses (or any other phenomenon for that matter), what constitutes a learning experience will always be culturally and subjectively determined. Though we claim that every learning experience is structurally and functionally similar in that each possesses three elements (content, context, and con-fects), we have also shown that the three elements vary substantively (and considerably) from person to person over time and space.

Contribution to Adult Learning

Based on our investigation, we make three pedagogical observations regarding adult learning. First, our investigation led us to distinguish between an experience and a *learning* experience. By carefully examining the consequences of learning, we concluded that a learning experience only occurs when there is a change in a person's view of and/or relationship to him or herself. Other experiences are not imbued with this personal change criterion. We came to this conclusion when we differentiated the consequences of learning into constituent effects (con-fects) and appanages. Such a differentiation permitted us to pair the con-fects of learning with learning itself and the appanages of learning with performance.

From these observations we concluded that a learning experience is a special kind of meaning-making experience. All experiences (including learning experiences) are, by definition, meaning-making experiences because to have an experience is to make meaning of a particular encounter or situation. However, not all meaning making experiences lead to new or revised personal awareness; not all experiences result in people viewing and relating to themselves differently. We propose that only those experiences that cause us to view and/or relate to ourselves differently qualify as learning experiences; all others are of the general sort we call meaning making experiences.

The performances that accompany or follow a particular learning experience (appanages) utilize the con-fects of that experience; *but they also make use of con-fects derived from other learning experiences.* By differentiating between con-fects and appanages of learning we are able better to distinguish between learning and performance. Learning is to con-fects what performance is to appanages. Learning necessarily results in changes in a person's view of or relationship to self (con-fects). Performance refers to what a person does (appanages) on the basis of those personal changes. By attending to the con-fects of learning, educators are more likely to promote the appanages they desire. This differentiation seems to challenge the body of literature which appears to equate, or blur the distinction between, learning and performance—particularly that of behaviorism, information processing, and social learning theory (Bandura, 1977; Newell, Shaw, & Simon, 1958; 1961; Skinner, 1991).

We have classified constituent effects (con-fects) into attitudes, psychomotor abilities, awareness, and intellectual abilities. We recognize that these are very rudimentary categories. There is significant (and probably too much) overlap among them, and we doubt that they exhaust the range of con-fects that are humanly possible. It is necessary to distinguish among different types of con-fects because certain types of con-fects might be accomplished better via a

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

certain combination of content and context. For instance, the combination of content and context that might best boost someone's *confidence* (attitude) regarding calculus might be different from the combination that best fosters her/his calculus prowess (intellectual ability).

Our second pedagogical observation is this: Since con-fects are purely individual or private operations (or interpretations), such a distinction confirms the Platonic notion that learning is, at its core, a private activity of the self—even if the self is regarded as a "socius" (Butler, 1966, p. 83). This assertion also calls into question the so-called phenomenon of group learning, for to speak of group learning is either to confuse learning with performance (con-fects with appanages) or to assert that a group of individuals could occupy the same (i.e., identical) existential space.

Thirdly, we were surprised to discover how constraining the term adult learning could be. Employing this linguistic formulation (the gerund) enticed us to focus myopically on cognitive elements such as memory and other internal mental processes—to the exclusion of such things as content and context. Fortunately, our participants kept talking about their learning experiences in broader terms, incorporating content, context, and consequences of learning. Their broader focus led us to adopt the more expansive term: "the learning experiences of adults." This new linguistic formulation also provided a vehicle for us to highlight not only the commonalties but also the differences in adults' learning experiences. The commonalties refer to the normative structures and functions that adults share vis-à-vis their learning experiences, specifically the *content*, *context*, and *con-fects*. The differences manifest themselves substantively in the various ways adults interpret, inhabit, manipulate, and fulfill those structures and functions. The notion that there are tremendous substantive differences between and among adults regarding their learning experiences suggests that it might be instructive to shift the focus of adult learning theories from inter-group comparisons (adults verses non-adults) to intra-group comparisons (adults verses adults).

References

References will be distributed at the conference presentation.

Ian Baptiste, Assistant Professor, The Pennsylvania State University, 305 Keller, State College, PA 16801; ieb1@psu.edu

Kristine Lalley, Graduate Student, The Pennsylvania State University, 287 Oakwood Avenue, State College, PA 16803; (814) 867-3366

Fred Milacci, The Pennsylvania State University, RR2, Box 400, Morrisdale, PA 16858; (814) 342-0766; fmilacci@clearnet.net

Honoratha Mushi, Graduate Student, The Pennsylvania State University, 617 W. Park Avenue, State College, PA 16803; (814) 867-4613; hmm145@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Quest for the Grail? Searching for Critical Thinking in Adult Education

Heather M. Boxler

Abstract: The concept of critical thinking is explored from the perspective of an adult education graduate student. The paper argues that critical thinking, as presently constituted, lacks both clarity and depth. These problems need to be addressed before critical thinking can become viable and useful.

Locating Myself/Locating "Critical"

Often students are expected by adult education faculty to be critical in their approach to graduate studies. "Critical" is seemingly everywhere—in article titles, papers, books, dissertation abstracts, course syllabi, and so on to the point that "critical" becomes axiomatic. For me, the problem was that the meaning of "critical" seemed to change from syllabus to syllabus and article to article. So the question: What does it mean to be critical? As I read more, the questions shifted: From what theoretical background does this author or instructor come? How does this professor intend for us to be critical? What are we supposed to do with it? Is it worth doing? These difficulties have been haunting me since my first semester as a graduate student, three years ago, and have spurred my subsequent explorations. At first it was very much a matter of survival. I believed that to be successful in graduate school one must be critical. A second criterion for success is determining what sort of critical a given professor values and working in that mold. But how could something so important be so nebulous? How could no one really tell me what it meant to be critical or why it was necessary? Why weren't my fellow students worried about it?

At my first Adult Education Research Conference I began to ask conference participants what critical meant and received rolls of the eyes along with an impatient air of, "Oh, not that tired old thing. Let's talk about something interesting." One person even told me that critical thinking could not be defined because its meaning is unique for everyone. I considered for a while that perhaps critical thinking was a fad, that it was a concept with no real significance, a piece to play with in "buzzword bingo." I kept plugging away, however. I came to believe that there had to be something to the concept—I couldn't let it go. Moreover, I began to wonder if the problem with critical thinking had less to do with my lack of understanding and more to do with the incoherence of theoretical underpinnings informing its use. I valued the concept; I wanted to understand it, to give it depth, to be able to articulate a position and choose my practice based on this understanding . . . and thus my master's thesis was born (along with my second child). I cannot say that the thesis was a resounding success in doing all that I wanted to do, but it gave me some direction, helped me to understand some of the meanings and the tensions involved in the combination of critical thinking with adult education. It is this discussion, the discussion of meanings, tensions, inconsistencies, and potentials that I wish to explore further.

This paper is not intended to be an exhaustive review of the literature on critical thinking. A more complete review can be found in my M.Ed. thesis (Boxler, 2001). What I will highlight is a discussion of some of the tensions underlying the assumptions of critical thinking. As such, this paper should be seen as a beginning exploration rather than conclusive argument.

Positionality in Critical Thinking: Individual Empowerment and Social Change

My review suggests that two indistinct camps emerge from the literature: Those who seek individual empowerment through critical thinking and those who wish to inculcate critical thinking as a social responsibility. Those focusing on the individual tend to treat critical thinking as an end, with clearly identifiable goals, standards, and processes learners must use. Richard Paul's (Paul & Willsen, 1993) work exemplifies this view. Critical thinking is a general skill, not context-specific. In Paul's view critical thinking is "a systematic way to form and shape one's thinking. . . . It is thought that is disciplined, comprehensive, based on intellectual standards, and as a result, well-reasoned" (p. 20). He distinguishes between someone who thinks critically in the "weak sense" as described above and someone who thinks critically in the "strong sense," which is much more context specific. According to Paul (1993), someone who has mastered the logic or the basic skills of critical thinking is a weak sense critical thinker until she desires and has the ability to move beyond herself to see the bigger picture, therefore becoming a "strong sense" critical thinker. The strong sense critical thinker recognizes that "muddy" problems dominate in our world, and therefore must be able to cope with problems without retreating into an egocentric or ethnocentric shell. Paul describes

> the basic drives and abilities of what I call *strong sense* critical thinking: a) an ability to question deeply one's own framework of thought, b) an ability to reconstruct sympathetically and imaginatively the strongest versions of points of view and frameworks of thought opposed to one's own, and c) an ability to reason dialectically (multilogically) to determine when one's own point of view is weakest and when an opposing point of view is strongest. (p. 206, italics in original)

Brookfield (1987), falling in line with Paul's strong sense critical thinking, believes it is necessary for adults to live intelligently and responsibly in a democratic society. He argues that critically aware populations are more likely to participate in the formation of their political and social contexts than those who feel distanced. By "distanced" we mean those who choose not to participate in the aforementioned activities, possibly due to mass representation and significant sociopolitical decisions being made far away by a small power elite. Critical thinking is necessary if seemingly unempowered masses are to turn away from their self-absorbed private lives to become socially concerned and active. In spite of this language and rhetoric, Brookfield's work is targeted toward individual change. He delineates steps and processes, describes the process for an individual, and essentially is hoping that an individual who masters the processes will be willing and able to contribute to social change.

Jack Mezirow's (2000) transformation theory attempts to make sense of problem solving when the problems are ill-structured and grounded in life experience. Mezirow (1991) offers this definition:

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

> Transformative learning involves an enhanced level of awareness of the context of one's beliefs and feelings, a critique of their assumptions and particularly premises, an assessment of alternative perspectives, a decision to negate an old perspective in favor of a new one or to make a synthesis of old and new, an ability to take action based upon the new perspective, and a desire to fit the new perspective into the broader context of one's life." (p. 161)

It becomes clear that Mezirow is quite close to the traditional idea of rationality, which uses evidence and logical reasoning to determine a course of progress. While he makes use of Habermas' theory of communicative learning, one sees little or none of central social responsibility/action concepts in Mezirow's theory of transformation. As Cunningham (1993) noted, Mezirow "explicitly separates personal transformation from social transformation" (p. 10).

Thinking critically as a social responsibility is an entirely different matter. From this perspective, critical thinking is a process one uses within the larger practice of ideology critique. Critical thinking is merely a tool (albeit a crucial, valuable tool) one uses to identify, uproot, and prevent oppressive practices. Michael Newman (1994, 1999), an exemplar of the social responsibility approach to critical thinking, discusses critical social theory and the hope it offers:

> Critical theory is concerned with far more than analysis or logical thinking. It recognizes the influence of cultural values on people's reasoning and acting, and takes into account interaction, insight, feeling, intuition and other non-scientistic ways of knowing. Critical theory envisages forms of thinking in which people not only perceive the world more clearly but also perceive their perceptions of the world. (Newman, 1994, p. 44)

In order for social change to occur, however, people need to be critical thinkers. A critical thinker is one who takes responsibility for both words and actions, is open and clear about values, assumptions, and ideology. A critical thinker is not only critical in thought, but also in the necessary component of action (Newman, 1999). Newman's quote can be seen as a statement of the influence of critical social theory on Brookfield and Mezirow; the main difference between the two camps is scope. Brookfield and Mezirow focus largely on the individual, teaching skills that may help a person know more about herself and her culture. Hopefully, the ensuing awareness of self-situatedness in society will turn the individual away from looking inward to becoming more involved in the creation of her own life and culture. Newman (1994) dismisses this approach as entirely too conservative.

The line between critical thinking and critical theory becomes unclear, and sometimes Newman seems to treat them as identical concepts. However, on closer inspection, one can see that critical thinking and critical social theory are not identical. Critical thinking is a main tool that one must develop and use to enact social change. Remove the critical thinking tool and social change is no longer possible. Newman indicates clearly that one should think critically for a specific purpose, using that ability as necessary to fight oppression.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Airing the Issues

Broadly speaking, it seems to me that in much of the adult education literature the language of social responsibility is employed but the models used are individualistic versions of critical thinking. The authors seeking improvement primarily for the individual tend to treat critical thinking as an end in itself, with clearly identifiable goals, standards, and processes learners must use. The social change advocates treat critical thinking as a process one uses within a larger process of ideological critique. Critical thinking is emphasized but not dissected.

Brookfield and Mezirow, however, attempt to use critical social theory as a main theoretical source from which they construct their notions of critical thinking. In doing so, they remove critical thinking as a means to an end (social change) and make it into an end. When one removes critical thinking from the social change approach, one is redirected toward an individual change approach. It seems that Brookfield and Mezirow would like people to pursue social change, and hope that learners will voluntarily move from an individual to a social change model. The probability of such a move seems small. If a learner is comfortable with the individual change approach, what will cause her to desire social change? Mezirow (1991) states, in the tenth step of his transformation process, that the learner needs to reintegrate with her pre-transformation life. How does reintegration lead to social change? Reconstruction might lead to the desired change, but not reintegration.

It seems that the move from a social change approach to an individual change approach represents a case where authors use critical social theory while simultaneously ignoring the purpose for which Habermas and other critical social theorists envisioned critical thinking. Diverting critical thinking to an individual change model may in fact stunt the social change process. Once the learner has achieved personal change and growth, she will feel that she reached her goal. There is no impetus to critique and bring change to the larger social order. There is no impetus to work with others in achieving common visions or goals. Individuality is stressed at the expense of the greater social order.

Why, indeed, would adult education work so hard to find a place in the critical thinking movement? One possible reason is that critical thinking may address a problem that appears to obsess adult and other educators: power and control (see, for example, Apps, 1991; Cervero & Wilson, 1994; Merriam & Caffarella, 1999; Ruggiero, 1988; Askay, 1997). Authors on critical thinking are suggesting that if we think critically, we cannot be fooled, thus enabling us to choose our courses. This may be so. The word "control" seems to imply that not being fooled also means that we will have *courage* to act on our knowledge; take this a bit further and we see it is also assumed that we have the *desire* to act on our knowledge, and *faith* that we may in some way alter the balance of power to take the aforementioned actions. That is a lot of assuming to come from merely having a critical mindset.

I do not accept "control" as a good reason to practice critical thinking in adult education at any level. What types of control, to what extent a thinker may be in control, and limitations of critical thinking in this arena are not addressed. Greater awareness does open up the thinker's horizons and acceptance of new possibilities, but to what extent? Democracy is often mentioned as a reason to promote critical thinking. There are control issues in that term as well, but let's ignore them for now. Why is democracy best for everyone? How do we even know it's best when we (at least in the US and the UK) don't practice true democracy? I think it may be safer to say that critical thinking is an effort to stave off ignorance. In our information society, ignorance

is abhorrent and sometimes dangerous. Those who are not ignorant are less likely to accept glib slogans, catchy ads, and slick assurances.

Critical thinking in the broader sense has a distinct method, philosophy, and identity. Critical thinking in adult education is a hybrid, related to but not sporting all the necessary characteristics that makes thinking critical instead of ordinary. Further, adult education (as well as much of the rest of the critical thinking movement) assumes that rationality is the best way of thinking and knowing. We adopt criticality because we are of the centuries-old Western rational tradition. We have faith in it. Legitimacy is also an issue for our field: If you want someone to take you seriously, you use and teach reason – so therefore it seems likely that adult education has assimilated rationality to improve its image and acceptance. Rationality is frequently associated with the notion of objectivity – and raises the picture of a cold, detached academic studying life under a microscope. Adult education fosters a socially conscious, caring image, and therefore the traditional "academic persona" does not suit. To get around this problem we instead use "sense" to be critical in our vague, unstructured manner. Since our thinking is not disciplined, there is no need to examine its structure for strength and stability using a set of standards. It seems fairly clear that adult education courts but does not truly adopt historical criticality.

Brookfield (1993) states that he is not following traditional critical thinking paths. He is instead attempting to develop a method tailored to the needs and purposes of adult education. There is not a universal definition of critical thinking for adult education. While this is not of itself a problem, there does need to be a stronger sense of the nature and practice of critical thinking in adult education, that it is different from the larger tradition, and in what ways. Evaluating thinking is essential here because we have a new practice, and we need to know how well it works . . . or does not.

Teaching critical thinking in adult education is problematic. I find it difficult to believe that students can become truly critical thinkers if their teachers/professors are unaware of its nature and practice. Robert Sternberg (1985) points out problems with teaching critical thinking that I found completely plausible based on my experience as a graduate student in adult education. We are taught, for example, that many problems faced by adults in life are ill defined, located in a dynamic context and fraught with power relationships. We are taught less about how to structure the problems; how to identify worthwhile problems; and how to think critically (and constructively) in conjunction with other people. If, as Chaffee (as cited in Esterle & Clurman, 1993) suggests, there are other ways of thinking and knowing, should we not also become familiar with them as alternatives? Askay (1997) addresses this point when he points out that we "preserve the analytic perspective [by] our Western insistence upon a bifurcation between rationality and alternative ways of thinking. The first receives uncritical acclaim, while the latter is excluded, suspected, or extinguished."

Bearing these considerations in mind, consider how many authors cite Brookfield and Mezirow on a regular basis. Both are very influential in adult education. I suspect that many adult educators simply have not thought about critical thinking much beyond Brookfield's and Mezirow's work. Their scholarship, motives, and aims are frequently accepted without serious question. Critical thinking is, ironically, accepted without serious question. It is time to start asking ourselves better questions about how we think so we know why we think the way we do, its advantages and disadvantages.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Conclusion

In the case of graduate students, critical thinking will allow us to sort through the plethora of literature in adult education and identify that which is quality from the dusty chaff. Good critical thinking will enhance our scholarly efforts as well as our daily lives. Maybe, just maybe, we can use it to help improve the human condition. However, I think exposure to other thinking traditions (see Askay, 1997) would benefit scholars (and probably others). Promoting critical thinking without exploring alternatives is problematic. Adult educators need to shake off our collective complacency. In terms of critical thinking and even—dare I say it?—thought in general, adult education as a field needs to reflect, to cultivate awareness and then take appropriate, deliberate action to direct its course.

This last point will probably come as no surprise to most readers. My study demonstrates that confusion such as that which I described is justified. To initiates such as I the literature is confusing and confused. The term, the concept and the practice of critical thinking are an integral part of today's academe—what professor is going to knowingly take an uncritical position when teaching? What student will be applauded for writing or reading uncritically? However, critical thinking is being cast off from its theoretical moorings; if critical thinking is the academic equivalent to the rudder of a ship, we are quickly becoming lost in a sea of equivocation. If critical thinking is indispensable to the theory and practice of adult education—as most authors imply—a lot more attention needs to be paid to its theoretical underpinnings and the congruence between professed, implied and operational usage.

References

Apps, J. W. (1991). *Mastering the teaching of adults*. Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Askay, R. R. (1997). Beyond "critical thinking." *Journal of Thought, 32*(4), 23-36.

Boxler, H. (2001). *Quest for the Grail? Searching for critical thinking in adult education.* Unpublished master's thesis, The Pennsylvania State University, University Park.

Brookfield, S. (1987). *Developing critical thinkers: challenging adults to explore alternative ways of thinking and acting*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Brookfield, S. (1993). Breaking the code: Engaging practitioners in critical analysis of adult educational literature. *Studies in the Education of Adults, 25*(1), 64-91.

Cervero, R. M., & Wilson, A. L. (1994). *Planning responsibly for adult education: A guide to negotiating power and interests*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Cunningham, P. M. (1993). Let's get real: A critical look at the practice of adult education. *Journal of Adult Education, 22*(1), 3-15.

Esterle, J., & Clurman, D. (Eds.). (1993). *Conversations with critical thinkers*. San Francisco: The Whitman Institute.

Merriam, S. B., & Caffarella, R. S. (1999). *Learning in adulthood: A comprehensive guide*. (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformational dimensions of adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mezirow, J. (2000). Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformation theory. In J. Mezirow (Ed.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Newman, M. (1994). *Defining the enemy: Adult education in social action*. Sydney, Australia: Stewart Victor Publishing.

Newman, M. (1999). *Maeler's regard: Images of adult learning*. Sydney, Australia: Stewart Victor Publishing.

Paul, R. W. (1993). Critical thinking: Fundamental to education for a free society. In J. Willsen & A. J. A. Binker (Eds.), *Critical thinking: What every person needs to survive in a rapidly changing world* (3rd ed.). Santa Rosa, CA: Foundation for Critical Thinking.

Paul, R. W., & Willsen, J. (1993). Critical thinking: Identifying the targets. In J. Willsen & A. J. A. Binker (Eds.), *Critical thinking: What every person needs to survive in a rapidly changing world* (3rd ed.). Santa Rosa, CA: Foundation for Critical Thinking.

Ruggiero, V. R. (1988). *The art of thinking* (2nd ed.). New York: Harper & Row.

Sternberg, R. J. (1985). Teaching critical thinking, Part 1: Are we making critical mistakes? *Phi Delta Kappan, 67*, 194-198.

Heather M. Boxler, The Pennsylvania State University, 205 East Lamb Street, Bellefonte, PA 16823; hmp123@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Adult Education as Snake Oil Under The Guise of Democracy

Alison A. Carr-Chellman
Davin J. Carr-Chellman

Abstract: Based on initial content analysis research into the semiotics of advertising for online learning, this paper extends our understanding of the commodification of education via the web by carefully examining the implications of this marketing on the goals of democracy, the just distribution of education and knowledge as resources, and the consequent impact on social justice and equity.

Introduction

> Advertising manipulates symbols to create meaning and in our society, the values expressed in advertising mirror the dominant ideological themes. ...by circulating and recirculating certain myths advertising shapes our attitudes and beliefs, and that by learning how to critically deconstruct advertisements we can begin to move away from the role of spectator to become participants in the making and remaking of ourselves and a more democratic society . —Cornel West, 1990

Not many people would suggest that the online education movement actively excludes certain populations. In fact, there is much stronger evidence that most believe this will be the opening of the university gates to democratize access to higher learning. American politicians are happy to extol the virtues of technology and the promise of democracy as delivered through this "open access" medium. Al Gore (1998), in a speech to the 15th International Telecommunication Union (ITU) Conference, said, "We have a chance to extend knowledge and prosperity to our most isolated inner cities, to the barrios, the favelas, the colonias and our most remote rural villages; to bring 21st Century learning and communication to places that don't even have phone service today; . . . to strengthen democracy and freedom by putting it on-line" (p. 1). No one would *overtly* deny access to online learning, but the reality is that the doors are NOT open to all. There are many subtle ways this discrimination, which seems particularly predicated on class, takes hold. One of the most insidious is the fundamental messages being sent through advertisements for online learning programs. As Cunningham (1993) states, "If one listens carefully to the language, one hears the politics" (p. 13). Indeed, advertising is language of a very particular sort. We are concerned by the ways in which this new media may serve to commodify education—to make learning a "thing" which can be easily purchased. One of the main methods by which this commodification occurs is through the marketing of online learning programs. This is the sort of critical issue which we must address in order to more fully understand the online learning enterprise as an entire system and the ways in which this system serves to perpetuate hegemonies of class, race, and gender. Deconstructing the ads from a semiotic perspective, while illustrative, is insufficient. This analysis must also lead us to

understand the ways in which the online learning enterprise, as exemplified in these ads, panders to market forces which subsequently do damage to democratic ideals, the equitable distribution of knowledge and learning, and social justice as a movement. This paper is primarily intended to consider online learning, as exemplified in its advertising, as a fundamentally flawed enterprise that is contributing to inequities in American society.

Because online adult education is so clearly aligned with "learning for earning" (Cunningham, 1992, p. 180), we think that online education advertisements should carry a warning label, similar to that for cigarettes, alcohol, or Ginko Biloba, something like, "Neither the FDA nor the DOE have reviewed this degree program for its equity or fairness and no implied promises of a more democratic society are inherent in this program." Most of the conceptual and research work currently underway within distance education today has a decidedly pro-innovation bias (Hara & Kling, 1999), but a few critical works are beginning to emerge (Noble, 1998, 1999). This paper is a necessary contribution to the critiques of the online learning enterprise as it examines the underlying messages that are sent by online education marketers to potential students and the implications of those messages for social justice. We start by discussing the semiotics of the market-driven process of advertising. Turning our attention to a clear description of three sample ads, we analyze the ways in which these ads contribute to *covert* messages about who should and should not obtain, or purchase, the knowledge that is for sale; who is welcomed into the new online learning revolution and, more importantly, who is not. These covert messages aimed at adult learners exacerbate the unequal distribution of knowledge, social inequities and subsequently cause adult education, as exemplified in online learning, to fall out of alignment with the ideals of democracy.

Marketing Online Learning: Reach Out and Touch Someone

While online learning opportunities are proliferating at an ever accelerating rate, the marketing of online education programs and degrees remains relatively unresearched. From prior research (Carr-Chellman & Carr-Chellman, in press) the main messages have to do with assurances of ease, convenience, and personal, individual advancement. Nevertheless, the importance of brand sensitivity (Blumenstyk, 1999) and famous professors (Beer, 1999) should not be ignored (Beer, 1999). Advertisements are manipulative; there's nothing new about that. They are designed to make us feel a lack; we are to recognize, in the wake of viewing a particular advertisement, that our lives will be more complete, fulfilled and happy only if we purchase that particular product. Part of the psychology of manipulation in advertising and marketing is based on a notion of "bad faith." Coming from the existentialist tradition (Sartre 1966)), bad faith is a kind of self-deception whereby we want more than anything else to become something we are not or can not become or perhaps should not want to become. Marketing and advertising force us into daily battles against this bad faith: there is nothing inherently inadequate about my existence or yours but our market-obsessed culture convinces us otherwise. Therefore, the marketer doesn't sell you the product, but rather convinces you that you *need* the product . . . not necessarily because it, in itself possesses something of quality, but because your life will be better for the purchase. This is the essence of the snake oil analogy. Supposedly a good marketer can "sell anybody anything." It is our contention that this "sell anything" attitude has saturated what has come to be called web-based degree programs such that these degrees have lost touch with the substance of higher education. This is a process that, in the critical, Marxian tradition (Adorno & Horkheimer, 1997), has come to be called commodification.

This commodification is a by-product of the ideological nature of most advertising, a nature that imposes on an unwitting observer the self-interested desires of the *producer*. It is part of the function of this ideology to usurp the self-interest of consumers with the message of the ad. This seemingly impossible trick of the eye is successfully created, in most cases, by relatively complex imagery. The symbols of these images within advertisements create structures by which we can, in a logical fashion, unpack the apparent significance of its message. This unpacking will locate the ideology of the ad, effectively defusing what was once a powerful manipulative tool. There is nothing ambiguous about these signs/advertisements; it is assumed by the marketer that the signified meaning—ease, success, convenience, popularity, happiness—is clearly conveyed by these images. This signified meaning is what we have called ideology, i.e., the sign is not characterized by a definite meaning but by a plurality of meanings. Consequently, there is no clear and definite connection between the signifier and the signified. There is no necessary, actual, real connection between these elements of the sign. The marketer is producing an ideologically charged sign, hoping that the addressee will assume that there *is* a necessary connection between the signifier and the signified. The signifier is necessarily ambiguous, constituted by a multiplicity of meanings—its relationship to the referent is arbitrary and any attempt to make it otherwise is ideological. If an ad cannot persuade, if it cannot suck you into its ideological domain, its impotence on a rational level renders it ineffectual as a manipulative tool.

"What is arbitrary is the relation between this sign and the reality it names, in other words, the relation between the language symbol in its totality and the real outside which it symbolizes" (Kristeva, 1989, p. 16). It is this arbitrary aporia, this space or gap in meaning between the sign itself and the reality to which it refers, that permits manipulation on the part of an advertisement. Every advertisement has this ideological gap into which is stuffed whatever meaning a marketer determines will most effectively move merchandise. The key to "undressing the ad" is recognizing this gap. This recognition permits the text's inherent resistance to meaning—its ambiguity and multiplicity of meanings—to resurface, and subsequently defuse the persuasive power of a once effective ad.

Knowledge for Sale: Critiques of the Ads

For the purposes of the earlier work (Carr-Chellman & Carr-Chellman, in press), we examined more than 20 advertisements; 19 sets of promotional materials, and 35 related web sites from 35 distance education institutions including traditional universities, distance education specialty universities, and corporate education providers (a.k.a. corporate universities). We screened these ads and categorized them according to certain themes. We then conducted a semiotic analysis of these ads. This paper extends that analysis to look at the ads through a more critical lens—to examine the ways in which these ads specifically contribute to the unequitable distribution of knowledge and learning experiences—to understand how these ads undermine democratic ideals.

As a starting point for our analysis we looked at the literature in advertising content analysis (Kassarjian, 1977; Kolbe & Burnett, 1991). We found Frith's (1997) work on cultural meanings in advertising particularly useful. Cultural meanings rely on the assumed cultural background of the reader. This is perhaps the trickiest analysis of the advertisement because it relies on shared beliefs and common culture which may not always be assumed. In our case, the most important meaning to be uncovered was the

ideological meaning (Frith's cultural meaning), the meaning forced into the sign—the ad—by marketers, and we focused on understanding the implications of that meaning with a critical social justice perspective. Below we describe each ad and the ways in which it targets certain populations and contributes to hegemony.

Advertisement #1: Penn State's World Campus

This first ad, found in an engineering trade journal, highlights the traditional Penn State "Old Main" building which many alumni associate with Penn State's University Park (main) campus. In bold text, the word "Advance" is featured prominently in the center of the ad which emphasizes opportunities to become a leader in the engineering industry. A web address in bold is placed just above the Penn State crest and logo for world campus. The signified message of this ad is that if you buy a World Campus certificate program in Engineering, you will Advance with ease and convenience "without leaving home or work" with the blessings of the good name of Penn State as evidenced by the signifiers of Old Main and the Penn State crest. The use of these traditional university markers would tend to appeal primarily to those who may have considered a traditional university as a possibility for their futures but had perhaps been unable financially. The clean look and globe have a corporate underlying message, appealing particularly to working adults. Many of the other ads also had similar hallmarks, cups of coffee and expensive gold pocket watches seem to figure prominently for instance. These "classed" signifiers have the tendency to privilege a population that is interested in learning for earning and capable of paying for it. It does not in any way invite collective action on behalf of the learners, nor does it assist in any redistribution of knowledge or education to those who have not had access to this information before. This approach enhances the ability of certain populations to use online educational services while the very "least of my brethren" are left behind. It has been suggested that this approach may not be so good for those who *do* decide to buy the online learning product (Bowers 1998). For them, time is intensified, the single mother working diligently at 2:00 am is the epitome of anytime, anywhere learning for earning. The potential broader impact is increased division of haves and have nots where those who have some money attend online schools, those who have the most money attend face-to-face institutions and those with little or no money are left behind.

Advertisement #2: Worchester Polytechnic Institute

Our second ad is from the Worchester Polytechnic Institute. This is from the airline magazine, *Attaché*, furnished to patrons of US Airways. The most prominent feature of this advertisement is the half circle of five rendered students sitting at terminals around a half globe. In the background is what appears to be a drawing of a silicone computer chip. The learners are all identical, with no race, class, gender demarcations and none of them are looking at each other. Instead all appear focused on their computer terminals.

This advertisement creates an image in our minds of automatons. The concept of human capital is rife here. It is clear that this sort of advertisement certainly permits if not advocates a separateness of adult learners. There is no possibility of an organized group of student learners actively resisting "existing power and cultural relationships" (Cunningham, 1989, p. 42). The idea that there are even relationships at all in this image is a little difficult to discern, but, indeed, there *are* relationships. They are primarily relationships to human capital and the acceptance of the learner as mere extension of computer technology for the purposes of more "efficient and effective production" (Cunningham, 1992, p. 180). This ad encourages those who are interested

in solitary work; it invites those who are least interested in social connection and most interested in personal advancement. There is no collective here. Instead, the ad communicates a desire to "help adults technically to become distance learners, autodidacts, self-directed, and aware of learning how to learn" (Cunningham, 1989, p. 42). In fact, the ad would probably appeal even more to a company manager interested in investing in human capital than it might to an individual adult learner. In our view, this sort of advertisement is the epitome of what Cunningham (1989) calls the "limit[ing] of the vision and promise of adult education" (p. 42) because it precisely eliminates those who are working with lower class adults with a goal of resistance. There is no resistance, or even anyone who would be considered terribly low class in this advertisement. Everyone in this ad has a computer, a comfortable connection to the globe, along with the ability to pay for a "high-tech MBA [earned] anywhere in the world."

Advertisement #3: Colorado State University

Our third ad is really a pair of very similar ads from Colorado State University (CSU). In the first case, at the top of the ad is a picture of a relatively expensive outdoorsman's tent pitched in the countryside with a backpack and a walking stick lying beside the tent. The black text, "Earn your Master's in Electrical Engineering here," is paired with a pointer indicating the inside of the tent. The text in white box below this picture indicates that you can "earn our Master's anywhere," followed by the CSU name in bold and prominent text. The second ad from CSU is similar in nature, with a picture at the top of a white man in a suit and tie sitting on a fancy, wrought iron park bench surrounded by leaves, a clean park, and one large tree trunk. The white text, "Earn your Master's in Computer Science here" is paired with a pointer to the man's laptop.

Both of these advertisements seem to appeal primarily to upper and middle class white men. Camping, a traditionally a white male activity, is depicted in this ad as a solo experience (as evidenced by the backpack and walking stick)—much like the solo experience of online learning. The park bench clearly pictures a white man with very nice clothes and a laptop in a clean park setting. All are images of privilege rather than images of resistance. If we were to take this image and re-cast it to show the irony of the advertisement, we could replace the pictures of parks and fields with homeless shelters and welfare lines. Imagine then the text, "Earn your master's in computer science here," with an arrow pointing to the homeless man lying in the streets of the District of Columbia. Somehow it doesn't quite add up; the ad no longer "works." From a semiotic perspective that's because the lack is no longer there, we don't *want* to be like "those" people, so we resist any temptation to "buy" that education because we might end up homeless or on welfare. No indeed, these ads must promise bright futures, wealth and advancement in order to work their magic properly.

Conclusion

What are the implications of these ads for adult education? Our hope is that this paper may serve as an early indictment of institutionalized web-based education as it is complicit in the necessarily hegemonic nature of market economies. Since one of the authors of this paper is an instructional technology faculty, this critique comes from a stance of self-examination. Our indictment, however, reaches beyond merely identifying the ways in which ads manipulate their readers, to the more disturbing ways in which certain populations are excluded. Our concern is not just for the advertisements but for the enterprise to which these ads are attached. Elsewhere we have discussed the mismatch between the rhetoric of political calls for democratic opening of

the university gates through expenditures for online learning infrastructure and the realities of who is truly gaining access to that learning (Carr-Chellman, 2000). This critical analysis of the ads merely illuminates the ways in which certain populations, the homeless, the poor, those of minority background, are excluded. The entire movement of online learning privileges some and excludes others. Specifically, working middle class and upper middle class are invited into the online learning revolution, but poor, homeless and minorities--anyone who most needs it, but is least able to afford it, is eliminated. Why? Well, to the extent that adult education serves as the "hand-maiden of industry" (Cunningham, 1992, p. 181), it is reasonable that only clean, intelligent, relatively well-off human capital is being courted for admission into the online learning world.

What Cunningham advocates most is the engagement of adults in their own empowerment, the active resistance to a reduction of adult education to training human capital. In the model of adult education currently represented by the online learning revolution, this is nearly impossible and there are no significant models of online learning that *have* empowered learners toward social justice in any way. We cannot ignite our learners into social action which will lead to significant learning because online learning is an opiate appeasing the masses and promising brighter futures, advancement, achievement of all goals with no pain or discomfort. This promise is much more appealing to the masses and much more appeasing as well. It is a very difficult thing to overcome these messages with the cry of "learn what holds you down; understand your captors so you can open the prison bars." Even those who are left out of the advertisements for online learning are more interested in the snake oil promise of online learning for earning than they are in active, difficult, exhausting resistance. But without that resistance, the hegemony is never broken, educational schemes from testing and assessment to online training can come and go and the class, race, and gender inequities will remain unless, and until, we find a way to uncover the snake oil sellers, and instead weave resistance into the fabric of adult learning.

References

Adorno, T, & Horkheimer, M. (1997). *Dialectic of enlightenment*. New York: Continuum.

Beer, M. (1999, May 16). Feeding hungry minds. *San Francisco Examiner*, p. A2.

Blumenstyk, G. (1999). A Company Pays Top Universities to Use Their Names and Their Professors. The Chronicle of Higher Education. June 18, 1999.

Bowers, C.A. (1998, Spring). The paradox of technology: What's gained and lost? *Thought & Action*, 49-57.

Carr-Chellman, A. A. (2000). Web-based education in US culture. *Information, Communication, and Society Journal, 3*, 326-336.

Carr-Chellman, A. A., & Carr-Chellman, D. J. (in press). Mr. Jones' E-Z Elixir: Marketing higher education on the web. In Gary Anglin (Ed.) *Critical issues in instructional technology*. Westport, CT: Libraries Unlimited.

Cunningham, P. M. (1989). Making a more significant impact on society. In B. A. Quigley (Ed.), *Fulfilling the promise of adult and continuing education* (pp. 33-45). San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.

Cunningham, P. M. (1992). From Friere to feminism: The North American experience with critical pedagogy. *Adult Education Quarterly, 42*, 180-191.

Cunningham, P. M. (1993, September/October). The politic of worker's education: Preparing workers to sleep with the enemy. *Adult Learning*, 13-14, 24.

Frith, J. K. (1997). *Undressing the ad*. New York: Peter Lang.

Gore, A. (1998, October). *Remarks Prepared for Vice President Al Gore*. Presented to the15th International Telecommunication Union Conference, Minneapolis, Minnesota. Retrieved February 28, 2001, from http://www.techlawjournal.com/internet/81012.htm

Hara, N., & Kling, R. (1999). *Students' frustrations with a web-based distance education course: A taboo topic in the discourse*. Retrieved February 28, 2001, from http://php.indiana.edu/~hara/

Kassarjian, H. H. (1977). Content analysis in consumer research. *Journal of Consumer Research, 4*, 8-18.

Kolbe, R. H., & Burnett, M. S. (1991). Content-analysis research: An examination of applications with directives for improving research reliability and objectivity. *Journal of Consumer Research, 18*, 243-250.

Kristeva, J. (1989). *Language: The unknown*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Noble, D. F. (1998, Spring). Selling academe to the technology industry. *Thought and Action*, 29-40.

Noble, D. F. (1999). *Digital diploma mills, Part IV: Rehearsal for the revolution*. Retrieved February 28, 2001, from http://communication.ucsd.edu/dl/ddm4.html

Sartre, J.-P. (1966). *Being and nothingness*. New York: Washington Square Press.

Alison A. Carr-Chellman is Associate Professor-In-Charge, Instructional Systems, The Pennsylvania State University, 307 Keller Bldg., University Park, PA 16802; aac3@psu.edu

Davin J. Carr-Chellman is Director, United Campus Ministry, and Doctoral Student in Adult Education, The Pennsylvania State University 315 Keller Bldg., University Park, PA 16802; djc194@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

The Production of Knowledge in Work Teams: The View from Below

Sharon L. Howell

Abstract: This paper examines the experiences of entry level hourly wage workers in a workplace shaped by the "excellence" movement. Their micro-level encounters with the "new work order" are set within the macro-level economic, political and cultural context that structures the work experience.

Purpose of the Study

A rapidly growing body of theoretical and empirical literature on workplace learning presents the top-down perspective of upper management with the value of learning measured by bottom-line profitability (Bierema, 1997; DiBella & Nevis, 1998; Easterby-Smith, Burgoyne, & Araujo, 1999; Marquardt, 1996; Watkins & Marsick, 1993, 1996). This study makes a contribution to the literature on workplace learning as experienced from below, from the perspective of entry-level hourly wage workers. Providing the opportunity to discover how workers as learners interact within an organizational context framed by the "excellence" movement in management, this paper examines one perspective of how the social, economic and political context impacts and is impacted by these workers as learners. Previous research has contributed to an understanding of the political and power dynamics within a culture of teamwork (Barker, 1999; Brooks, 1994, 1995). This study sought to move beyond a focus on individuals to examine the structures and culture of informal learning within a specific functional work-based team. Specifically, the study asked: What meaning do members of the work team make of the discourse on "excellence" and how does this discourse reflect issues of hegemony, power and control? How do these constructed meanings affect their understanding of learning and the production of knowledge in the workplace? What do team members see as the objectives of their participation both as individuals and for the organization? How would a critical understanding of workplace practice enable workers to participate in creating a more democratic workplace? This research is part of on-going research to develop a deeper understanding of the values, thinking, character, background and motivations of the workers as well as the underlying assumptions that influence how we see the world. According to Newman (1995), if "we can learn to see through ourselves, . . . [we] may be enabled to better understand and see through others as well" (p. 254).

Situating the Study

The study was influenced by the literature on how the "excellence" movement and learning discourses shape the world of work (Cunningham, 1993, 1998; Darrah, 1996; Foley, 1999; Graham, 1995; Kincheloe, 1999; Orr, 1996). This literature situates "excellence" and learning in the workplace within the broader socio-economic context of what Gee, Hull, and Lankshear (1996) refer to as the "new work order." The micro-level themes emerging from this literature include the production of knowledge and the centrality of learning, issues related to

empowerment and participation, as well as work intensification and multitasking. These studies on workplace change broaden the discussion to the macro-level demands of the global marketplace, making visible the corporate culture of the free market. The hypercompetition of the global marketplace drives the ideology of corporate libertarianism that drives the economic and political activity impacting the interactions of workers (Foley, 1999; Garrick, 1998; Newman, 1994). This research is situated in a work based team environment, in a particular place, at a particular time in history examining how the discourse on "excellence" is "*reproduced*" within their administrative work unit set within the larger organization.

Making use of "the situation-at-hand," the selection of this administrative unit, Customer Support Services, within this particular institution, Scrivener State, "takes advantage of existing circumstances which are relevant to a particular topic of study . . . [providing] for the use of personal, grounded experiences as a source of data and method of interpretation" (Cook & Fonow, 1986, pp. 20-21). This research setting provided the opportunity to study the complexities of the structures and culture created by quality management initiatives, techniques and tools in a particular workplace set within the context of the larger social system. Examining the work experiences of former members of the Processing Team in Customer Support Services, the research focused on the various forms of learning taking place within the context of a continually changing work environment. Quality management had been a part of the organizational environment since 1992. Within this context, Customer Support Services embraced process improvement, "participation" and "empowerment" for all workers in an on-going search for better ways to serve customers and to reduce manual work. The three former entry-level hourly wage workers who participated in this study had been members of the Processing Team, one of six functional teams within Customer Support Services. In 1994 the team had eleven members. By the fall of 1998 the team had nine team members, a reduction of 18 percent. After a period of relative stability four of the nine member team had been a part of the team for less than a year. Both entry-level hourly wage workers and salaried wage workers were questioning the evolving complexity and increased workloads: Why had all of the improvements over the years not lessened their workload or made the workplace less stressful? Why were workers expected to take on more and more work, serving increasing numbers of customers as well as handling more discrete tasks? Why were positions not being filled when the volume of work was increasing?

Throughout this study, I was researching my own evolving understanding of the kinds of learning taking place, asking what should "participation" and "empowerment" look like for critical learning to take place? What did informal learning look like? What types of workplace practices might lead to a more democratic workplace? This study set out to add to and enhance my understanding of how and what we as work team members learned as a part of a functional work based team operating within a quality management work environment. The perspectives of the three entry-level hourly wage workers were expected to enhance my understanding of the impact of these initiatives on our lives, both at work and outside of work. Thus, this study set out to ask what kinds of learning best serve human emancipation and how can we, as workers, construct the types of learning experiences to help us move collectively beyond being viewed only as "human resources" serving larger institutional values and goals.

Research Design

Informed by critical theory, this study incorporates concepts from critical ethnography and critical action research as well as issues related to theories of power as enacted through ideology, hegemony and discursive practices. Since this study moves beyond understanding the technical implementation of quality management techniques to examine how economic, social and political structures are used to establish and sustain the shared meanings, beliefs and behaviors of the organization. Meaning depends on issues of power, what questions are asked, what is hidden from observation, whose interests are served and whose meaning prevails (Kincheloe, 1995).

Multiple sources of information were used to provide an in-depth understanding of the complex process of informal learning and the production of knowledge within the Processing Team. Data sources included field notes, reflective journals and a series of three semi-structured interviews with three former work team members. Additional information was provided by document analysis of various HRD course materials, strategic plans, e-mails, memos, and policy statements. Throughout the process of coding and analysis, an iterative process of identifying common themes and patterns of interaction and then rereading the original interviews and journals to connect the micro-level stories of the entry-level hourly wage workers to the macro-level systems, structures and cultural themes was followed (Carspecken, 1996; Seidman, 1998).

As an insider, a team leader and worker, I am an actor / researcher within this workplace (Kincheloe, 1991). The dual role of worker and researcher in the workplace is based on the idea that "knowledge for [working] is 'inside/outside,' a juxtaposition intended to call attention to [workers] as knowers and to the complex and distinctly nonlinear relationships of knowledge and [working] as they are embedded in the contexts and the relations of power that structure the daily work." (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 1993, p. xi). I hold an insider's view as an actor in the day-to-day activities of this administrative unit, serving in leadership and worker roles on several standing teams as well as on teams formed to examine special issues. As an actor in the daily work processes, my observations and reflections informed the context of this research.

Findings

Three themes emerged from the study. (a) The stress discourse was used as a mechanism to control how workers understood their work experiences, turning inward on the individual. (b) Training courses and programs dealing with customer satisfaction prepared workers to "put on masks" in order to perform their tasks. In other words, they were asked, and in some cases forced, to be someone they were not or did not want to be. (c) Empowerment often had contradictory meanings for the workers. Workers became active participants in process improvement, however, as they took on more and more responsibility they began to question whether their interests matched the interests of the organization. The study discussed the ways workers struggled to gain some control of their work. These struggles took many forms including resistance to the use of technology, increasing tension between salaried and hourly-wage workers, largely - though not exclusively - based on social class differences, and increasing resistance to participatory programs that often resulted in increased expectations through use of multitasking. This section focuses on the stress discourse as a mechanism to control how workers understand their work experiences. Reinforced by the popular discourse on stress as an individual problem, organizational HRD courses and employee assistance programs (EAP) were

used to emphasize worker responsibility to adapt and assimilate organizational values as well as to shape the way workers were expected to act and behave while at work.

Customer Support Services provided multiple opportunities to help workers deal with the stressful office environment. For example, during preparation for the start of each enrollment period, a time of even greater work intensification, job tasks piled up. Customers often expressed anger if they were unable to get through on the phones or experienced delays in the reception area. With a downsized workforce, the balance between direct customer contact and the processing of their paperwork created increased levels of tension. As one worker stated:

> The workload was stressful even though you're told don't let that big pile of a hundred pieces worry you. It's in your box. That's okay. But every time you see it out of the corner of your eye, your pulse rate increases and your heart just starts pounding. That's stressful. Because you know you just want to get it done. They want me to get it done. It's not that they were coming down on us. It's just that constant reminder sitting in your box that you know needs to be done.

In 1999, for the first time, there was recognition of the high level of stress. A general training and update session opened with relaxation exercises suitable to do at the desk. Then to welcome back an employee who had been off while recuperating from a mild heart attack, a description was read of a new "CardioPlex computer" with a variety of "hardware" and "software" to ease work related stress. "Software" products on this "high-tech computer" included Bulls-Eye—a stress free decision making tool—darts, Fitness Assessment and Workout Manager, Fit for Life diet planner, Defib 98 and Electrode Pak for delivery of a jolt of electricity at a click of the mouse, and "ESC" providing a direct Internet link to 911 services. While recognizing a very busy and tense work environment, it reinforced the construction of stress as an individual responsibility to handle. Later that week I observed a supervisor trying to calm down a frustrated entry-level hourly wage worker by suggesting that she take several deep breaths, demonstrating the appropriate deep breathing technique. These coping techniques only dealt with the effects of workplace stress, not the deeper underlying causes.

The organization provided multiple opportunities to *learn how to deal more effectively* with stress. Formal HRD courses contributed to the individually focused understanding of stress, providing a wide range of "well-being" course offerings free or at nominal charge to help workers deal with commonly identified sources of stress both at work and at home. Course offerings included *nutrition*—healthy eating for self and family; *exercise*—organized and self-directed; *relaxation*—Yoga, Tai Chi, QiGong ; and *stress management*—coping strategies, reducing worry, and interpretations of stress. Workers had opportunities to learn how to deal with stress by learning "to think and move joyfully, . . . to laugh at yourself, . . . to see humor in stressful situations." Coping strategies consist of learning "[to] take time for you" and "erasing unpleasant thoughts more effectively." An announcement for stress reduction groups on a bulletin board in the break room was "designed to help members feel more in control of their lives. . . [including] relaxation training, exploration of negative attitudes and imagery work to help develop positive coping strategies."

Professional organizations also contribute to the mainstream discourse on stress. A professional development seminar at a professional conference attended by several workers focused on issues of health, self-esteem, and attitude. The instructor provided self-administered stress level surveys and a fast paced, often humorous, dialogue suggesting that reducing stress

would result in a healthier and happier work experience. She suggested taking control for one's life and taking time for one's self. Stress was portrayed as not only potentially destructive, but also as a good motivator. According to this adult educator, the right balance of stress was necessary to a productive working and personal life. The message, individuals cause their stress and are therefore responsible for controlling their own stress.

Conclusions and Implications

The stress discourse that permeates the workplace with the intent to mold and control the attitudes, behaviors and actions of workers follows the popular discourse that is present in society and within the "excellence" movement, in both private and public sectors as well as in academic research. Without question, the emotional and physical health of workers is important. However, this discourse stops short of taking a deeper, more critical look at what is actually happening at work. The focus on individual responsibility to become "stress-fit" matches the individualism of society at large. The stress discourse of the 1990s is narrowly focused on a decontextualized and apolitical account of stress. The social and the political remain on the periphery with the social reduced to the biological. The narrow construction of stress provides a superficial understanding of work. Stress management techniques provide mechanisms that support, encourage and require self-control, a subtle, hidden form of control. The good worker is one who is fit both mentally and physically. The stress-fit worker not only has the ability to handle the high pressure of a fast moving work environment, she actively engages with this discourse to give herself completely to the organization (Newton, 1995). The stress discourse normalizes change with stress-fit workers able to cope. The workers, not the environmental changes, become the problem. There is a shift from the individual as a social being to the individual as a productive body (Townley, 1994). The social, economic and political environments within which work takes place remain on the periphery with issues related to societal change and the changing environment of work largely ignored.

Based on the findings in this study, workers understand the uses and meanings behind many of the workplace practices that are used as mechanisms of control. However, their understanding is based on the effects of these management practices as workers have experienced them rather than having an understanding of the underlying causes. To move beyond this narrow understanding of work as defined and accepted within corporate capitalism to a deeper understanding of the assumptions that would allow for emancipatory learning and workplace democracy, adult educators need to become researchers of their own workplaces and their own involvement in this work. It is important that research go beyond the narrow confines of the workplace, taking into account the broader social, political and economic context.

References

Barker, J. R. (1999). *The discipline of teamwork: Participation and concertive control.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Bierema, L. (1997). Learning organizations: Evaluating learning and results. *Proceedings of the 27th Annual SCUTREA Conference* (pp. 35-39). Egham, England: Royal Holloway College.

Brooks, A. K. (1994). Power and the production of knowledge: Collective team learning in work organizations. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 5*, 213-235.

Brooks, A. K. (1995). The myth of self-directed work teams and the ineffectiveness of team effectiveness training: n argument with special reference to teams that produce knowledge. *Proceedings of the 36th Annual Adult Education Research Conference* (pp. 41-47). Edmonton: University of Alberta.

Carspecken, P. F. (1996). *Critical ethnography in educational research: A theoretical and practical guide.* New York: Routledge.

Cochran-Smith, M, & Lytle, S. L. (1993). *Inside/Outside: Teacher research and knowledge.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Cook, J. A., & Fonow, M. M. (1986). Knowledge and women's interests: Issues of epistemology and methodology in feminist sociological research. *Sociological Inquiry, 56*(1), 2-29.

Cunningham, P. (1993). The politic of worker's education: Preparing workers to sleep with the enemy. *Adult Learning, 5*(1), 13-14, 24.

Cunningham, P. M. (1998). The social dimension of transformative learning. *PAACE Journal of Lifelong Learning, 7*, 15-28.

Darrah, C. N. (1996). *Learning and work: An exploration in industrial ethnography.* New York: Garland Publishing.

DiBella, A. J., & Nevis, E. C. (1998). *How organizations learn: An integrated strategy for building learning capability.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Easterby-Smith, M., Burgoyne, J., & Araujo, L. (Eds.). (1999). *Organizational learning and the learning organization: Developments in theory and practice.* London: Sage.

Foley, G. (1999). *Learning in social action: A contribution to understanding informal education.* London: Zed Books.

Garrick, J. (1998). *Informal learning in the workplace: Unmasking human resource development.* London: Routledge.

Gee, J. P., Hull, G., & Lankshear, C. (1996). *The new work order: Behind the language of the new capitalism.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Graham, L. (1995). *On the line at Subaru-Isuzu: The Japanese model and the American worker.* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Kincheloe, J. L. (1991). *Teachers as researchers: Qualitative inquiry as a path to empowerment.* London: The Falmer Press.

Kincheloe, J. L. (1995). Meet me behind the curtain: The struggle for a critical postmodern action research. In P. L. McLaren & J. M. Giarelli (Eds.), *Critical theory and education research* (pp. 71-90). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Kincheloe, J. L. (1999). *How do we tell the workers? The socioeconomic foundations of work and vocational education.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Marquardt, M. J. (1996). *Building the learning organization: A systems approach to quantum improvement and global success.* New York: McGraw Hill.

Newman, M. (1994). *Defining the enemy: Adult education in social action.* Sydney, Australia: Stewart Victor Publishing.

Newman, M. (1995). Adult education and social action. In G. Foley (Ed.), *Understanding adult education and training* (pp. 246-260). St. Leonards, Australia: Allen & Unwin.

Newton, T. (1995). *Managing stress: Emotion and power at work.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Orr, J. E. (1996). *Talking about machines: An ethnography of a modern job.* Ithaca, NY: ILR Press.

Seidman, I. (1998). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Townley, B. (1994). *Reframing human resource management: Power, ethics and the subject at work.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Watkins, K. E., & Marsick, V. J. (1993). *Sculpting the learning organization: Lessons in the art and science of systemic change.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Watkins, K. E., & Marsick, V. J. (Eds.). (1996). *In Action: Creating the learning organization. Vol. 1: Twenty-two case studies from the real world of training.* Alexandria, VA: American Society for Training and Development.

Sharon L. Howell received her doctorate in adult education from The Pennsylvania State University, where she is a Director in the Office of Student Aid. Contact: slh2@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Life since Then: Reconstructing Korean Women's Educational Experiences and Their Lives

Kyungmi Hyun

Abstract: This study examines Korean women's educational experiences during the Japanese colonial period in Korea (1910-1945). The primary research approach is discourse analysis of the language used in interview data and written documents. This study argues that women's education in the early 20th century served to justify women's inferior social status to men and thus to maintain the dominant ideology of the colonial and patriarchal society.

The purpose of this study is to examine the experiences of Korean women in relation to women's education during the Japanese colonial period in Korea (1910-1945). The initial question motivating this research was: How is it that a human being becomes a woman through the educational process? In order to begin to answer this question, the researcher interviewed five women who were the original attendees of Kyungsung Public Girls' School from 1924 to 1932. At the time of the interview, these women were all well into their 80s and 90s. Written documents were also analyzed to supplement and enhance the perspectives of the interviewees. These documents include newspaper editorials and popular magazines of the era, and reports by Japanese officials with regard to the education of women in Korea.

Historical Background

During the last century, Korean social systems underwent many changes: from a monarchy to a republic, from a hereditary hierarchy system to one of more or less equal social status, and from feudalism to capitalism. However, there is one dominant system that has still prevailed and that has not eroded over time. That system is the patriarchal system which assumes the predominance of men over women. The patriarchal system has made Korean people value traditional female virtues of being a good daughter, a good wife, and a good mother. Education under this patriarchal value system seems to function as an important mechanism to produce a 'virtuous' woman and thus to maintain the Korean patriarchal system.

Before the establishment of the first public girls' school in Korea in 1908, women's education was conducted at home and focused predominantly on female morality and attitudes and on household skills. The early education offered by the girls' schools provided two levels of primary and secondary education and took a form that actually did not differentiate between adult and child education. Under the social structures of Japanese colonialism and Korea's traditional patriarchal system, women's education in Korea developed and institutionalized, with a focus on young girls rather than on adults.

This paper examines the discourse produced by the interviewees in the form of extended narratives. In these narratives, the speakers recount their experiences as members of a privileged minority of women – privileged because educational opportunity for females was extremely limited at the time.

Research Design

This study is based primarily on the interview data collected from the five Korean women who attended the first and only public girls' school in Seoul in the 1920s and 1930s. This study focuses on an in-depth analysis of the language used in both the oral and written data (Brown & Yule, 1983; Chafe, 1994; Schiffrin, 1994). Through a discourse analytic approach, the researcher examines patterns in linguistic use that underscore the attitudes and perspectives of the various participants involved in women's education at the time. The entire database contains exceptionally precious historical and personal information that becomes all the more powerful through a systematic macro- and micro-level examination.

Findings

The data used in this paper reveal not only that women's education in Korea has never been politically neutral, but also that it has been, and perhaps still is, essentially for the benefit of men. While the school as a new learning place may have looked entirely different from the home as the traditional learning place, the values and attitudes that the school actually emphasized for the girls were identical to those that were traditionally emphasized at home. These values reflect the dominant ideology of the Korean patriarchal system. In examining the narrative data, it becomes immediately clear that the values taught at school served to maintain the male dominant social order, thus sustaining the oppressed status of females.

An examination of the data from popular media also reveals that the educational movement to provide equal opportunity for females in Korea is simply a move to perpetuate and even strengthen the already conventionalized patriarchal system. The following example excerpted from the *Toklipshinmun* (a newspaper for the popular Enlightenment Movement) will illustrate:

> **If the government builds a school for boys, it should build another for girls** [emphases add throughout]. Therefore, we want the government to enforce the same law **regardless of gender**, age, and social and economic status. *Boys will grow up to be government officials, merchants, and farmers and girls will grow up to be their wives. Therefore, if a wife has as much learning and knowledge as her husband, the home will be fine* and if a wife has children, she will know how to raise her children and teach them so that the children will be good and will be educated well in the hands of their mother before they go to school. **Women's work is therefore no less important than men's work**; rather women's work has the importance of bringing the posterity of the nation. **How we can look down on women as less than men and treat them unequally in education?** ("Editorial," 1896, p. 2; my translation)

Here the logic appears to be that boys and girls should receive equal treatment with respect to educational concerns (relevant passages marked in bold). However, underlying the argument for equal education is actually a masked attempt to further enhance, support, and serve the men (relevant passages in italics).

Against a backdrop of this type of male dominance, the Japanese also targeted women's education as an important social issue. However, in the case of Japan, education of Korean

women was considered as a means to better control and manipulate the Korean population in general. The following excerpt from a Japanese official will provide an example and show just to what degree Japan used women's education as an insidious means of control.

> **Korean girls' education is as important as boys' education** [emphases add throughout]. Economic fusion and social fusion are the root and stem of colonial policies, and out of the two, the latter, that is social fusion, is much more difficult. However, if successful, it becomes a stronger cement that consolidates the root and stem of the society. **For this, the short cut begins by *influencing* women. . . . It is obvious that women who are emotional but less egocentric and self-conscious are more easily *influenced* than men. It is also true that once *influenced*, it is difficult to repair. And also if women are *influenced*, then men are automatically *influenced***. Thus if we do not touch the far bottom of the bottom in this way, the basis of ruling will not be solid. ***Eroding* the Korean home means *eroding* the entire society.** This way, emotional fusion will be permanently achieved. Therefore, if possible, Japanese women must be hired as teachers, and we must make them go into Korean homes and try to *erode* them permanently. Therefore, I believe that women's education has an important implication. (Hara, as cited in Hyun, 1998. p. 42; my translation)

For Japanese imperialism women's education is a means to suppress Korean power. Women's education was considered an important means of influencing women, eroding the home, and dominating the entire society. Here women are only the target to influence the new dominant values and maintain the patriarchal social system. The purpose of education is only found in the connection of the two verbs of "influence" and "erode" (the verb, "influence," is used four times and the verb, "erode," three times). Thus, education falls totally into the major means for the dominance of a certain group over other groups

The pervasive patriarchal values can be found even in the motivation of women to go to school. The narratives of Sunhee Jung illustrate this:

> I married my husband when he was 16, a junior in secondary school. My husband left Korea to study at Waseda university, in Tokyo, when he was a senior, without finishing the secondary school. One day, I happened to look at his work on his desk, such as his drawings and study materials. **I'm so surprised at the *tremendous difference* from my level. I only graduated from a four-year-course elementary school. *Tremendous difference*. How can I, with my discretion, support him as a wife? In order not to be estranged** [emphases add throughout]. If estranged as a spouse, second wife, first wife, hisasigami (modern hairstyle influenced from Japan), chignon (Korean traditional hairstyle of a married woman), at that time. That idea might have come to my mind, even though I was young. **So I said to my father-in-law, "I want to go to school."** So I started my study again. (Narratives of Sunhee Jung; my translation)

On a macro level, we can see that the impetus in Jung's life to return to school was her sudden realization of her own insecurity which arose from the sharp differences in the education level between her husband and herself ("tremendous difference," uttered two times in two contiguous sentences). On a micro level, in her narrative about her past experience, Jung's consciousness shifts freely from past to present and past again. This shifting stream of

consciousness is deeply related to such emotional aspects as surprise or panic. These emotional moments are expressed by the present tense (as in "I'm so surprised" and "How can I . . . support?") while factual information is expressed by the past tense marking (as in "I only graduated"). In the original Korean Jung uses a variety of markers which enhance the strong interrelationship between present tense marking and heightened affective involvement.

Clearly, the gender relations between Jung and her husband were not balanced or equal. The right to make decisions at any level was in the hands of her husband. Through her language, she seems to have been very passive about this unequal relationship and silently accepted the Korean custom that enabled men to marry again without divorcing the first wife; she was afraid of that potential possibility. While women may have been able to attend to school as a result of the educational reform, the choice seems to have been primarily motivated and justified by the desire to maintain and improve their relationships with men.

Another major learning place for women was home. At home practical teaching of female skills and mentality for girls were emphasized. The following excerpt from Jung's narratives illustrates this:

> Ha::haha, "**Girls of marital age going around any other place other than school, that's not good**" [emphases add throughout]. My grandma drove my friends away. But then I **couldn't move** an inch. I couldn't come out of my house. And at home, the kitchen, the place for cooking and the place for seamstress where they are sewing. In the sewing room, I was collecting the colorful pieces of cloth. And in the kitchen, if they cook, I said, "**Me, too**," huh, "**Me, me**." So **I, too**, tasted and watched what they did. **That was the major work, so, even if I got married at fifteen**, I did needlework for the marriage. I was told that I was treating well with so many family members. Since I was so little, so much training I received, because they were afraid of my being expelled and going back, due to not doing the housework well. umh **"*You*, if being expelled and coming back, *will be killed* with a cup of poison," they said. So, "if I go back because of the toughness of life, *I* must be ready to *die*."** Whether you like or not, once you get married, you must stay in the marital home until you die. Without that, you can't go. That's it. Under that rule, ***we* have been living**. (Narratives of Sunhee Jung; my translation)

Socially acceptable women appear to be made through systematic and long term training, although informally. Home was a very important place to reproduce these women. The judgmental message of Jung's grandmother regarding the girls' attitudes denotes highly valued expectation for Korean girls at the time. Jung's grandmother as a successor of the social norms provides judgment for the 'good' or 'not good', confining or limiting Jung's possible experience (The Korean prefix, "an (not)" as in "anjota (not good)" is used to express the opposition to "jota (good)"). These norms follow the possible range of Jung's acts (the Korean prefix, "mot-(unable)" as in "mothuda" (can't) is used here to provide the meaning of being unable or not possible.) Thus, the judgment of being good or bad set the possible range of behaviors. This direct quote is emphasized by the use of the pronoun, "that", which not only repeats but also emphasizes the previous phrase, "girls of marital age going around any other place other than school" as a condensed form.

While Korean girls learned the household skills such as cooking and sewing by following other women (as seen in the repetition of "me too" or "me, me"), the skills were also taught

together with mental training. These skills were considered important and closely related to prepare for future marital life of women and thus the importance of skills were imbued as a key to make a happy living. At the end of this excerpt, Jung's internal thought is shown. Here, the shifts of verbs (come → go; kill → die) as well as the change of subjects (you → I) denote how women can internalize the ideology that tightly connects the skills and female mentality. The interviewee ends her narratives in this excerpt by generalizing her situation into Korean women at the era with the use of the subject, "we" ("Under that rule, we have been living").

Traditional values for women taught at home were also emphasized at school. Under the Japanese imperialism, Japanese manners were taught as important feminine attitudes by Japanese female teachers. The following excerpt will illustrate:

> **We learned Japanese manners such as walking along the floor on our knees. We learned totally Japanese manners at school**. . . . **We used what we learned** [emphasis added]. . . . How to place an ashtray, and how to drink Japanese tea. (Narratives of Dongsook Shim; my translation)

The female virtues that support the patriarchal system provide specific 'feminine attitudes.' Under the Japanese occupation, Japanese 'feminine' attitudes were taught regularly by Japanese teachers. The interviewees tell that they did not resist these attitudes because the behavior looked 'more feminine' and well educated. The specific historical and political situation of Korean society conducted a defining role of how women should be through selecting and allowing some experiences. By doing what they learned, women internalized the social values in their lives.

Educated women in the early 20th century were called 'new women.' While the educational opportunity for these new women was very limited, the opportunity to study in a higher-grade school or to get a job was extremely limited. A woman at her graduation lamented about her reality as follows: "first of all, although I want to study more, where can I go? … if I give up my study for work, is there any job? …if my situation does not allow me to study and if I cannot work for the society, I can consider marriage. But my opinion about marriage is different from my parents', thus although I would marry, I'm just in worries." (Kim, 1924, pp.32-33)

Conclusion

This study provides a detailed and intricate view of women's education through voices never before heard and serves as a comparative basis for the tracking of issues of equality for women up to and including the present situation in Korea. In the Korea's urgent political crisis of the late 19th century, women's education was an important social issue among Korean people. However, women were not recognized as independent individuals who were contributing to Korean society as full members like men. Women's roles and identities were recognized only in relation to men, such as their sons or husbands or fathers. In this divided role, women fall into the class of secondary members of the society whose identities are defined only in relation to men.

References

Blundell, S. (1992). Gender and the curriculum of adult education. *International journal of lifelong education, 11*, 199-216.

Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing: The development of self, voice, and mind*. New York: Basic Books.

Brown, G., & Yule, G. (1983). *Discourse analysis*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Chafe, W. (1994). *Discourse, consciousness, and time: The flow and displacement of conscious experience in speaking and writing*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Cho, H. (1995). *Korean women and men*. Seoul, Korea: Munhak kwa Jisung Sa.

Editorial. (1896, May 12). *Toklipshinmun* [Independence Newspaper].

Fraser, N. (1997). *Justice interruptus*. London: Routledge.

Goldberger, N., Tarule, J., Clinchy, B., & Belenky, M. (Eds.). (1996). *Knowledge, difference, and power*. New York: Basic Books.

Hyun, K. (1998). A case study of colonial women's education: Kyungsung Secondary School for Girls. Unpublished master's thesis, Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea.

Jayaweera, S. (1997). Women, education and empowerment in Asia. *Gender and Education, 9*, 411-423.

Kim. (1924, April). Nowhere to go. *New Women*, 32-33.

Korean Women Research Institute. (1979). *Korean women-related data collection*. Seoul, Korea: Ewha Women's University.

Lee, H. (1996). *Korean women's movement: Yesterday and today*. Seoul, Korea: Jungwoosa.

Lee, K. (1984). *A new history of Korea*. Seoul, Korea: Ilchokak.

Li, N., & Zubin, D. A. (1995). Discourse continuity and perspective taking. In J. F. Duchan, G. A. Bruder, & L. E. Hewitt (Eds), *Deixis in narrative: A cognitive science perspective* (pp. 287-307). Hove, United Kingdom: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Moi, T. (1997). Feminist, female, feminine. In S. Kemp & J. Squires (Eds.), *Feminisms* (pp. 246-250). Oxford: Oxford University.

Shiffrin, D. (1994). *Approaches to discourse*. Oxford, England: Blackwell.

Talmy, L. (1995). Narrative structure in a cognitive framework. In J. F. Duchan, G. A. Bruder, & L. E. Hewitt (Eds), *Deixis in narrative: A cognitive science perspective* (pp. 421-460). Hove, United Kingdom: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Wittig, M. (1997). One is not born a woman. In S. Kemp & J. Squires (Eds.), *Feminisms* (pp. 220-226). Oxford, England: Oxford University.

Women's History Department, Korean Women Research Institute. (1992). *The history of Korean women*. Seoul, Korea: Pulbit.

Kyungmi Hyun, The Pennsylvania State University

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Form or Flesh: Social Factors that Impact Women's Practice of Breast Self-Examination

Patricia A. London

Abstract: The purpose of the qualitative study was to understand the meanings of the social factors identified by Caucasian middle-class women and their practice of breast self-exam (BSE). The meaning of breast self-exam is discussed in relationship to body image and the social definition of being a woman.

Introduction

Much of the research on adult leaning reveals the psychological nature of learning. However, very little research has been published about the social influences upon adult learning, specifically, women's learning (Hayes & Flannery, 2000). Similarly, the research on breast self-exam (BSE) coming from health education is also psychological in nature. These studies looked at factors that predict compliance or barriers to monthly practice of BSE and reflect the psychological perspective that has dominated this issue. While these studies are important they present an isolated view of the practice of breast self-exam. Importantly, women have been barraged through the media about breast cancer and the importance of early detection. Breast self-exam is important due to breast cancer being the leading type of non-cutaneous cancer in the United States for women. One new breast cancer is diagnosed every three minutes in the United States. In spite of all the programs, printed materials and media reminders, only 8% to 10% of women perform breast self-exam on a monthly basis (American Cancer Society, 2000). Give all the information on breast cancer, one must ask why such a small number of women practice BSE monthly and what influences women to choose to use this learning or to disregard it?

Review of the Literature

To better understand the meaning making of the practice of breast self-exam and the social factors that impact women's practice of and experience with breast self-exam, four bodies of literature were reviewed: Social Constructionism, women as gendered learners, the concept of body image, and the practice of breast self-exam. Social construction of knowledge is concerned with the analysis of socially constructed reality. McCarthy (1996) states that knowledge is defined as "any and every set of ideas and acts accepted by one or another social group or society of people—or ideas and acts pertaining to what they accept as real for themselves and for others" (p. 23). Following this knowledge is an historical construct, which is subject to constant changing of forms and changing the ways people navigate and position themselves in their worlds. Gergen (1995) locates knowledge in language, not just the utterance of words but also the deeper understanding of the intent behind the vocalizations. Realizing that communication takes many forms, Rorty (1989) believes that "all experience and behavior is essentially

linguistic" (p. 9). Therefore, understanding language as a construct of knowledge brings a view of culture that encompasses multiple social reality and tremendous cultural diversity.

Understanding women as gendered learners means to understand the socially constructions that influencing women's learning (Hayes & Flannery, 2000). Gender is a social construct, one that is fluid, responding to being created and re-created depending upon the social situation one is located in. Additional social constructs identified have been race (Johnson-Bailey & Cevero, 1996), and class (Lutrell, 1984) that shape women's learning. Learning for women is also contextual. Hayes and Flannery (2000) place women workers as segregated by gender and occupying traditional female jobs. Research on social constructions which influencing women learning are emerging, others need to be identified, and one such construct is that of body image.

Body image is a social construct; comprised of multidimensional self-attitude towards one's body, the size, shape and aesthetics of the body, beliefs about one's attractiveness, as well as the perceptions of how others view one's own body (Brand & Hong, 1997; Cash & Pruzinsky, 1990). Body image is formed to a degree as a function of the culturally defined images of desirable body appearances for women. These culturally defined images most often occur in the mass media as ideal images of the female body. Being objectified by others, women learn the art of self-objectification (Brand & Hong, 1997). Her body becomes an object for display. This female gendered body image is a culturally created image that resides in the minds of many men and women.

Lastly, the research on breast self-examination performance and nonperformance provide varied and often inconclusive results. Social factors of age and education give mixed results on performance (Worden, Costanza, Foster, Lang, & Tidd, 1983; Sensiba & Stewart, 1995). The literature on social support and one's personal history also provide inconclusive results. Alagon and Reddy (1984) found self-confidence in one's competence to perform BSE and a feeling of control over one's health were significant predictors of the practice of BSE. Social factors produced mixed results for the practice of BSE, and knowledge alone does not provide reason for women to practice breast self-exam. What needs to be understood is how body image as a social construct influences the practice of breast self-exam.

Methodology

A qualitative phenomenological approach focused on in-depth interviews was employed to capture the lived experiences of the 15 participants. The participants were selected to reflect Caucasian, middle-class women who practice monthly BSE, occasionally practiced BSE or did not practice BSE. Semi-structured, face-to-face interviews were used as the primary method of data gathering. The interviews were audiotaped and transcribed verbatim. Follow-up interviews were conducted to gain clarity and to aid in triangulation process. The transcripts were analyzed using thematic coding. To ensure trustworthiness, data collection and analysis were rigorously conducted and supervised. The findings of this study are not generalizable due to the specific and purposeful nature of the sample.

Findings

This study identified the social influences on women's practice of breast self-exam and then explained the importance these influences had upon the women and their practice of BSE.

Three specific groupings of participants emerged based upon their practice of BSE, as did themes pertaining about social influences, breasts and BSE education on women's lives.

Grouping of the Participants Based Upon Their Practice of BSE

While conducting data analysis participant grouping naturally emerged based upon their practice of BSE. Each group displayed specific commonalities. Age and educational backgrounds vary in each of these groupings.

Women who practice monthly BSE. These five women all learned BSE from their gynecologist and share five commonalities. First is satisfaction with their bodies and acceptance of body image and breast size. Not one woman would alter the size of her breast if given the opportunity. This group could not describe ideal breasts as described by society and have developed the ability to resist the impact of the media, and bra and clothing manufactures as social influences. Secondly, their concept of health or wellness is viewed in totality, the human body is not broken down into separate pieces to be cared for. These women take time for all self-care behaviors. This provides these women with a sense of empowerment. BSE is more than finding a lump or cancer early, it provides a greater objective—control over one's health. Kate summarizes this thought, "Breast self-exam, it's like brushing your teeth, I mean I don't treat my breasts any differently than I do other things that require care. Every part of me gets the health piece." Next, these women can articulate their empowerment by anticipating potential problems and discussing their plan of action if they found a lump. Barbara notes her power in this plan, "Well, then my options come in. That I can act on it, I can take charge and say what I am comfortable having done." The fourth commonality is the understanding of what is normal breast tissue. As regularly practicing BSE, they know their own breast tissue and this eliminates worry because they know their body. The final commonality is their ability to openly discuss their bodies and breasts with other women, also; these women are more likely to initiate discussions about BSE with female relatives and friends. For these women health is a resource, it is an enabler to live active lives.

Women who occasionally practice BSE. These women exhibit four commonalities that revolve around their breast. Foremost is the desire to change the size or shape of their breasts: these women identified a societal ideal of perfection and recognized their own imperfections. Secondly, these women articulated what the perfect pair of breasts should look like. The words for this notion of perfect breasts were similar for these five women: "firm, centered, cleavage, C cup size, perkier, and be able to go without a bra." These women compared themselves to an ideal that is based upon the media and advertising. Next, as girl children growing and developing secondary sex characteristics, these women recalled negative comments from authority figures that haunt them today. Maggie had two teachers tell her sit up "or your boobs will hang down to your gut." Lee's mother nominated her for the "chairperson of the itty bitty titty committee." Last, these women are very casual in their practice of BSE and expressed fears about breast cancer. They give the impression that this is due to a lack of self-confidence in their BSE technique and/or not knowing what is normal breast tissue. This group of women has been greatly influenced by the media and clothing manufacturers. Their breasts have become objects that they notice and want others to notice, also. Their breast dissatisfaction impacts how they view themselves as women, and this connection appears to be a link to their occasional practice of BSE.

Women who do not practice BSE. This final group of women does not practice BSE; most of the women could not remember finishing an exam. This group is an anomaly. Some like their breasts; others don't. Those that don't like their breasts can't describe an ideal pair but would still like to change their breasts; they just want "something more." Suzanne, a self-defined large woman, could not articulate a social standard for breasts, but stated that her ideals come from "the deficiencies I see in myself." Betsy's husband is willing to pay for breast augmentation for her; however, she could only articulate her idea of perfect breasts to be "rounder, fuller, larger." There does not appear to be a unifying feature that prevents this group from performing BSE. Reasons given ranged from "my breasts are so small, the official exam is necessary" by Victoria to Sharon's statement, "I just don't see the need." They do share a difficulty in describing their normal breast tissue, due to not practicing BSE. Last, these women spoke of their breasts as objects; either by naming them or referring to their breasts as they or them.

Themes About Social Influences, Breasts, and BSE Education On Women's Lives And Their Impact

The social influences identified by these participants were: the media, the fashion industry and family or friends. Most noticeable are the huge gradations of the influences of society upon the participant's lives. Some of the participants are able to ignore these influences, while others are greatly impacted. The visual media was discussed as to how women's bodies are portrayed. Some women credit television, magazines and advertising as presenting women as just an image or a physical body, with no thought to the person inside. Most often discussed was the notion of the ideal image of the female body and with this the ideal breasts. These women believe that the media has linked the notion of perfect body and breasts to transcend all ages. The fashion industry was viewed as catering to an ideal body and breast size. Many of the women complained about the choices of clothing available for large breasted women and have learned to compensate for this. Much more common were complaints about bra manufacturers; how the bras fit and how they looked. Advertising to purchase pretty and sexy bras, regardless of how the bra fit, swayed many of the participants. Importantly, whatever the problem associated with bras all of the women wear them. Family members appear to have had a great impact on the lives of these participants. Of those that could recall comments about their developing bodies or breasts, the comments were remembered as negative and hurtful. One women's mother still continues to comment on her 27 year-old daughter's "small boobs."

These influences connect into the objectification of the female breast. Objectification of the breast begins at an early age. First bra stories were remembered and told by the participants. The importance of male and female gazing of female breasts, and the participant's breasts was discussed. As objects breasts define a woman according to many of the participants. They are "part of what makes you special, part of womanhood, a defining feature of being a female, something that's different from men" according to Maureen, Alicia, Lynn and Sharon. Some of the women described how they are viewed as a pair of breasts and not for the person; other participants described similar situations for friends of theirs. This last idea provides an example of how breasts establish a social personality. These women discussed breasts as the presentation of the self and as a means to define womanhood.

Doctors, the media and family and friends have been identified as potential social influences for the women of this study with their practice of BSE. However, the level of

influence each of these three may have appears to be minor. Thirteen women learned BSE from their gynecologist, the other two learned from a family physician. Additional supplemental materials were provided for many of the participants. However, the presentation of BSE simply does not matter in the practice of BSE. What is important is the women's view of BSE. Three participants began monthly BSE after finding accidentally finding a lump. However, for two other women this has not influenced their practice, nor has having a female relative with breast cancer changed the practice of BSE for three other participants.

Conclusions

The findings of this study occur in three significant areas. First are the participant groupings that developed. In all the studies identified earlier on BSE only two groups were identified by their practice of BSE: those that regularly practice BSE and those that do not. Regular practice of BSE has been identified as practicing the technique four to six times a year. This study identified three groupings based upon the participant's BSE practice: those that do monthly BSE, those that occasionally practice BSE (four to six times a year) and that that do not do BSE. The separation into three groups is important, for each group has commonalities that unite them based upon their practice of BSE. It is also important to understand the meanings each group attachs to their BSE practice.

For women that do monthly BSE, it is not viewed in isolation; it is one of many self-care behaviors. This corresponds with the findings of Alagon and Reddy (1994) who reported that women were more likely to perform BSE on a regular basis if the women believed BSE affected their control over their health. Furthermore, these women view the body as who they are and have a deep self-love. This self-love is demonstrated by the comfort and acceptance for their body, which enables these women to have a great sense of themselves. All the social factors previously identified have had little impact. As a result, their body image is based upon their health needs and how they envision their image, not a societal produced one. This concept of embodiment and self is highly integrated into their being a woman and thus acts as a shield from the messages society produces on what constitutes a woman.

The women who occasionally practice BSE and for four of the women that do not do BSE, fear of breast cancer has been identified as impacting their practice of BSE. However, it is the meaning of this fear that is important. For these women the breasts are a symbol of womanhood, they provide a social definition of being a woman. Therefore, losing a breast would signify to society that these women are somehow less than a woman and that their femininity is diminished. These women's breasts embody their feelings of self-worth and attractiveness and so losing one will create turbulence in their view of womanhood and body image. Thus a mastectomy changes something on the outside, a visible body part but also something on the inside, an internalized, societal definition of a woman. Therefore, doing BSE is a signifier that would change their definition of womanhood and these women would rather be lax in their practice of BSE, than face the possibility of redefining themselves as women.

Social influences have been identified that impact women's practice of BSE. The strength of these influences varies greatly. Implications for future practice indicate that a paradigm shift needs to occur within the health education field. Early intervention of all self-care behaviors needs to parallel the teaching of self-acceptance and self-love of the body. Young girls must learn to love their flesh, not the form that it takes. Models of BSE educational programs need to address those women who don't know BSE or don't care to know the

technique. Adult educators must challenge society and how women are objectified in social settings. Lastly, people must be committed to raising children free of social influences. From a research perspective, future studies that understand how body image impacts other learning and/or knowledge use need to occur. Additional social forces that impact women's learning also need to be identified examined and assessed for the meanings they possess.

References

Alagon, S. W., & Reddy, D. M. (1984). Predictors of proficient technique and successful lesion detection in breast self-examination. *Health Psychology, 3*(2), 113-127.

American Cancer Society. (2000). *National Division Annual Report*. Atlanta: Author.

Brand, L., & Hong, A. (1997, May). *Dieting, dating and denial: Whose body is it?* Paper presented at the 75th Annual Meeting of the American College Health Association, New Orleans, LA. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED399225)

Cash, T., & Pruzinsky, T. (1990). (Eds.). *Body images: Development, deviance and change*. New York: Guilford Press.

Gergen, K. (1995). Social construction and the educational process. In L. Steffee & J. Gale (Eds.), *Constructivism in education* (pp. 17-39). Hillside, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Hayes, E., & Flannery, D. D. (2000). *Women as learners: The significance of gender in adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Johnson-Bailey, J., & Cervero, R. (1996). An analysis of educational narratives of reentry black women. *Adult Education Quarterly, 46*, 142-157.

Lutrell, W. (1989). Working-class women's ways of knowing: Effects of gender, race and class. *Sociology of Education, 62*, 3-46.

McCarthy, D. E. (1996). *Knowledge as culture: The new sociology of knowledge*. New York: Routledge.

Rorty, R. (1989). *Contingency, irony, and solidarity*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Sensiba, M. A., & Stewart, D. S. (1995). Relationship of perceived barriers to breast self-examination in women of varying ages and levels of education. *Oncology Nursing Forum, 22*, 1265-1268.

Worden, J. K., Foster, R. S., Costanza, M. C., Lang, S. P., & Tidd, C. A. (1983). Content and context in health education: Persuading women to perform breast self-examination. *Preventive Medicine, 12*, 331-339.

Patricia A. London, Bermudian Springs School District, York Springs, PA 17372; pal136@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

Marketing God: A Critical Inquiry into Spirituality in the Workplace

Fred Milacci and Sharon L. Howell

Abstract: This paper examines the way spirituality is co-opted and commodified to serve the interests of the marketplace from a faith-based perspective.

Introduction

We have noticed the increased frequency of the language of spirituality in both management and adult education literature. Particularly disconcerting is the way spirituality is used, or from our perspective, *mis*used. Following the work of Cox (1999) and Frank (2000), this study explores the way spirituality is co-opted and commodified to serve the interests of the marketplace. We examine the concept of spirituality as it is applied in the workplace, locating the discourse of spirituality within the context of management theory, human resource development, and organizational learning. Additionally, the research looks at spirituality from the perspective of religious activists and is grounded in the work of critical theological and religious studies. The paper concludes with a discussion of why spirituality cannot be divorced from its origins within the various religious traditions and why any discussion of spirituality and work must be connected to the work of critical theological and religious scholars. Failure to do so leads to a conception of spirituality that becomes part of a process that attempts to shape human beings to "fit" into the marketplace rather than one that sees them as true spiritual beings.

Theoretical Orientation and Research Design

Though we locate ourselves within Christianity, this study incorporates work from a multiplicity of religious traditions. Theoretically, this paper is grounded in critical religious and theological perspectives (Lerner, 2000; Wallis, 2000; Wilber, 1998), suggesting that concepts such as "soul" and "spirituality" in the workplace are used by business to further economic goals by co-opting the language of religion on an as-needed basis. One critic notes (Moskovitz, 1997) that "soul is only the language of business when things are going well." Critical religious and theological scholars argue that advocates of "spirituality in the workplace" attempt to secularize and individualize spirituality in a way that removes the ideas of the sacred and profound, replacing them with a spirituality that is connected to economic productivity and the market. In addition, we reviewed books from business and Human Resource Development (HRD) literature on spirituality (e.g., Bolman & Deal, 2001; Conger, 1994; Covey, 1989). We also identified authors within the field of adult education who deliberately connect their adult education practice with notions of spirituality (e.g., Dirkx, 1997; English & Gillen, 2000; Fenwick & Lange, 1998; Schauffelle & Baptiste, 2000; Tisdell, 2000). We address the following questions: (a) How is spirituality defined and discussed in the literature? (b) What socio-political and ideological

messages about spirituality are encoded in the texts? (c) What epistemological elements, messages, patterns, and themes are embedded in the texts?

Discussion

Fenwick and Lange (1998) initiated the discussion on the movement of HRD from skills-based training and career development into the manipulative uses of spirituality in the workplace. Our research extends this analysis into the socio-economic implications that enable broader and subtler means of worker control. We start with an analysis of spirituality in business and HRD literature followed by a discussion of the religious, theological and etymological foundations of spirituality. Then we link our findings with the adult education literature on spirituality.

Spirituality in Business and HRD

We categorize business and HRD texts on spirituality and work by (a) a focus on individuals in organizations with an *implicit* spiritual theme, (b) a focus on individuals in organizations with an *explicit* spiritual theme, and (c) a focus on corporations as individuals with souls.

Focus on individuals in organizations with an implicit spiritual theme. The business literature is replete with examples of well known management gurus whose popular books disguise spiritual themes by focusing on individual responsibility in support of organizational effectiveness, learning and service (e.g., Covey, 1989; Peters, 1992; Senge, 1990). For example, Covey (1989) markets a model of "human effectiveness" (p. 23) that encourages a shift from a personality-centered paradigm focused on changing attitudes and behaviors to a principle-centered paradigm supporting the unchanging laws of nature and providing the "correct" maps for effective problem solving. The *spiritual* is one of four dimensions of renewal along with the physical, mental and social/emotional that creates a healthy balanced life. The *spiritual* provides the core commitment to one's value system. Covey espouses a value system centered on the individual, an inward examination of self with responsibility for his [sic] own success or failure.

In *Liberation Management* Tom Peters (1992) plays on a liberation theology associated with radical social movements in support of the poor and disenfranchised to encourage the use of workers' spirituality for the benefit of organizational effectiveness and profit. He states that

> [S]oul, my preferred term for rules, value, vision, philosophy, whatever. . . . Work as dialogue, shared minds, and the floating crap games of project teams (of insiders and outsiders) "tied" together by soul of some sort—that's the mostly elusive "stuff" that adds up to "beyond hierarchy." (p. 472)

In the secularized business world, vertical *soul* relates to traditional expertise while horizontal *soul* connects strategic business plans across function boundaries. Boeing finds its true *soul* with the power of systems integration, and MCI's *soul* is discovered in systems and network integration. Soul within this context refers to difference, changing how work is organized. Soul is used to transform the unpleasant to the acceptable. An executive temp service, a self-identified "body shop," is sold as "the way, the truth and the light," providing job assignments to over skilled executives, leaving them with more time to deal with the political. Soul then is about what is special and integral to the organization (Peters, 1992, p. 314). When the "subcontracting soul . . . [identifies] the essence of business success . . . [as] repeat business, then Skonie Corp *does soul* for medical equipment manufacturers" (Peters, 1992, p. 328). The subcontractor of

parking for Marriott Hotels *does soul work* providing good customer service. Ironically, the champion of outsourcing as the only way to keep workers focused on continuously creating efficiencies in both private and public sectors recognizes that the Navy provided him tough assignments and opportunities for learning to think and act outside the box.

Senge (1990), another leadership guru, makes use of the spiritual by incorporating the language of religion, for the most part implicitly, to place increased responsibility on the individual. He defines personal mastery, one of the five disciplines of the learning organization, as "the ability to produce the results we want in life" (p. 142). Phrases like higher virtues, calling, fulfillment, and values are interspersed throughout the book. This gives the corporation a spiritual legitimacy that allows it to become one with its workers. Economic success is closely aligned with the spiritual. Greater worker commitment translates to deeper worker responsibility at work. Workers only seeking fulfillment outside of work limit their self-development since we spend the majority of our waking hours at work. Time spent at work is an unquestioned norm. Therefore the spiritual, an important factor from the perspective of the whole person, becomes a crucial element at work. This view shifts work from the instrumental to the *sacred* in a sociological sense, not a religious sense. Purportedly, this means that workers and things are valued in and of themselves at work. The relationship between the organization and the worker moves from a contractual relationship to a relationship based on a covenant. This allows the whole worker, including the spiritual dimension, into the workplace. Most revealing is Senge's use of a statement made by Henry Ford: "What we need . . . is reinforcement of the soul by the invisible power waiting to be used. . . . I know there are reservoirs of spiritual strength from which we human beings thoughtlessly cut ourselves off" (Senge, 1990, p. 141).

Focus on individuals in organizations with explicit spiritual theme. Business literature and more specifically HRD literature with explicit spiritual themes include Bolman and Deal (2000) and Conger (1994). Conger (1994) uses the *trinity* to connect inward and outward dimensions of workers with spirituality defined as the inward force while the workplace and leadership are outward forces. The workplace replaces the so-called failed extended family, community and church/temple ties because there is no other place for workers to turn. Since other segments of their lifeworlds have failed, workers must turn to their workplace to find meaning and support. By default the workplace becomes the location for the *care of the soul.*

Even more explicitly *Leading with Soul* (Bolman & Deal, 2001) attempts to move beyond the main emphasis of management, a focus on body and mind, to draw attention to the neglected and deeper spiritual needs of workers. As workers take on greater responsibilities at work with the resulting requirement to take more responsibility for their self-development, the authors suggest that corporate leaders develop an awareness of workers from a holistic perspective, including the needs of their souls. "Each of us has a special contribution to make if we can shoulder the personal and spiritual work needed to discover and take responsibility for our own gifts . . . Leading with soul returns us to ancient spiritual basics – reclaiming the enduring human capacity that gives our lives passion and purpose" (pp. 11-12).

Focus on corporations as individuals with souls. Texts of this genre include Cox and Liesse (1996) and Kahnweiler and Otte (1997). These authors apply attributes of individuals to corporations, giving legitimacy to the concept of soul within the context of the marketplace. The legal formulation of the corporation with the same rights as the individual has taken place over the past 150 years. The corporation is described in terms normally reserved for individuals. The search for identity and authenticity within the context of the global market is linked to providing service to the market. Leaders and corporations are one. "These leaders are marked by a here and

now contact with their own authenticity–their corporate soul" (Cox & Liesse, 1996, p. 29). Like Conger (1994), Cox and Liesse (1996) see the corporation as the replacement for organized religion and the government:

> Purposeful corporations have a critical role–and opportunity–in society today. As the authority of organized religion and government is diminished, the corporation–the interpersonal network committed to some mission in the service of customers, employees, shareholders and publics–becomes a more prominent building block of society. (p.5)

The third section of the book, *Spreading the Gospel of Team Go*als, talks about creating *inner quality management* with workers caring for self like they care for the organization's customers.

> Soul helps you discover your purpose; purpose becomes an expression of soul; soul is contact with authenticity. Resonance mean it's all sort of self-fulfilling. It feeds on itself, gets bigger and stronger and richer and fuller, and; ultimately becomes a way of life – for you, your family, your organization and society. (Cox & Liesse, 1996, p. 53)

In Search of the Soul of HRD by Kahnweiler and Otte (1997) is a dialogue between two HRD professionals about the need for personal and professional values to bring greater clarification of the beliefs of the field. The authors equate *soul* with *myth* as a form of story telling that gives a sense of awe, presents an image of the universe, supports a social order, and "initiate[s] individuals into the order of realities of their own psyches" (p. 171). Soul is "the life force of the individual" (p. 173). Moving back and forth between HRD as a field and their role as helpers to individual workers, the authors "want to discover the myths capable of energizing and directing the field of HRD for the good of humanity and the earth" (p. 174). Recognizing the harmful affects of HRD in service to the unethical and materialists, they focus on the spiritual experience of connectedness and the chance to help workers find fulfillment at work.

Religious, Theological, and Etymological Grounding of Spirituality

The preceding analysis has shown that because of it's disconnection from religious moorings, spirituality in management and HRD literatures lacks the moral and ethical foundations that we think are so desperately needed, not just in the workplace but in society as a whole. As Harvey Cox (1999) notes, "The lexicon of *The Wall Street Journal* and the business sections of *Time* and *Newsweek* turned out to bear a striking resemblance to Genesis, the Epistle to the Romans, and Saint Augustine's City of God" (p. 18). The theology of business portrays the meaning of human history as creation of wealth, sins as statism and regulations and salvation through free markets. The God of this new theology is The Market. Like the process theology of Alfred North Whitehead, "econologians" of The Market attribute dislocations and pain to the transition to a free market. While markets are not a recent invention, over the past two centuries market has a new status, "becoming more like the Yahweh of the Old Testament–not just one superior deity contending with others but the Supreme Deity, the only true God, whose reign must now be universally accepted and who allows for no rivals" (p. 20). Reality is defined by The Market in it's divine capacity, with "[the] human body . . . [becoming a] sacred vessel to be converted into a commodity" (p. 20), a reverse transubstantiation.

Failure to link the concept of spirituality to the broader socio-economic context leaves us open to exploitation, to the use and manipulation of spirituality by a system and it's aristocracy for their own purposes. Finding little *truths* within management literature bogs us down in the minutia of our daily existence, less able to step back and understand the meaning of work as it is played out in the global marketplace. As we complain about our search for meaning within a supposedly meaningless work environment, we put on blinders so we do not have to deal with the vast majority of the world's population surviving on little or no work. Within this context *god talk* is a tool used for economic and marketing purposes. By failing to understand the rhetoric and power at play, the ideology of this *god talk* is used as deflection, turning our focus inward toward our own self-development, wants and needs, while pushing us to lend our expertise to continually increase bottom-line profitability for the benefit of the few at the top. Words are taken to mean one thing within the context of our spiritual lives while at the same time turning them into a commodity for use in the marketplace.

One of the more astounding aspects of our research on spirituality is the absence in the literature of any attempt to uncover the historical or etymological definitions and understandings of spirituality. We deem it necessary to explore substantive definitions. Webster's (2001) defines spirituality as "the quality or fact of being spiritual; incorporeal immaterial nature; predominately spiritual character as shown in thought, life, etc.; spiritual tendency or tone; first surfaced (as an English word) between 1375-1425" (p. 1840). Coming from a Christian perspective, we next went to the Bible where the term *spirituality* is not found. The closest word is the adjective *spiritual* (Greek *pneumatikos*) or the adverb *spiritually* (Greek *pneumatikos*). According to Vine (1966), spiritual "always connotes the ideas of invisibility and of power" (p. 64). Spirituality, spiritual, and spiritually come from the root word *spirit* (Greek *pneuma*). In the Bible spirit occurs nearly 500 times. Spirit "primarily denotes the wind; also breath; then, especially the spirit, which, like the wind, is invisible, immaterial and powerful" (Vine, 1996, p. 62). According to Schweizer (1968), spirit "means the elemental natural and vital force which, matter and process in one, acts as a stream of air in the blowing of the wind and the inhaling and exhaling of breath" (p. 334-5). Based on these definitions and our findings, we asked ourselves, where does God or any mention of a Higher Power enter into the discourse surrounding spirituality in the workplace?

Spirituality and Adult Education

No doubt a large segment of adult educators react to the co-opting of the term spirituality with distain. Smug in intellectual piety and with the fervor of an amen corner in a Southern Baptist church, such abuses are summarily blamed on the propensity of a capitalistic society to commodify anything and everything. But what we realized was that by our own failure as a field to ground these discussions within the historical, cultural and religious framework—not just of Christianity but across the scope of the religious landscape—we as adult educators have become culpable in the cooptation and commodification of the spiritual within the marketplace.

For example in their recent book on spirituality, English and Gillen (2000) purport to address the spiritual dimensions of adult learning. However, what they actually deliver is a decontextualized notion of spirituality that in effect confuses more than it addresses.

> So, how is spirituality conceptualized in this book? We, the editors, describe it as awareness of something greater than ourselves, a sense that we are connected to all human beings and to all of creation. Simply put, authentic spirituality moves one outward

> to others as an expression of one's spiritual experiences . . . therefore this book is located in what Berry refers to as public spirituality or in what Van Ness refers to as secular spirituality. (pp. 1-2)

This type of nebulous, vague description seems to be an attempt to have spirituality mean all things to all people, excusing it as "hard to define" or describing it in purely individualistic terms with the etymology of the concept completely ignored. For example Tisdell (2000) states:

> In sum, *spirituality* is an elusive term and an elusive concept, but perhaps this is so because it is all encompassing and cannot be torn from other aspects of one's life, including one's cultural experience, one's further development, or one's social change work in the world. . . . It is difficult to discuss what is so elusive and at the same time so personal and so encompassing [about it]. (p. 333)

With this effort to construct what we perceive to be a "one-size-fits-all," non-offensive notion of spirituality, these authors seems to distance their definition of the concept from its religious moorings, virtually ignoring in their literature review the rich theological traditions (not to mention the preponderance of religious writings) from which the concept originated. This type of decontextualization that fails to understand notions of the sacred implicit in the term may make the concept of spirituality more palatable to a wider readership, but it also serves to eviscerate the term, leaving it with no real meaning. Finally, as this study has shown, it also makes it much easier for the term to be co-opted, commodified, and misused for purposes that, in our view, are anything but *spiritual*.

References

Bolman, L. G., & Deal, T. E. (2001). *Leading with soul: An uncommon journey of spirit* (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Conger, J. (1994). *Spirit at work: Discovering the spirituality in leadership*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Covey, S. R. (1989). *The seven habits of highly effective people: Restoring the character ethic*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Cox, A., & Liesse, J. (1996). *Redefining corporate soul: Linking purpose and people*. Chicago: Irwin Professional Publishing.

Cox, H. (1999). The market as God: Living the new dispensation. *The Atlantic Monthly, 283*(3), 18-23.

Dirkx, J. M. (1997). Nurturing soul in adult learning. In P. Cranton (Ed.), *Transformative learning in action: Insights from practice* (pp. 79-88). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

English, L. M., & Gillen, M. A. (Eds.). (2000). *Addressing the spiritual dimensions of adult learning: What educators can do*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Fenwick, T., & Lange, E. (1998). Spirituality in the workplace: The new frontier of HRD. *The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education, 12*(1), 63-87.

Frank, T. (2000). *One market under god: Extreme capitalism, market populism, and the end of economic democracy*. New York: Doubleday.

Kahnweiler, W., & Otte, F. L. (1997). In search of the soul of HRD. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 8*, 171-181.

Lerner, M. (2000). *Spirit matters*. Charlotte, VA: Hampton Roads.

Moskovitz, M. (1997). That's the spirit. *Mother Jones, 22*(4). Retrieved January 30, 2002, from http://www. mojones.com/mother_jones/JA97/moskowitz.html

Peters, T. (1992). *Liberation management*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf

Schauffelle, S., & Baptiste, I. (2000). Appealing to the soul: Towards a Judeo-Christian theory of learning. *International Journal of Lifelong Learning, 19*, 448-458.

Schweizer, E. (1968). Pneuma, pneumatikos. In G. Friedrich (Ed.), *Theological dictionary of the New Testament* (Vol. 6, pp. 332-455). Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans.

Senge, P. M. (1990). *The fifth discipline*. New York: Doubleday/Currency.

Tisdell, E. J. (2000). Spirituality and emancipatory adult education in women adult educators for social change. *Adult Education Quarterly, 50*, 308-335.

Vine, W. E. (1966). *An expository dictionary of New Testament words with their precise meanings for English readers* (Vol 4). Old Tappan, NJ: Fleming H. Revell.

Wallis, J. (2000). Faith Works: *How faith-based organizations are changing lives, neighborhoods and America*. Berkeley, CA: PageMill Press.

Webster's Encyclopedia Unabridged Dictionary. (2001). San Diego, CA: Thunder Bay Press.

Wilber, K. (1998). *The marriage of sense and soul: Integrating science and religion*. New York: Broadway Books.

Fred Milacci is a doctoral student in the Adult Education Program at The Pennsylvania State University, University Park. Contact: fam103@psu.edu

Sharon L. Howell received her doctorate in adult education from The Pennsylvania State University, where she is a Director in the Office of Student Aid. Contact: slh2@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Invited Papers

From Symbols, Stories and Social Artifacts to Social Architecture and Agency: The Discourse of Learning and the Decline of "Organizational Culture" in the "New Work Order"

Irwin H. Siegel

Abstract: The functionalist models of organizational culture, which have often relied on ethnographic and/or anecdotal studies of organizations in an attempt to discern the "culture" or an organization, do not appropriately account for individual learning and agency. This paper suggests an alternative model of "social architecture" comprised of "institutional" and "agency" components.

Introduction

A great deal of attention has been focused in the management, organizational theory and workplace learning literature over the past thirty years on the importance of the concept of "organizational culture" in understanding the nature and, more particularly, the productivity of organizations. The concept of organizational culture has been central to development of other concepts such as the learning organization and organizational learning, which have become increasingly important within the field of adult education (Marsick & Watkins, 1990; Fenwick, 1996).

Researchers in organizational culture such as Schein (1992) have sought to utilize terminology borrowed from anthropology and other social sciences in defining the "culture" or an organization as (a) a pattern of basic assumptions, (b) invented, discovered, or developed by a given group, (c) as it learns to cope with its problems of external adaptation and internal integration, (d) that has worked well enough to be considered valid and, therefore (e) is to be taught to new members as the (f) correct way to perceive, think, and feel in relation to those problems (Schein, 1999b, p. 80).

In addition to Schein, other researchers (Deal & Kennedy, 1988; Kotter & Heskett, 1992; Peters & Waterman, 1982), applying definitions not dissimilar to that set forth above, have conducted primarily "ethnographic" studies of organizations, applying these borrowed concepts, in an attempt to discern the "culture" of an organization, which is then juxtaposed against measures of the organization's productivity and/or profitability. Generalizations regarding optimum productivity/profitability resulting from certain types of "organizational culture" are often the byproduct of these studies.

Gee, Hull, and Lankabeau (1996) term these often commercially successful texts "fast capitalist" texts, which they define as "creat[ing] on paper a version of the new work order that their authors are trying hard to enact in the world . . . a mix of history and description, prophecy, warning, proscriptions and recommendations, parables, . . . and large doses of utopianism" (pp. 24-25). (The "new work order" has been defined as "the dynamic and human nature of post-industrial work . . . post-Fordism" [Solomon, 1999, p. 121].) Interestingly, Schein (1999a) himself recently vented his "anger . . . and frustration" (p. xiii) over what he views as the

"faddish" (Spector, 2000) nature of many recent works addressing the concept of "organizational culture." The irony is that Schein (1999a) expressed these emotions as the result of what he perceived as the dilution of the concept of "organizational culture," arguing, in essence, that the term is becoming hackneyed and a cliché. However, the issues are more serious. This paper argues that the notion of "organizational culture" itself is actually theoretically problematic. It also suggests an alternative: a model of "social architecture" which contains "institutional" and "agency" components. The latter are especially significant to the field of adult education because they emphasize the *learning* aspect of "culture" but in a non-proscriptive manner, which is contrary to, and not consistent with, shaping the norms of others, a concept often evident in the "fast capitalist" models, most of which fall into a "functionalist" (Parker, 2000) classification.

Contrasting Models of Organizational Culture

Functionalist Models

Parker (2000) describes the functionalist models of organizational culture as "seek[ing] to discover data about organizations in order that an elite, usually managers, can better exercise control" (p. 61). Functionalist models, of which Schein (1992) is a prime producer, attempt to discern the "culture" of an organization, often through the use of ethnographic methods and anthropological terminology. The inevitable result is a description of the "universal" culture of the organization, and a prescriptive list of "findings" which link that culture to productivity, profitability or the lack of same. In addition to the works of Schein, the most popular functionalist books have included Peters and Waterman's (1982) *In Search of Excellence*, arguably "the most influential management text of recent times" (Parker, 2000, p. 10), which purports to be a study of 43 high-performing U.S. companies, and which synthesizes what the authors feel are the universal cultural qualities shared by all. The anecdotal descriptions provided in the book often link positive culture to the Japanese model prevalent at the time. The "excellent" companies "were actually repositories of myths, symbols, stories and legends that reflected and reinforced the central (and positive) values of the organization"(Parker, 2000, p. 11). The result was eight prescriptive rules or "maxims" for success linked to maintenance of a "strong" culture.

In addition to Peters and Waterman, the functionalist organizational culture literature includes Deal and Kennedy's (1988) *Corporate Cultures*, which, again, focuses on a series of companies which the authors determine possess "strong" cultures. Not surprising within the context of its publication, this book depends heavily upon the Japanese models prevalent at the time: "A major reason the Japanese have been so successful . . . is their continuing ability to maintain a very strong and cohesive culture throughout the entire country" (p. 5). The authors go on to define the essential elements of organizational culture, which include the venerable values, heroes, rites and rituals, and a network for "storytellers, spies, priests, cabals, and whisperers" (p. 15).

Smircich's (1983) suggestion that we treat organizations *as* cultures rather than *things with* culture provides the strongest caution for liberal applications of the functionalist models. Their de-emphasis of individual learning and agency, and resulting focus on the power and importance of shared meanings, can often result in culture being used as a tool for by managers for normative control (Kunda, 1992).

Even a functionalist such as Schein (1999a) recently expressed his frustration at the "faddish nature" (Spector, 2000, p. 1) in which "organizational culture" currently finds itself,

largely the result of the "fast capitalist" texts. Schein (1999a) lamented that "we talk about corporate culture as if it were a managerial tool, like a new form of organization structure" (p. xiv). Ironically, his lament is contained in his latest book entitled *The Corporate Culture Survival Guide: Sense and Nonsense About Culture Change* (1999), yet another "fast capitalist" text. He appears not to recognize that the functionalist models of organizational culture are commercially successful because of their suggestion of organizational culture as a *manipulative* tool for management (Kunda, 1992). Witness this passage from Kunda's (1992) "Tech" (the fictitious name Kunda selected for the organization he studied):

> She is an engineer who is now "totally into culture." Over the last few years she has become the resident "culture expert." "I got burnt out on coding. You can only do so much. And I knew my limits. So I took a management job and I'm funded to do culture now. Some people didn't believe it had any value-added. But I went off and made it happen, and now my workshops are all over-subscribed! I'm a living example of the culture. . . . Today I'm doing culture with the new hires." (p.6)

Doing culture? A fundamental weakness of the functionalist models is that they have taken culture from its original role as a *context* for understanding organizational behavior to a *broad descriptor* for an organization to a *process*, which often becomes a process for normative control (Kunda, 1992) by management.

Critical Models

The critical models of organizational culture (or "radical humanism," Parker, 2000), on the other hand, "conceptualize . . . organizational culture as a contested relation between meanings" (Parker, 2000, p. 74). These models de-emphasize the focus on a universal "culture" within an organization, substituting a focus upon *subcultures*, where "social groups are not homogenous, but often plural and contested" (Parker, 2000, p. 75). There exists, according to this model, a multiplicity of cultures within organizations. To posit that IBM, for example, possesses a universal "culture" is to minimize the localized cultures, whether *administrative* (created by management) or *occupational* (created by employees). My position is that "universal" cultures seldom develop (bottom up) within organizations of any size. Rather, senior management, with the assistance of "fast capitalist" consultants, can attempt to impose (top down) such "cultures" as a form of normative control: "the creation and maintenance in the organization of 'core values' and a culture that induces (socializes) everyone into such values" (Gee et al., 1996, p. 32).

The "Tech" employees described by Kunda (1992) attempted to resist normative control by attempting to create what Feldman (1999) terms a "self-society" dichotomy in which they distinguish their "true" selves from their "organization" selves (p. 4). This creates a "boundary," permitting them to critically reflect upon the normative control being forced upon them. For example, the term "bullshit" frequently is used by employees at "Tech" to describe the "knowledge" seminars:

> People get caught up in this shit. It is not only the power. Maybe the growth. The times I want to leave are when there are too many things happening that are out of control. I can't take too much bullshit even though I'm paid to be an asshole. (Kunda, 1992, p. 165)

Learning and Agency

Moore (1986) suggests that "the central *educational* question in the workplace is not whether rich forms of knowledge are in use in the environment, but rather whether and how newcomers...get *access* to that knowledge: how they encounter it, take it in, are called upon to display it, get to work on it and even transform it" (p. 183). Because of the denotations and connotations in the discourse of social anthropology of the term "culture," the component of *agency* seldom appears in functionalist organizational culture models. However, especially in the "new work order," the critical reflection, informal and incidental learning (Marsick & Watkins, 1990), and values of the individual will become increasingly crucial to avoid the potential dystopia resulting from normative control. Solomon (1999) instructs us that "workplace learning can be understood as a cultural practice constructed by contemporary discursive practices of work" (p. 122). Rather than "the learning organization" paradigm of the functionalist models, where "workplace learning" can result in "a repressive exercise of power" (p. 124), a critical model of organizational culture should value *learning*, not as "assum[ing] that the world can be managed" (Schein, 1992, p. 372), but rather "the way in which individuals or groups acquire, interpret, reorganize, change or assimilate a related cluster of information, skills and feelings. It is also primary to the way in which people construct meaning in their personal and shared organizational lives" (Marsick & Watkins, 1990, p. 4).

Real learning in the workplace is not "top down," imposed via normative control; rather, it is "bottom up." "We believe that people learn in the workplace through interactions with others in their daily work environments when the need to learn is greatest" (Marsick & Watkins, 1990, p. 4). Contrary to the "fast capitalist" literature, an organization will maximize productivity and profitability when workers learn their *cultures* via primarily informal and incidental learning (Marsick & Watkins, 1990), not "learning the organizational culture" through formal methods which often are nothing more than a tool of management for achieving normative control.

Replacing "Organizational Culture" With a Model of "Social Architecture

Jack Welch, the recently retired CEO of General Electric Co., on occasion utilized a term which appears appropriate to a discussion of organizational culture for the "new work order." He termed it "social architecture," which, along with "operating system" comprise "sophisticated unifying structures, developed over decades and heavily refined by Mr. Welch that it [GE] says are larger than any one person" (Murray, 2000, p. A1). The term *social architecture* would appear to be appropriate to understanding all of the components of what has been termed organizational culture. Over twenty years ago, Kotter (1978), in providing a model of organizational dynamics, defined a "social system" as comprised of "culture" ("those organizationally relevant norms and values shared by most employees (or subgroups of employees") and "social structure" ("the relationships that exist among employees in terms of such variables as power, affiliation and trust") (p. 17).

A focus of this paper has been on deconstructing the traditional models of organizational culture, attempting to assist Schein (1999a) in discovering the source of his anger and frustration. Schein (1999a) however is correct in that culture is complex and that it does "matter," although in much more than a performance sense. Perhaps a refined model of the components of "social architecture," which is defined here to include *institutional components* and *agency* (substituting for the anthropologically-grounded "organizational culture") would be helpful to understanding

this concept as it applies in the "new work order." The components of this "social architecture" model follow below:

Institutional Components	***Agency Components***
Interaction with others	Occupational Cultures
Leadership Influence	Critical reflection
Norms	Power/knowledge issue recognition
Traditions	Critical Evaluation
Organizational Values	Individual Values
Organizational Learning	Individual Learning
Administrative Cultures	Motivation
Power/knowledge structures	Autonomy
Politics	
Climate	

The above model more appropriately (a) reduces dependence on the discourse of social anthropology; and (b) provides recognition of the importance of individual agency and critical reflection to combat "normative control" while not divorcing the individual employee from his/her social/cultural context. Awareness by individual employees of the power/knowledge dichotomy may serve in some manner to combat the power/knowledge structures inherent in the "new work order's" striving for increased efficiency. In short, this suggested model does not devalue the need for efficiency; rather, it serves to enhance efficiency by recognizing the impact of the institutional components and importance of agency, suggesting a synergistic relationship to the mutual advantage of the organization and the individual. The model addresses many of the weaknesses of the traditional organizational culture models discussed at length above. It suggests that the political system is part of the cultural system, and that there exists a role for norms, so long as they are counter-balanced by an individual's ability to learn and critically reflect. The model is probably unique in including "motivation" as entirely a component of agency, reflecting a belief in its wholly intrinsic nature. Lending credence to one aspect of the functional organizational culture models, this model does recognize leadership influence as an institutional component of social architecture, again being counterbalanced by critical reflection. It addresses the complexity of an organization's social architecture, and, hopefully, the anger and frustration of one of the major organizational culture theorists over the dilution and "faddishness" of that concept, changing the focus of, rather than eliminating the need for, organizational consultants, while, hopefully, blunting the advance of the "fast capitalist" texts suggesting how to "manage" culture.

Conclusion

Although Edgar Schein was frustrated and angry, his solution, *The Corporate Culture Survival Guide* (1999), amounted to yet another corporate-culture-as-process, "fast capitalist" work. It fails to provide solutions to the most significant problems: defining the "institutional components" and the role of "agency" made evident within the "new work order" and recognizing that "social architecture" is only one of a multitude of components of production. The learning required in by agency is an essential ingredient of the model of social architecture, as it will often result in the critical reflection needed to counter the norming attributes found within the institutional components of social architecture.

References

Deal, T., & Kennedy, A. (1982). *Corporate cultures: The rites and rituals of corporate life*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Fenwick, T. (1996). Limits of the learning organization: A critical look. Antigonish, Nova Scotia, Canada: St. Francis Xavier University. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED346082)

Gee, Jr., Hull, G., & Lankabeau, C. (1996). *The new work order*. Boulder, CO: Westview.

Kotter, J. (1978). *Organizational dynamics: Diagnosis and intervention*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Kunda, G. (1992). *Engineering culture: Control and commitment in a high-tech corporation*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Marsick, V., & Watkins, K. (1990). *Informal and incidental learning in the workplace*. London: Routledge.

Murray, M. (2000, April 13). Can house that Jack build stand when he goes? Sure, Welch says. *The Wall Street Journal*, pp. A1, A8.

Moore, D. (1986). Learning at work: Case studies in non-school education. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly, 17*(3), 166-184.

Parker, M. (2000). *Organizational culture and identity*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Peters, T., & Waterman, R. (1982). *In search of excellence: Lessons from America's best run companies*. New York: Harper & Row.

Schein, E. (1992). *Organizational culture and leadership* (2nd Ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Schein, E. (1999a). *The corporate culture survival guide: Sense and nonsense about culture change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Schein, E. (1999b). Organizational culture. Reprinted in D. Ancona, S. Kochan, & W. Van Maanen (Eds.), *Organizational behavior & processes* (pp. 76-92). Cincinnati, OH: South-Western College Publishing. (Original work published in 1990)

Smircich, L. (1983). Studying organizations as cultures. In G. Morgan (Ed.), *Beyond method* (pp. 160-172). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Solomon, N. (1999). Culture and difference in workplace learning. In D. Boud & Jo. Garrick, (Eds.), *Understanding learning at work* (pp. 119-131). London: Routledge.

Spector, B. (2000). [Review of the book *The corporate culture survival guide: Sense and nonsense about culture change*] [Electronic version]. *The Academy of Management Executive, 14*(1), 156-157. Retrieved April 13, 2000, from proquest.umi.com. pqdweb?TS=9556349

Irwin H. Siegel, Pennsylvania College of Technology/The Pennsylvania State University

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Adult Learners' Perceptions of Teaching and Learning During Times of Crisis

Tara L. Amann

Abstract: This paper examines the responses of adult learners to an online survey regarding teaching and learning after the terrorist attacks of 9/11/01. Findings emphasize the college/university response, connecting existing crisis situations to course literature and class discussion, and a strong focus on the impact of crisis on the learning process. Adult educators can more effectively tailor their classrooms toward the unique needs of adult learners by understanding their reactions to crisis situations in the context of the learning environment.

Introduction

In his book, *The Courage to Teach*, Parker Palmer (1998) entreaties teachers to reflect on their profession and recognize the bravery teaching demands. Courage is required of all instructors in the aftermath of the horrific events of September 11, 2001 (9/11/01). In many ways, we have all slipped a few rungs on Maslow's hierarchy as we grapple with basic issues of safety at home and work (Shellenbarger, 2001). As adult educators, we need to understand the expectations of our adult learners during times of crisis. However, the majority of the post 9/11/01 literature is devoted to the needs of schoolchildren. Children's fears and security issues are addressed (Lantieri, 2002) as well as the topics of teaching children about sympathy and revenge (Garbarino, 2002) and the psychological reactions of young children (Schecter, Coates, & First, 2002). The literature also provides space for young adults to voice their opinion on government, civic involvement, and political action as a result of 9/11/01. Even university instructors report methods for discussing unimaginable tragedy with students (Kardia, Bierwert, & Cook, 2002). Yet a distinct set of voices is absent—those of the non-traditional adult student. As they balance jobs, home, and family, what expectations do adult learners have of their educational experience during a time of terror? How does the adult learner need to approach learning during a time of crisis, and how did their instructors meet those needs after 9/11/01? The intent of this research project is to examine these questions through the analysis of data collected from adult students who were enrolled during the fall semester, 2001.

Review of Related Literature

In addition to the literature cited in the introduction involving young children, a search for crisis situations, terrorism, and adult learner reactions and/or learning expectations yielded limited results in three categories: re-evaluation of teaching methods by instructors and institutional methods of dealing with crises, response from traditional college students, and general advice about handling crisis situations on college campuses. The literature served to confirm that many instructors throughout the country struggled to find ways to link the teaching and learning process with the terrorist attacks of 9/11/01 (Artze, 2002; Cox, 2001; Kardia,

Bierwert, & Cook, 2002). Some institutions, such as UCLA and University of Maryland, chose to create new courses or create lectures or conferences integrating the tragedy into the curriculum (Artze, 2002). The president of the University of Michigan specifically requested its faculty members to devote class time to discussion of the terrorist attacks, and the school's Center for Research on Learning and Teaching issued guidelines to aid instructors with facilitation (Artze, 2002). A Princeton University professor redesigned his politics and media course to focus entirely on the terrorist attacks of 9/11/01 (Cox, 2001, p. A18). An underlying theme in each of the approaches taken by these colleges is an emphasis on discussion, either in the form of integrating the attacks into the course itself or as a necessary exercise for helping students to cope and understand the events. The article by Artze (2002) included a few quotes by traditional-aged undergraduate students reflecting their questioning of the events and reaction to institution and instructor responses. Cox (2001) cited a 28-year old student pursuing a degree in education who found renewed value in his pursuit of being a teacher, saying, "He feels a sense of purpose that he didn't have before September 11." This reaction differs drastically from that of the 15-25 age group who are volunteering less and shrugging off career opportunities in service and politics as shown in a survey conducted after 9/11/01 (Civic Attitudes of Students, 2002). The literature also offered advice to college campuses in the wake of a tragedy situation. Crisis situations such as an earthquake at California State University, Northridge, a hurricane at Florida International University, racial conflict at University of Massachusetts, Amherst, multiple homicides at Concordia University in Montreal, and brush fires near Pepperdine University all served as examples for dealing with chaos in a higher education environment (Erickson, 1995; Sabo, 1995). Both articles stressed the importance of communication in the aftermath of a crisis and during times of intense change. Much advice was given for administrators and faculty but the articles did not discuss the students' perspectives or adult learners in particular. This small sample of literature illustrates the need to focus on student perspectives and expectations, and more significantly, indicates a marked lack of attention on adult learners learning needs during crisis situations.

Methodology

The original project focused on assessing teaching and learning as a result of the 9/11/01 terrorist attacks. A survey was designed collaboratively between three colleagues, each teaching at different colleges. Examples of the survey questions can be found in Tables 1, 2, and 3 (see below). The survey was designed to yield both qualitative and quantitative data by using open and closed questions. Two of the professors disseminated a paper copy of the survey in order to test the effectiveness of the questions. As a result of this pilot testing, minor changes were made before the survey was posted online. The electronic version of the student survey as well as surveys for instructors and administrators was hosted on a website, www.learningthroughcrisis.com, which filtered data to a Microsoft Access database. Each question represents a different field in the database. Each field has parameters set for text and numerical responses, which assists with data queries and compilation. The website was created using Dreamweaver4 UltraDev, which utilized Active Server Pages (ASP). ASP allowed the survey web pages to dynamically retrieve the date and time information from the web server and automatically insert this information, with the participant's survey data, into the unique database record. An email was sent to each of our college communities inviting students, instructors, and administrators to participate. Each survey concluded with an option to forward the survey on to a colleague or

friend. This feature yielded responses from a variety of institutions in addition to our own colleges. Upon collection of the surveys, queries and reports were created from the Access database to analyze the responses. This paper focuses specifically on the responses of non-traditional adult students. Seventy-seven surveys were analyzed from adult students who are predominantly employed full-time (84%), 21 years of age or older, and part-time students (68%). The students were enrolled in associate, bachelors, masters, and doctoral programs. Rather than stating hypotheses at the outset, we chose to work from a grounded theory perspective, forming assumptions as the data is analyzed.

Findings

The analysis of both quantitative and qualitative data reveals a number of significant findings. They can be organized into the following themes: college/university response, connecting the tragedy to course literature and class discussion, and affect on learning.

College/University Response

The majority of the adult students reported that their college responded appropriately in either keeping their institution open or closed for classes on the day of the attacks. Nearly 30% of our adult respondents reported their schools did not close, 35.1% reported their school closed, and 35.1% were not sure if the school closed or remained open (Table 1). When schools stayed open, the students replied that this was necessary to "get on with life." For those schools that closed, students agreed with this course of action citing the need to be with loved ones. One student reported that the school closing allowed him/her to "attempt to deal with the tragedy, work, and family without worrying about school also." It seems that most students appreciated the opportunity to discuss the attacks within their classroom setting even if it did not relate to the course material. Students expressed dissatisfaction when instructors took class time to espouse their own views but did not let the students voice their opinions.

Table 1
Student Response Regarding University Response Following 9/11/01

			Student Age and Status as FT or PT Students					
			21-25 PT		26-over PT		26-over FT	
	Question from Survey		*N*	%	*N*	%	*N*	%
Q2	Did your school close on or around 9/11/01?	Yes	4	33	12	30	7	28
		No	2	16.8	13	32.5	12	48
		Not Sure	6	50	15	37.5	6	24

Connecting the Crisis to the Course and Class Discussion

Many students found it useful when instructors framed the event within the context of the course material. Table 2 illustrates that adult students reported 73% of their instructors utilized class time to discuss the attacks. One student commented on the instructor's response saying, "He understood that we needed to talk about the events and worked them into the class." Another student related discussion of the attacks to a subsequent course writing, "It was a valuable discussion, especially when I [then] had Islamic Culture class in November '01." A student also wrote that the instructor "put the attacks in context to what the class was learning—economics."

Overall, the qualitative data supported discussion of the events with students reporting, "It was very appropriate for the instructor to hold open discussion;" "It reflects the instructor's ability to handle risky class responses," and "I respected their opinions at that time very much." There was also strong opposition to instructors who did not allow class time for discussion or try to link the attacks to the course material. "Our…class was a waste of time and energy. The instructor expected everyone to maintain the original pace, but everyone in class was mentally absent," wrote one respondent. A related adult student response stated, "I believe we should have had time to discuss what was happening. Everything is not learned from a textbook." Also in support of discussion, an adult student remarked, "Because the school remained opened, it was important to use that time to discuss the current events in the world…it's the (professors) that just ignored it like their class was more important that bothered myself and others on campus."

Table 2
Student Response Regarding Class Discussion Following 9/11/01

			Student Age and Status as FT or PT Students					
	Question from Survey		21-25 PT		26-over PT		26-over FT	
Q14	In classes immediately following 9/11/01, did your instructor facilitate discussion about the attacks and/or aftermath?	Yes	11	92	29	73	16	64
		No	1	8	11	27	9	36

How Crisis Affects Learning

As shown in Table 3, approximately one-third (29%) of the adult students reported that it was more difficult to learn during the Fall 2001 semester. The majority of those students finding learning difficult during the Fall 2001 semester were 26 years of age or older (95%). Similarly, 31% reported that their study habits were worse during the Fall 2001 semester compared to previous semesters. Qualitatively, students reported the following in relation to how the crisis affected their learning: "modification to the syllabus was very helpful during the post 9/11 days;" "no one could believe we were in class getting a lecture on economics when it was clear no one was participating in the discussion;" "school work seemed quite insignificant in comparison to what we were dealing with as American citizens; and "more time and attention should have been devoted to how this might have affected students and teachers alike." However, some adult students reported that they did not need or seek special treatment in regards to a crisis event. For example, "[I] didn't feel I needed any extra coddling, so I didn't look for it." In regards to a lack of discussion about the events, a response reflected understanding in that, "the type of courses I was taking did not lend themselves to this type of discussion." Others found solace in their schoolwork: "The majority of the impact that 9/11 had on my studies was that my day job increased in responsibility 100% following 9/11. . . . Work was very, very busy and impacted my studies. School was an escape and a chance to discuss 9/11 with other students. Studying allowed my thoughts to go somewhere else besides the tragedy and helped me to move forward."

A particular student commented on his/her own positionality as an adult writing, "As an adult who has weathered many difficult times in life, I felt equipped to handle the tragedy in some way." The same student wrote that more discussion of the events would have been desirable but understood that because of the accelerated nature of the program it would have been difficult to arrange. The sentiment to maintain routine was echoed further, "Our daily lives needed to keep moving forward. It was good to have structure and a schedule." Others reported

detachment in their need for structure, for example, "As a student and a parent, I believe that unless you were personally affected by the tragic events of 9/11/01, the effects of that day were probably similar to when we hear of an earthquake in a foreign country—we are saddened, but 'life goes on.'" On the other side of the continuum, some students found opportunities to be self-reflective in linking the attacks to their learning: "I was taking a self-assessment course at the time, and it was very interesting to me to compare my results from assessments prior to 9/11 to my results after 9/11. . . . After 9/11 I definitely took a step back and reassessed what was going on around me, including my life and goals."

Table 3
Student Response Regarding Study Habits and Learning Following 9/11/01

			Student Age and Status as FT or PT Students					
			21-25 PT		26-over PT		26-over FT	
	Question from Survey		*N*	%	*N*	%	*N*	%
Q10	How would you rate your study habits during the Fall 2001 semester compared to previous semseters?	Same	8	67	26	65	16	64
		Better	2	17	1	2.5		
		Worse	2	17	13	32.5	9	36
Q11	How easy/difficult was it to learn new material in your classes compared to previous semesters?	Same	11	92	26	65	17	68
		Easier			1	2.5		
		Difficult	1	8	13	32.5	8	32

Discussion and Implications

The intent to discern adult learners' educational expectations and needs during times of terror has yielded intriguing results. The only way adult educators can truly modify and learn how to improve instruction and balance emotion in times of terror is to keenly understand the students' perspective. It is one thing for an instructor to interpret the students' reactions, entirely another to actually hear them firsthand. A review of literature revealed an absence of the adult learners' voice in relation to understanding their perspective. The findings of our research indicate that for every student who appreciates class time devoted to discussion, there was a student who wanted to adhere to the syllabus and maintain the course structure. Qualitative responses strongly indicate students' desire to hear instructors' opinions and to share their own with peers. However, other respondents were overwhelmed by the amount of time devoted to discussion or the opinions of the instructor. Such inconsistencies point to the diversity of the adult learners themselves. Some adult students balance school with work and family. Others may have few family obligations but many professional and community commitments. The age range further illustrates the diversity of the adult students varying from early 20's through late 60's. The literature reviewed revealed undergraduate students who longed for answers regarding why and how the tragedies occurred. The adult student responses gathered here revealed no such quests for meaning, but rather a resolute desire to either process the events or move past them. Although these findings do not provide concrete answers about how to handle every course with every type of student, there are lessons to be learned from this data and questions that require further investigation.

We can learn from the literature on past crisis situations such as natural disasters and other chaotic events that have affected college campuses. These historical events offer us

multiple strategies for addressing crises and the advice to try many different approaches. Because the literature does not include the voices of adult students, it is important that we do not discount their individual expectations. While some students will benefit from classroom discussion or relating a crisis event to course context, others may find this uncomfortable or a waste of time. Perhaps what this research illustrates best is the diverse needs of adult learners. Offer students the opportunity to opt out of discussion or to miss class if the situation affects them personally. Crisis situations may require higher levels of flexibility in terms of restructuring assignments or material to be covered. Providing students with options to complete their coursework as they juggle work, families, and school should yield a more positive learning experience.

Possibilities for furthering this research include asking whether or not students' fundamental assumptions have changed since 9/11/01. In other words, did the terrorist attacks cause people to become more mindful of themselves and/or others? What sorts of meaning-making processes have adults engaged in as a result of 9/11/01? What affect is the event continuing to have on our social consciousness? Are we more globally aware as a result of the attacks? Each of these questions merit exploration within the field of adult education. Within the responses to this research, students reported deep emotional experiences including self-evaluation and consideration of others. In terms of translating these questions to research, there is great potential within adult education to affect change and build a body of knowledge surrounding adult learners insights on teaching and learning during crises.

References

Artze, I. (2002). Enriching our schools after 9/11. *The Education Digest, 67*(8), 4-9.

Civic attitudes of students shift after Sept. 11. (2002, May/June). *American Teacher, 86*(8), 8.

Cox, A. M. (2001). The changed classroom, Post-September 11: Professors add to their courses and report that students are more engaged [Electronic version]. *The Chronicle of Higher Education, 48*(9), pp. A16-A18. Retrieved December 20, 2002, from http://chronicle.com/cgi2-bin/printable_verity.cgi

Erikson, B. (1995, September). It's not over yet [Electronic version]. *Case Currents*. Retrieved December 28, 2002, from http://www.case.org/currents/freebies/archived%20freebies/0995Erikson.cfm

Garbarino, J. (2002). Our response to the attack on America: What can it teach children about understanding and revenge? *Reclaiming Children and Youth, 10*(4), 194-195.

Kardia, D., Bierwert C., & Cook, C. E. (2002). Discussing the unfathomable: Classroom-based responses to tragedy. *Change, 34*(1), 18-22.

Lantieri, L. (2002). After 9/11: Addressing children's fears. *Principal, 81*(5), 35-36.

Palmer, P. (1998). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Sabo, S. R. (1995, September). When the unthinkable happens [Electronic version]. *Case Currents*. Retrieved December 28, 2002, from http://www.case.org/current/freebies/archived%20freebies/0995sabo.cfm

Schecter, D. S, Coates, S. W., & First, E. (2002) Observations of acute reactions of young children and their families to the World Trade Center attacks. *Zero to Three, 22*(3), 9-13.

Shellenbarger, S. (2001, September 19). In Cataclysmic Times, Workers Need Room to Rethink Priorities. *Wall Street Journal*, B1.

Refereed Paper: Amann

Tara L. Amann, Instructor, MBA Program, Mount St. Mary's College, Division of Continuing Studies, Knott Academic Center Room 307, Emmitsburg, Maryland 21727; (301)-447-5326 (W), (301)-797-6883 (H), FAX: (301)-447-5335; amann@msmary.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Healthcare and Adult Education: Magnet Hospitals as an Exemplar Continuing Education Setting for Nurses

Julie A. Beck

Because healthcare today faces a major nursing shortage (Nevidjon & Erickson, 2001; Peterson, 2001), different approaches to the care and recognition of nursing become of utmost importance to a traditional hospital's livelihood. There is a distinct need for the development of a workplace setting that facilitates ongoing learning and professional development. Some suggest the creation of a learning organization to achieve this goal. These ideal workplaces help meet the organization's needs and better serve those who render services from the organization (Senge, 1990; Watkins & Marsick, 1993). Magnet Hospitals appear to have many of the characteristics of a learning organization. Magnet Hospitals honor the needs and the aspirations of the learners, focusing upon the nurse, and they do not suffer from the nursing shortage experienced within traditional hospitals. It will be the purpose of this paper to examine Magnet Hospitals within the context of adult education and stress the various pieces of adult education literature that have an impact on these exemplar-nursing institutions.

First it will be important to define a Magnet Hospital. "Magnet Hospital" is a term that signifies an accredited institution that has proven itself as a model place of employment for nurses. According to the American Nurses Association (ANA), the Magnet Nursing Services Recognition Program for Excellence in Nursing Service is the "highest level of recognition that the American Nurses Credentialing Center (ANCC) can accord to organized nursing services in health care organizations" (ANCC, 2000, p. 13).

Magnet Hospitals were introduced in the early 1980s as institutions faced an increasing challenge to recruit and retain nurses in the face of a serious nursing shortage. Several hospitals were studied that did not appear to be affected by the nursing crunch, identifying similarities that seemed to be characteristic of these institutions: autonomy within clinical practice, status within the organization, collaboration, and nursing leadership (Scott, Sochalski, & Aiken, 1999). In short, a common characteristic to each of these hospitals is value of nursing to the organization Other characteristics that have been found to be in common among Magnet Hospitals include that the nurse has a visible power among the hospital executive committee as manifested by being a voting member on the hospital's Board of Directors, nursing departments are flat and decentralized, nursing decisions are supported by administration, and there is good communication between nurses and physicians (Aiken & Havens, 2000; Aiken, Havens, & Sloane, 2000; Coile, 1999; Havens & Aiken, 1999; Kramer, 1990; Laschinger & Havens, 1996; Laschinger, Shamian, & Thomson, 2001; Mason, 2000; Scott et al., 1999; Sovie, 1984). Things that typically inhibit the retention and recruitment of nurses within Traditional Hospital organizations are addressed by the standards put in place by the Magnet Hospital certification program.

Magnet Hospitals appear to be more supportive of their nursing staff compared to that of Traditional Hospital models, not simply because they recognize nursing excellence, but because

of their collaborative, decentralized organizational structure. There is an emphasis on education and support for nurse's ability to make clinical decisions noted in several of these descriptive, quantitative studies (Aiken et al., 2000; Havens & Aiken, 1999; Havens, 2001; Laschinger & Havens, 1996; Sovie, 1984). The flattened organizational structure style, the autonomy and empowerment that nurses have to perform their jobs, as well as the value placed on communication between levels of management helps to delineate what it means to be a Magnet Hospital (Havens, 2001; Havens & Aiken, 1999; Sovie, 1984).

Clearly the culture of these Magnet Hospitals demonstrates a value that promotes the autonomy and empowerment of the nursing staff. These hospitals promote nursing and support their clinical decision-making skills; these benefits include: valuing of nurse's opinions, lower rates of nurse burnout and higher levels of job satisfaction. Also, the community is made aware of the excellence in nursing services within the Magnet Hospital. This helps the marketability of the hospital while improving relations within the community it serves. Last, there are clinical benefits related to Magnet Institutions, such as improved quality patient care as evidenced by fewer needle sticks (Aiken & Havens, 2000).

Looking at the clinical outcomes and community awareness of Magnet Hospitals is certainly a worthwhile endeavor; I propose that there are inherent structural design issues that help make these Magnet Hospitals so desirable to the workers. Issues such as the collaborative style of management, the connected leadership, and improved communication between staff and managers are all inherent to a Magnet Hospital. It is these issues that help make the Magnet Hospitals able to better retain and recruit nursing staff and are very much influenced by the body of knowledge stemming from adult education and human resource development. These areas of literature are namely organizational culture and learning organizations.

There are numerous articles within the adult education realm as well as the human resource domain that specifically examine organizational culture. Such authors as Schein (1992), Hatch (1993), and Morgan (1997) have written extensively on the issues of organizational culture. Each of these authors uses a different lens to the term of organizational culture and helps shape some of the structure and desirable outcomes related to Magnet Hospitals.

Schein (1992) goes to great lengths to articulate and define the components of culture, stressing first the importance of leadership within organizational culture. Schein (1992) notes that a leader is more of a proactive player, while a manager appears more reactive. The manager in Schein's model seems to take a much more active role than a leader, as the manager's job is to shape the workers within the context of the work culture. The leaders seem to be more ethereal and more vision-oriented than the managers, while the managers appear to be more concerned with the day-to-day functioning of the organization. This is similarly seen within the Magnet Hospitals where the nursing administration are seen as the vision makers for the institutions while the bedside nurses are empowered patient care managers.

Hatch (1993) presents a more interactive model to organizational culture. Hatch proposes a new element known as symbols. Terms and definitions within Hatch's organizational culture stress that the process of organizational culture is a constantly changing one; the fact that action is taking place all of the time as the culture moves throughout these processes makes her model much more interactive than Schein. She identifies movement, both proactive and retroactive, between her terms of values, artifacts, symbols, and assumptions. This would certainly apply to healthcare and its changing dynamic. Magnet Hospitals are trying constantly

to improve themselves and the education of the staff to better meet the needs of the healthcare environment.

Morgan (1997) also discusses the impact of gender on organizational culture. Morgan illustrates how the corporate world has long been led by men and driven primarily by their value systems. The fact that many women are now infiltrating these male-dominated worlds has led to strong female subcultures that challenge the male power. This gender struggle can sometimes cause politicking to occur along gender lines. The female culture has similar traits that exhibit more "female" values such as empathy, intuition, and a more decentralized style of management. These "female" organizational traits are becoming more commonplace as organizations adapt and change toward a new "flat" network form found more frequently in the corporate world. As defined above, Magnet Hospitals certainly illustrate this more connected, decentralized management style. This management strategy is not uncommon in healthcare, but the success in retaining and recruiting new nurses for Magnet Hospitals is of noteworthy significance.

The culture of Magnet Hospitals has been contrasted to non-Magnet Hospitals, trying to ascertain what it is that makes the promotion of nursing so palpable. Havens (2001) reports a study in which there were three structural differences in the organization of nursing seen between comparison hospitals and ANCC Magnet Hospitals. These three differences included a separate department of nursing within the hospital's organizational structure, a doctorally prepared nurse researcher who facilitates staff research as well as supports the nurse executive in making decisions, and the nurse executive's perception of the nursing practice environment and control necessary to run the nursing department of the hospital. Havens also noted that there was much more organizational support for nurses within Magnet Hospitals and a sense of teamwork between disciplines (physicians, social work, physical therapy, etc.) was evident.

An article written by Coeling and Simms (1993) is one of the few articles that address a organizational culture and Magnet Hospitals. Coeling and Simms state "although culture is based on values, it manifests itself in behavior, in the ways people communicate and interact together" (p. 47). This concept seems to revert back to the Morgan (1997) chapter when he discusses the sociological influence on organizational culture. Coeling and Simms (1993) further relate that culture is not always evident to the casual observer. The culture of an organization is a pattern of behaviors that are unique to that group. They also state that while "group leaders have considerable influence over members, group members also have a significant impact on the culture" (p. 49). The authors state, finally, that culture can be both subtle and powerful at the same time, and stress the importance of flexibility and openness to a culture in order to be innovative.

Another article that addresses key Magnet Hospital organizational issues is that written by Havens and Aiken (1999). They claim that the 41 original Magnet Hospitals share a nurse executive that is a "formal member of the decision-making body of the hospital" (p. 15), a flat organizational structure for nursing services, decision making that was decentralized to the unit level, supportive administrative support regarding patient care decisions, and open communication between nurses and physicians. Shared governance models seem to be a common theme in these hospitals, allowing for the nurses of a particular unit to make decisions regarding patient care within their own area of expertise. This article elaborates about how Magnet institutions have superior outcomes as measured by mortality. They also examined that patient satisfaction was more positive in a magnet hospital than other institutions. Nurses also reflected that they had better job satisfaction via survey results and a safer work environment evidenced by fewer needle sticks.

Bradley (2000) addresses how hospitals must become more creative in providing a better organizational culture for nurses. Several of the issues Bradley illustrates are inherent with the Magnet Hospital standards. The strategies she points out are: assessing organizational policies, procedures, and structures; support new staff with preceptors; attain clinical competencies for all staff; provide autonomy for the staff nurse; and stress collaborative practice between education and the community to better recruit new staff. Bradley states that if these challenges are met, then the organizational culture within a hospital will be more positive and attract new staff.

The above articles refer to the organizational culture of a Magnet Hospital. They indicate that there are qualified benefits to a more collaborative approach to healthcare institutions than what was previously experienced in the "Traditional Hospital" model. The Magnet Hospital benefits are improved patient outcomes and nursing satisfaction. This nursing satisfaction becomes a critical issue for the retention and recruitment of nursing staff.

One aspect of job satisfaction is related to a collaborative hospital culture. Since Magnet Hospitals exhibit this type of a culture, they are inherently able to better retain and recruit nursing staff. Lanser (2001) proposes that nurses need to become more involved in the hospital decision-making process affecting organizational change. It is this shared, collaborative structure that will promote the organization's recruitment and retention efforts. Another suggested area of change offered to hospitals attempting to overcome the nursing shortage is to transition nurses into new settings through increased educational efforts. Creation of mentor programs and technical partner programs allow for new staff to have a resource on their floors to go to with questions. This not only builds the technical skills and knowledge of the new staff, it creates a better socialization process within the unit. Finally, Lanser discussed the importance of creating a skilled managerial culture that hires managers who best match the personality and needs of the staff for a particular area within the hospital. This personality matching develops a working relationship with staff that will hopefully retain and recruit more nurses. This managerial matching and rapport building is reiterated in another study by Schmidt (2002). She states that managers should work on the following areas for improved employee job satisfaction: self-control, conscientiousness, trustworthiness, social skills, and team building. These areas of self-improvement will assist in the recruitment and retention of nursing staff within nursing units. It is evident here, that proposals found in the current literature addressing the nursing shortage appear very similar to the descriptions found within the Magnet Hospital research.

Job satisfaction and empowering of the nursing staff becomes an imperative for hospital management within an ever-changing healthcare environment. This changing environment in order for the workers to have improved learning and a more amenable work culture is what Marsick and Watkins (1999) discuss in their literature regarding a learning organization. These authors point out that organizations constantly learn to improve themselves and have a greater need than ever to learn at a more rapid pace than ever before. Marsick and Watkins define learning as corporate strategy, not just a process to gain information. Learning helps involve organizational members, asks for feedback and reflection towards the end goal of an improved organizational system. This ever-changing workplace environment and adaptability to these changes leads one to examine Magnet Hospitals under a learning organization lens.

Various literature sources surround the term, learning organization. The term "learning organization" was coined and marketed by Senge (1990) in his book, *The Fifth Discipline*. Senge proposes this concept of a learning organization as an institution that holds learning of the organizational members as its central focus and mission. Senge suggests that there are certain organizations that succeed in business over some others, but the ones who hold learning at their

central mission core will tend to produce greater satisfaction and will outperform other companies in the end. These learning directed institutions are known as learning organizations.

Learning organizations have threads that are similar to the Magnet Hospital themes. Within learning organizations there is an importance on collaboration and communication. There is also the common theme of a decentralized organizational structure that allows for communication to flow in and out of intersecting systems. Also seen within learning organizations is the need for strong leadership that promotes a sharing of the organizational vision among all team members. It is these common threads that allow for superior organizational outcomes that can be measured by total quality standards and products.

These commonalities seen within Magnet Hospitals are revealed within the application process and standards for the accreditation. ANCC (2000) states that the outcomes for attaining Magnet Hospital status include "enhance[d] recruitment and retention of highly qualified professional nurses, thus facilitating consistent delivery of quality patient care" (p. 14). Other benefits stated by the ANCC (2000) include enhanced recognition for professional nursing services within the community, increased utilization of the Magnet health care agency, increased stability in patient care systems within the organization, and the creation of an efficiently structured environment which is highly collaborative, contains an influential nurse administrator, and uses unit-based problem solving and decision-making processes which result in greater autonomy at the bedside. It is these outcomes that have been studied extensively within the Magnet Hospital literature.

As briefly seen here, Magnet Hospitals have some interesting overlaps within the literature of adult education and human resource development. Magnet Hospitals appear to be designed and implement various concepts gleaned from the adult education and human resource literature. There is however, a dearth of information that bridges these areas directly. It will be important in the future to further examine Magnet Hospitals within the context of both of these adult education areas to learn more about their success and how they are implemented to make a Magnet Hospital an exemplar institution for nurses in the workplace.

References

Aiken, L. H., & Havens, D. S. (2000). The magnet nursing services recognition program: A comparison of two groups of magnet hospitals. *American Journal of Nursing, 100*, 26-35.

Aiken, L., Havens, D. S., & Sloane, D. M. (2000). The magnet nursing services recognition program: A comparison of successful applicants with reputational magnet hospitals. *American Journal of Nursing, 100,* 26-35, and *Nursing Standard, 14,* 41-47.

American Nurses Credentialing Center, (2000). *The magnet nursing services recognition program: Health care organization instructions and application process.* Washington, DC: Author.

Bradley, C. (2000). "Hospitable" hospitals. *Nursing Management, 31*, 25.

Coeling, H., & Simms, L. M. (1993). Facilitating innovation at the nursing unit level through cultural assessment, Part 1: How to keep management ideas from falling on deaf ears. *Journal of Nursing Administration, 23*, 46-53.

Coile, R. (1999). Magnet Hospital: Ten strategies to becoming a model nursing employer. *Health Trends, 11*, 8-12.

Hatch, M. J. (1993). The dynamics of organizational culture. *Academy of Management Review, 18*, 657-693.

Havens, D. S., & Aiken, L. H. (1999). Shaping systems to promote desired outcomes: The magnet hospital model. *Journal of Nursing Administration, 29*, 14-20.

Kramer, M. (1990). The magnet hospitals: Excellence revisited. *The Journal of Nursing Administration, 20*, 35-44.

Lanser, E. (2001). A model workplace: Creating an effective nursing environment. *Healthcare Executive, 16*, 6-11.

Laschinger, H., & Havens, S. (1996). Staff nurse empowerment and perceived control over nursing practice: Conditions for work effectiveness. *Journal of Nursing Administration, 26*, 27-35.

Laschinger, H. K. S., Shamian, J., & Thomson, D. (2001). Impact of magnet hospital characteristics on nurses' perceptions of trust, burnout, quality of care, and work satisfaction. *Nursing Economics, 19*, 209-219.

Marsick, V. & Watkins, K. (1999). *Facilitating learning organizations*. Brookfield, VT: Gower.

Mason, D. J. (2000). Nursing's best kept secret. *American Journal of Nursing, 100*, 7.

Morgan, G. (1997). *Images of organization* (2nd Ed). Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Nevidjon, B., & Erickson, J. I. (2001). The nursing shortage: Solutions for the short and long term. *Online Journal of Issues in Nursing, 6*. Retrieved February 12, 2001, from http://www.ana.org/ojin/topic14/tpc14_4.htm

Schein, E. H. (1992). *Organizational culture and leadership* (2nd Ed). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Scott, J. G., Sochalski, J., & Aiken, L. (1999). Review of magnet hospital research: Findings and implications for professional nursing practice. *Journal of Nursing Administration, 29*, 9-19.

Senge, P. (1990). *The fifth discipline*. New York: Doubleday.

Sovie, M. (1984). The economics of magnetism. *Nursing Economics, 2*, 85-92.

Watkins, K., & Marsick, V. J. (1993). *Sculpting the learning organization*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Julie A. Beck, RN, MSN, Adjunct Faculty, York College of Pennsylvania, York, PA 17405-7199; (717) 815-1243; < beck@blazenet.net >. Julie is a D.Ed candidate, The Pennsylvania Sate University, Harrisburg Campus.

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Effectiveness of Workplace Diversity Training: A Review of the Empirical Literature

Thomas V. Bettinger

Abstract: This paper reports on the state of the literature evaluating the effectiveness of diversity training conducted in the workplace and argues that diversity knowledge and skills are essential for adult educators.

Introduction

Issues surrounding diversity and multiculturalism are becoming more prevalent in society. This is often reflected in the media through television, movies, and the popular press; increasingly, it has become a potent factor in corporate America as well. According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics (Toossi, 2002), massive demographic, social, and political changes in the population over the past few decades have dramatically impacted the labor force, and will continue to do so well into this century. A striking example of the dynamic nature and rapid pace of diversification in the U. S. labor force is an increase of foreign-born workers from 1 in 17 in 1960 to 1 in 8 today (Mosisa, 2002).

Whether for altruistic, legal, or economic reasons, America's organizations have embraced the concept of diversity training. The rate of companies offering workplace diversity training programs rose from 40% in 1992 to 50-56% in 1996 (Kerka, 1998). Indeed, of the broad range of corporate diversity initiatives, training is one of the most widely used strategies (Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). Yet, despite the burgeoning diversity training industry, considerable misunderstanding and tension exists between members of various groups in the workplace (Thomas, 1994). Furthermore, corporate efforts to increase workplace sensitivity to diversity issues can at times arouse hostility (Von Bergen, Soper, & Foster, 2002).

No single approach applies to all workplace diversity training. Most diversity training lasts one day or less (Rynes & Rosen, 1995), and is often conducted in a workshop format (Rouse, 2001). However, diversity training varies widely (e.g., goals, design, format) due to the diversity issues of a given company (Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). Given significant resource investments in diversity training--and the potential for negative outcomes--it seems prudent to learn from previous training efforts and capitalize on those factors that have been shown to be effective. Therefore, the purpose of this review is to critique the empirical research regarding the effectiveness of workplace diversity training. Specifically, some questions of interest are: Do diversity training programs make a difference? What program characteristics make some workplace diversity training programs more successful than others? How is the effectiveness of workplace diversity training determined and measured? Are some training techniques more efficacious than others? Finally, have the positionalities (race, gender, sexual orientation, etc.) of the trainers been considered as variables potentially impacting the effectiveness of such training?

The issue of diversity training effectiveness is very relevant to adult education. Issues of equity and diversity are an inextricable component in the history of adult education, and continue as such today (Baumgartner & Merriam, 2000). By increasing awareness of diversity issues and deepening understanding of those components of diversity training more likely to be effective, this literature review affords adult educators an opportunity to create learning environments which foster an understanding and appreciation of the unique aspects and contributions of each individual. In doing so, learners will be better prepared to succeed in diverse groups not only in the workplace, but in society in general.

Organization of the Literature Review

This section of the review discusses definitions of diversity, types of diversity training, and the methodology for conducting the review.

Defining Diversity

Much diversity literature addresses *diversity management*, a nebulous concept that encompasses all of a company's diversity activities including diversity training. However, even defining diversity is problematic. In essence, diversity is the acknowledgement of differences among people, but definitions of diversity abound in the literature. Some are very narrow and focus on gender and race; while others are very broad and may include any number of factors including ethnicity, disability, sexual orientation, age, marital status, personality traits, national origin, religion, and so forth. There is a distinct trend towards broad definitions in both the literature and in organizations (Egan, 2001). Yet the actual communications and practices of many organizations often focus on other diversity management efforts such as Equal Employment Opportunity; so companies may be saying one thing, but doing another (Gordon, 1995; Thomas, 1994). Thus, a common and shared understanding of diversity remains elusive.

Types of Workplace Diversity Training

Organizations vary in their needs, goals, and interests; thus, an organization should strive to implement those strategies deemed most appropriate for its requirements (Rynes & Rosen, 1995; Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). The major goals of diversity training are to enhance personal effectiveness and to increase organizational effectiveness; and the most common types of diversity training are (a) awareness-based, (b) skill-based, and (c) integration with other types of training such as management development and team building. These may overlap and not all programs include even all of these basic types (Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). Some researchers are critical of diversity programs that are solely awareness-based (Karp & Sutton, 1993). Rynes and Rosen (1995) point out that diversity training is often designed around an implicit assumption that the major difficulty to be overcome is lack of participant awareness or sensitivity; yet it is equally plausible that individuals are well aware of both self-biases and differences in perspective, but don't know what to do about them in specific situations—hence the need for skills-based training. Burkart (1999) also challenges the assumption that people will change behavior once they understand others have different worldviews. He advocates including issues of power and privilege, and stresses the training must be iterative and reinforced over time to permanently change the organizational culture.

Methodology of the Review

The criteria for selecting literature for this review were (a) a focus on workplace diversity training, (b) measurement or evaluation of outcomes, and (c) an empirical basis. Multiple databases and various keywords were utilized. Secondary sources were also reviewed. Other than one doctoral dissertation obtained from a publicly available university website, only published works were included. One comprehensive literature review on diversity in the workplace was located (Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). While its main focus was not diversity training or its evaluation, it was useful in framing many issues involved with diversity training including perceived benefits; types of diversity training; recommendations for an effective training program; and qualifications of a successful diversity trainer. This process resulted in a considerable number of articles from various disciplines; however, only five research studies were assessed as meeting the criteria for inclusion in this review.

Findings

This review confirms that empirical research on workplace diversity training is extremely sparse (Gordon, 1995; Kerka, 1998). Five empirical studies focusing on the measurement or evaluation of workplace diversity training were located. Each included a quantitative analysis. None were longitudinal assessments. Three were conducted to assess specific instances of workplace diversity training, each of which was workshop-based and lasted no more than three days. Another was conducted as part of a larger examination of diversity practices and experiences in U.S. organizations, and looked at only one measure--an overall, subjective assessment of diversity training effectiveness. The primary goal of the fifth study was to validate an assessment instrument; all participants had undergone diversity training, but their training experiences were not necessarily similar or consistent. The primary data collection methods in these studies were surveys and questionnaires. Only two studies included specific details on instrumentation. Only one study included pre- test data in the data analysis. Collection of post-test data was inconsistent across studies (e.g., telephone contact, mailed surveys). Overall, participants were mostly supervisory or managerial personnel, although the settings were varied.

In sum, these studies varied greatly in methodological approaches, and no concerted attempt at replicating previous research was noted. Imprecise definitions and inconsistent program components complicate any attempt for an in-depth thematic analysis. Nonetheless, comparing and contrasting the studies highlights salient aspects of each that deepen understanding of issues surrounding workplace diversity training. These findings are organized around themes of disparate program design, significant results, and limitations.

Disparate Diversity Training Program Design

Only three of the studies were intended to measure outcomes of specific diversity training efforts. Tan, Morris, and Romero (1996) reported on a series of 40 three-day workshops for 739 managers and supervisors. The term diversity, as used in the study, was not defined per se. A given workshop consisted of all or some subset of 13 segments of training comprised of simulations, case scenarios, and discussions. A needs assessment process—acknowledged but not described—apparently was the basis for determining which segments would be included in a particular workshop. The trainers for each workshop included a female and a male, but no further characteristics were identified. The program assessed by Hanover and Cellar (1998) also was based on an unspecified needs assessment, and included presentations, videotapes, case

studies, simulations, group discussions, and individual work. No mention was made of either trainer characteristics or training duration. Each workshop included "a few women and people of color from lower levels in the organization . . . to introduce racial and ethnic diversity into an almost exclusively white male group" (p. 110); however, the research focused exclusively on the middle managers. In the third of the studies evaluating specific diversity training programs, Rouse (2001) narrows the research focus to race, gender, and ethnicity. Study participation was voluntary and participants were primarily middle managers who attended workshops conducted by the president of a consulting firm, described as "a young Hispanic male" (p. 54). A booklet is the primary learning material, and was supplemented by discussion, videos, and scenarios. The training differs very little from company to company, and thus, apparently is not informed by a needs assessment of a given organization.

The remaining two studies included in the review did not identify specific aspects of the associated diversity training programs. One was geared primarily to developing an instrument to measure the impacts of diversity training on perceptions and attitudes (De Meuse & Hostager, 2001). Their Reaction-to-Diversity (R-T-D) Inventory consists of 70 words, each of which depicts a positive or negative response to diversity. It is intended to assess diversity efforts in general--regardless of the specific attributes or characteristics of a given program. Rynes and Rosen (1995) collected data on a single measure—a subjective holistic assessment of sustained diversity training success as perceived by 785 human resource professionals. Even from these few empirical studies, it is apparent that diversity training programs vary considerably; thus confirming what others have reported (Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997).

Significant Results

All of the studies reported statistically significant results including (a) participants' attitudes, perceptions, and knowledge relating to diversity issues; barriers to change; effects of stereotypes and prejudices in the workplace; and a readiness to value diversity (Tan, Morris, & Romero, 1996); (b) perceptions of behavior, and the importance assigned to diversity practices (Hanover and Cellar, 1998); and (c) changes in knowledge and behavior (Rouse, 2001). Rouse also reported that Blacks had a much lower mean score on self-assessed learning than did Hispanics and that organizational support was strongly correlated with self-assessed learning and satisfaction with the learning itself. This latter finding led Rouse to speculate that organizational culture plays a large role in participants' response to training.

Both personal and organizational aspects of diversity training were of interest to De Meuse and Hostager (1998) as well. They generated a five dimensional framework for representing the range of positive and negative reactions to work place diversity as follows: (a) emotional reactions, (b) judgments, (c) behavioral reactions, (d) personal consequences, and (e) organizational outcomes. Use of their R-T-D Inventory in several organizational settings found that individual reactions to diversity follow a normal bell shaped curve distribution. Managers tended to reflect less extreme range of views on workplace diversity than did employees—in both positive and negative directions. In part, this led the authors to contend that a strong, positive corporate culture might serve as a viable substitute for diversity training; and that training efforts may fail unless located in such a culture. The critical nature of organization influences was also borne out by Rynes and Rosen (1995). They found that both the adoption of a training program and the perceived success of diversity training were strongly associated with top management support—so much so that the authors suggested that "top managers' values and beliefs are much more important than their gender, race, or ethnicity" (p. 263). Perceived

success was also strongly correlated with mandatory attendance for managers, explicit managerial rewards for increasing diversity, inclusive definitions of diversity, and long-term evaluation of training results. Factors not found to be statistically significant include mandatory attendance of non-supervisory personnel; increased proportions of training budgets geared to diversity; longer or more comprehensive programs; and immediate short-term program evaluation. This study, the only one that sought to address sustained results of workplace diversity training, yielded mixed perceptions on the success of diversity training. Approximately 50% described the training as having either neutral or mixed effects; 18% reported largely or extremely ineffective effects; and the remainder reported quite or extremely successful results. Overall, male respondents perceived diversity programs to be less successful than did female respondents.

Limitations of the Research

Issues of inconsistency in both terminology and program design have already been raised. Researchers varied in their descriptions, but in each case, more information on characteristics of both the trainers and the learning participants would have been useful. The absence of such information renders any determination of correlation virtually impossible. Similarly, selection of participants and whether attendance was mandatory are salient factors for consideration, and ones that were not well addressed in these studies. Additionally, other factors seriously constrain the generalizability of these studies. Foremost among these are the almost total reliance on self-report measures, and the predominance of managers and supervisors as participants in the studies. Each of these potentially introduces bias, particularly due to the risk of social desirability (answering in such a way as to please the researcher or to raise one's acceptance).

Discussion

Numerous authors lament the dire lack of empirical studies of the effectiveness of workplace diversity training, and calls for such research are frequent (Egan, 2001; Gordon, 1995; Rynes & Rosen, 1995; Tan, Morris, & Romero, 1996; Wentling & Palma-Rivas, 1997). Even so, it was striking to locate so few such studies. Furthermore, the research included in this review paid scant attention to aspects of program design; characteristics of trainers and training participants and how they were selected for training; and specific training activities utilized. Thus, the influence of these factors on training outcomes remains largely unaddressed; and several of the questions underlying this review must await further research.

Issues related to diversity are not likely to disappear any time soon. Continued research in this area will aid not only those interested in improving workplace dynamics and efficiencies, but also those who strive to create environments that value diversity in general. Replication of studies undertaken in other settings (e.g., universities) could offer new insights and implications if conducted in corporate settings. A review of various scales, assessments, and other tools that might be of use in evaluating diversity training could prove to be a great contribution. As diversity training becomes more integrated with other workplace training, diversity knowledge and skills will be essential to plan, execute, and evaluate virtually any adult education program. Additionally, adult educators will need a deep understanding of their own attitudes and the ethical implications of their practice regarding diversity. Those responsible for the education of future adult educators would do well to incorporate such issues and concerns as a vital component of any adult education course of studies.

References

Baumgartner, L., & Merriam, S. B. (Eds.). (2000). *Adult learning and development: Multicultural stories*. Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Burkart, M. (1999, Fall). The role of training in advancing a diversity initiative. *The Diversity Factor,* 2-5.

De Meuse, K. P., & Hostager, T. J. (2001). Developing an instrument for measuring attitudes toward and perceptions of workplace diversity: An initial report. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 12*(1), 33-51.

Egan, T. M. (2001). *Challenges in measuring and evaluating diversity efforts in Human Resource Development.* Paper presented at the 2001 Academy of Human Resource Development Conference, Tulsa, Oklahoma. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED453449)

Gordon, J. (1995). Different from what? Diversity as a performance issue. *Training, 32*(5), 25-34.

Hanover, J. M. B., & Cellar, D. F. (1998). Environmental factors and the effectiveness of workforce diversity training. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 9*(2), 105-124.

Karp, H. B., & Sutton, N. (1993). Where diversity training goes wrong. *Training, 30*(7), 30-34.

Kerka, S. (1998). *Diversity training.* Columbus, OH: ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED417292)

Mosisa, A. (2002, May). The role of foreign-born workers in the U.S. economy. *Monthly Labor Review, 125*(5). Retrieved September 19, 2002, from http://www.bls.gov/opub/mlr/2002/05/art1.exc.htm

Rouse, D. E. (2001). *An investigation of the outcomes of short-term diversity training.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Georgia, Athens.

Rynes, S., & Rosen, B. (1995). A field survey of factors affecting the adoption and perceived success of diversity training. *Personnel Psychology, 48*, 247-270.

Tan, D. L., Morris, L., & Romero, J. (1996). Changes in attitude after diversity training. *Training & Development, 50*(9), 54-55.

Thomas, V. C. (1994). The downside of diversity. *Training & Development, 48*(1), 60-62.

Toossi, M. (2002, May). A century of change: The U.S. labor force, 1950-2050. *Monthly Labor Review, 125*(5), 15-28. Retrieved September 19, 2002, from http://www.bls.gov/opub/mbr/2002/05/

Von Bergen, C. W., Soper, B., & Foster, T. (2002). Unintended negative effects of diversity management. *Public Personnel Management, 31*, 239-251.

Wentling, R. M., & Palma-Rivas, N. (1997). *Diversity in the workforce: A literature review.* Berkeley, CA: University of California at Berkeley, National Center for Research in Vocational Education.

Wentling, R. M., & Palma-Rivas, N. (2000). Current status of diversity initiatives in selected multinational corporations. Human Resource Development Quarterly, 11(1), 35-60.

Thomas V. Bettinger, The Pennsylvania State University, c/o Adult Education Program, 777 West Harrisburg Pike, Middletown, PA 17057; 717/545-9285 (H); 717/770-5802 (W); tvb104@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

A Synthesis of Empirical Literature: In Distance Education What Is the Relationship Between Asynchronous Computer-Mediated Communication and the Adult Learning Process?

Linda M. Black

Abstract: This meta-research study analyzes and synthesizes in a descriptive narrative the findings of 45 empirical research studies which report adult learning outcomes (categorized as affective, cognitive, and social) associated with distance learning, when the means of communication is asynchronous computer-mediated communication (CMC). The synthesis substantiates there is a relationship between learning outcomes and the online asynchronous communication process. My intent is for this review to spark interest in further empirical research (conceptually and theoretically grounded and methodologically sound) that examines the connections between distance learning via asynchronous CMC and the adult learning process.

Background and Research Purpose

In distance education, conceived of as "planned learning that normally occurs in a different place from teaching and as a result requires special techniques of course design, special instructional techniques, special methods of communication by electronic and other technology, as well as special organizational and administrative arrangements" (Moore & Kearsley, 1996, p. 2), the communication process was revolutionized about fifteen years ago by adding computers and electronic networks to distance learning delivery. Computer-mediated communication (CMC), which separates users by space and time, can be asynchronous, where users communicate from/to different locations at different times and where the feedback is not immediate, or synchronous, where users communicate from/to different locations at the same time and where feedback is more immediate. With asynchronous CMC which is primarily text-based, we do not have the physical face-to-face (FTF) contact and interaction of the traditional classroom. Some perceive this to be a problem. And popular opinion suggests this type communication is somewhat "less than." The question many ask is: What difference, if any, does this make with respect to learning?

The result is that CMC-based distance education has generated many questions and has attracted a considerable amount of scholarly research. There is an abundant amount of information pertaining to the process of CMC, especially of an asynchronous nature. But much of the information is of a self-reported anecdotal nature, with fewer study findings based on empirically rigorous research methods. In addition, little synthesis of what we know about CMC and its relationship to the adult learning process, based on the empirical findings that exist, has been attempted. Therefore, this literature review investigates the overall question: Based on what we empirically know, what is the relationship between asynchronous CMC and the adult learning process? In other words, what kinds of learning outcomes (affective, cognitive, and social) are associated with distance learning, when the means of communication is asynchronous

CMC? Of importance, too, the study's descriptive narrative illuminates a number of things those who teach via asynchronous CMC might do to improve their practice.

Research Methods

This meta-research study (research on research) synthesizes the findings of 45 empirical research studies that address asynchronous CMC as well as adult learning. The studies (based on the criteria that empirical research methods were applied) were selected from the past 14 years of *The American Journal of Distance Education*; the proceedings of The Wisconsin Distance Teaching and Learning Conferences, 1996-2001; various readings and monographs published by The American Center for the Study of Distance Education; all issues of the *Journal of Asynchronous Learning*, 1997-2001; and more than one hundred online dissertation abstracts, 1996-2001. Articles and dissertation abstracts were read in entirety. The findings of the studies first were analyzed for concepts, theories, and findings pertaining to CMC and adult learning. Then categories were identified and the learning outcomes were grouped under the categories --- affective (growth in feeling, emotion, values, appreciation, enthusiasm, motivation, and attitude); cognitive (development growth of knowledge, intellectual abilities); and social (reciprocal interactions between people). Finally, a narrative synthesis was written to depict what is known about CMC, as it relates to adult learning processes and/or outcomes.

Findings

Affective: Learner Satisfaction

Satisfaction (a concept that is not clearly defined in the literature) is generally high, if social presence; "the degree to which a person is perceived to be a 'real person,'" (Gunawardena & Zittle, 1997, p. 9); the ability to express feelings (Phillips & Pease, 1987); and feedback from the instructor, teaching-assistant, or peer-learners is high (Lauzon, 1992; Picciano, 1998). Frequent feedback means some learners feel less isolated (Phillips & Pease, 1987; Winer, Chomienne, & Vazquez-Abad, 2000) and even emotionally and spiritually supported (Schrum & Benson, 2000). Because dispositional characteristics which when seen face-to-face lead to discrimination are invisible, some learners are not inhibited as they are face-to-face (Gayol, 1995). This leads to feelings of satisfaction. For other learners, moving "from feeling like outsiders to feeling like insiders" (Wegerif, 1998, p. 1) in the collaborative group contributes to feelings of satisfaction.

The nature of the learning activities themselves relates to learner satisfaction, too. Some find satisfaction with courses in which they learn computer technology (Lauzon, 1992), that are performance-based (Wegner, Holloway, & Garton, 1999), that require group work (Phillips & Pease, 1988), and that apply collaborative learning (Lopez-Islas, 2000; Wegerif, 1998). Course design factors that translate into satisfaction include: easy-access to courses, thorough and holistic content, and well-organized course structure and management (Buchanan, 1999). CMC contributes indirectly to adult learner satisfaction by its flexibility in supporting both genders and many learning styles (Blum, 1999b; Ory (1997); by accommodating various backgrounds and interests (Merrill, 2000); by providing an equal opportunity to participate (Gunawardena & Zittle, 1997); and by providing a positive, caring, non-threatening learning environment (Merrill, 2000).

Affective: Learner Dissatisfaction

When learning activities are group-based, dispositional and situational characteristics such as lack of confidence, feelings of failure, lack of access and/or time, and lack of experience with facilitating or learning in groups sometimes translate into learners feeling dissatisfied with computer-mediated learning (Wegerif, 1998). Just as the social aspect contributes to satisfaction it feeds into dissatisfaction. Lack of prompt feedback (Hara & Kling, 1999), feelings of loneliness (Phillips & Pease, 1987), perceived difficulty communicating with those peer learners do not know well (Curtis & Lawson, 2001), fear of expressing opposing views in discussion forums, and the formation of active cliques breed learner dissatisfaction (Phillips & Pease, 1987). Continuing, a number of other facets of the learning activities, course design, and course management lead to learner dissatisfaction. Learners report dissatisfaction with activities that fail to provide simulations and real-world roles (Phillips & Pease, 1987), with ambiguous instructions, with the sheer volume (Hara & Kling, 1999) of and length of discussion posts, and heavy time requirements (Phillips & Pease, 1987). Dissatisfaction also stems from instructors failing to manage well the communication process (Curtis & Lawson, 2001) and group projects, with imbalanced group project workloads (Lopez-Islas, 2000).

Since research indicates that some learners like speaking up and others do not (Picciano, 1998), smart design would encourage, not require, discussion participation, especially for shy, reserved learners (Gunawardena & Zittle, 1997). This suggests these shy, reserved students need to be able to "lurk" (read, reflect-on, and learn without making oneself visible in an online discussion) without being forced to participate, if they are to feel satisfied instead of dissatisfied.

Affective: Learner Empowerment

Some learners feel empowered because of a perceived equal opportunity to participate in CMC discussions. Those afforded equal opportunity to participate who might not receive an equal opportunity face-to-face include the typically invisible, whoever they might be, in a face-to-face classroom (Buchanan, 1999); shy students (Hillman, 1999); those who are discriminated against and/or are inhibited for whatever reasons (Gayol, 1995); and other ethnic groups who all too often remain in the background (Lopez-Islas, 2000). Findings suggest learners are empowered in indirect ways: by assuming the responsibility of new roles in which they become both teacher and learner (Picciano, 1998), by having the choice of interacting more with other learners than with instructors and/or student moderators (Murphy et al., 1996), and by having the freedom to communicate with and relate to individuals as individuals and not just the group (McDonald, 1998).

Cognitive: Focus on Ideas

Just as social presence can be established and can influence learner satisfaction-dissatisfaction, cognitive presence (defined as the critical practice of inquiry, Garrison, Anderson, & Archer, 2001) can be established in CMC. As learning progresses, the process of communication via CMC becomes increasingly more cognitive and less social, with interpersonal communications decreasing over time (McDonald, 1996; McDonald & Gibson, 1998) with peer referencing decreasing and text referencing increasing (Beatty & Bonk, 2001). This means that ideas (Gayol, 1995; Gibson, 1996; McDonald, 1998; McDonald & Gibson, 1998; Tengler & Sledge, 1998), especially given all learning activities are cognitively "on-task" rather than social (Curtis & Lawson, 2001), are the focus of the learning process.

Cognitive: Supportive of Reflective Thinking

A process of reflective thinking is supported by asynchronous CMC for a variety of reasons. These include: continual sustainable communication (Hislop, 2000; Parker & Gemino, 2001; Taylor, 2001), time for reflection and thinking (Aviv, 2000; Gayol, 1995; Gibson, 1996; Kumari, 2001; Picciano, 1998; Rossman, 1999; Taylor, 2001; Vrasidas & McIsaac, 1999), ideas that can be recorded and stored and reflected on by the whole community (Gayol, 1995), learner control of learning (Shaw & Pieter, 2000), instructor and/or tutor and/or teaching assistant accessibility, and the rich opportunity to prepare well their contributions to discussions (Rossman, 1999).

Cognitive: Facilitative of High-Level (also known as "Deep") Thinking

CMC facilitates learning that results in learners progressing from rote learning to increased problem-solving ability (Tengler & Sledge, 1998), in learners developing high-level reasoning skills (Gibson, 1996; Shapley, 2000), and in developing high-level (deep) thinking (Aviv, 2000; Beatty & Bonk, 2001; Gayol, 1995; Gibson, 1996; Hiltz, Coppola, Rotter, Turoff, & Benbunan-Fich, 2000; Parker & Gemino, 2001; Shapley, 2000). Developing high-level ("deep") thinking depends on reflection time (Aviv, 2000), increased interactivity inherent in continual discussions (Gayol, 1995; Parker & Gemino, 2001), on an active engagement with the learning process (Shapley, 2000), and on effective group collaborative and a cognitively and socially constructive learning process (Aviv, 2000; Gibson, 1996; Hiltz et al., 2000).

Social: Social Activities--Key to Dialog, Community, and "Deep" Thinking

Though ideas are the heart of learning in asynchronous CMC, with "on-task" learning activities key to communicating ideas and building on them, "off-task" social activities have significance, too. In fact, researchers Curtis and Lawson (2001) concluded the "off-task" learning activities are the means to establishing necessary social interaction, which appears to be requisite for initiating dialog and building a communicative community. This suggests that without "off-task" activities, there would be no "on-task" activities. This implies that all activities might be considered important and "on-task," if effective communication is to take place and learning is to occur. Of importance, one study substantiates that social cues were consistent throughout the learning process, with the cues making all the difference in initiating and sustaining "deep" thinking (Beatty & Bonk, 2001).

Social: High Participation in Discussions

Two studies indicate that all learners who enrolled participated in the CMC discussions: that is, nobody "lurked" (Buchanan, 1999; Curtis & Lawson, 2001); everybody had "voice." Not only do dialogic relationships develop (Gayol, 1995), but in some cases more dialog develops than one might expect (Beatty & Bonk, 2001; Buchanan, 1999; Kumari, 2001), sometimes sustaining itself at a constant level (McDonald, 1996). Other times participation is heavy at the beginning of the week but declines dramatically over a weekend (Lopez-Islas, 2000). Sometimes participation is greater with one discussion leader than another (Kumari, 2001). One study reports if course expectations with respect to discussion participation are specific and participation is graded, then students will participate at a high level (Lopez-Islas, 2000).

Social: Non-Participation in Discussions

Of importance, if too many learners "lurk" rather than participate, conversations will be initiated, but overall discussion participation might be low (Hegngi, 1997), decline over time (Phillips & Pease, 1987), or even stop (Hislop, 2000). Some learners do not participate at all (Kumari, 2001), or at least not on the weekends (Lopez-Islas, 2000). One study relates non-participation to dispositional and situational barriers, which reportedly are higher for females than males (Blum, 1999a; 1999b). Studies suggest for discussion participation to be high, it must be designed as integral to the course itself (Phelps, Wells, Ashworth, & Hahn, 1991); in addition, if explicit, detailed directions are not provided on what to expect and how to participate, participation will be low (Bickel, 1999; Lopez-Islas, 2000).

Blended (Affective, Cognitive, Social): Socially Constructed Knowledge

As stated, although ideas become the focus of a computer-mediated adult learning process, social interactions, "the process consisting of the reciprocal actions of two or more actors within a given context," (Vrasidas & McIsaac, 1999, p. 25) matter, too. With CMC they are especially important in the form of learner-learner interaction (Buchanan, 1999; Gayol, 1995; Kumari, 2001; Lauzon, 1992; McDonald, 1998; McDonald & Gibson, 1998; Rossman, 1999; Shapley, 2000; Sorg, 2000; Vrasidas & McIsaac, 1999). (The importance of this is that the communication that takes place in distance education via other delivery mechanisms such as print-based correspondence or audio- and video-teleconferences often builds on instructor-student more than learner-learner interaction.) Social interactions are important in terms of social integration (Gayol, 1995; McDonald, 1996; McDonald & Gibson, 1998) and social interdependence (Aviv, 2000; Curtis & Lawson, 2001; McDonald, 1996; McDonald & Gibson, 1998), which relate directly to whether or not individual knowledge has the potential to merge.

One seminal study (Gunawardena, Lowe, & Anderson, 1998) developed an interaction analysis model to examine the social construction of knowledge in CMC. Findings indicated the "group" of student participants, from within, pulled everybody toward compromise and resolution, that is, they socially constructed a common body of knowledge regarding the topic being debated. The researchers consequentially defined interaction as "the process through which negotiation of meaning and co-creation of knowledge occurs in a constructivist learning environment" (p. 141). Research suggests the affection, inclusion, and solidarity of the group (Curtis & Lawson, 2001; McDonald, 1996; McDonald & Gibson, 1998); the expression and synthesis of multiple viewpoints (Lopez-Islas, 2000), with no one student dominating (Kumari, 2001), are important in the social construction of knowledge.

Blended (Affective, Cognitive, Social): Group-based Learning Communities Emerge

As early as 1991 a study (Cheng, Lehman, & Armstrong, 1991) reported a higher completion rate for computer-mediated learners who worked collaboratively (90%) in joint study sessions than for those learners who worked independently (22%). The results of this study suggest collaboration may be an important element in computer-mediated distance learning. Even before the Web impacted CMC (with the Web's communication tools making it easier for learners to interact with one another), students were interested in developing friendships and a network of colleagues (Phillips & Pease, 1987). Other findings point to the importance of collaborative learning as part of the CMC learning process (Holland, 2000; Murphy et al., 1996; Vrasidas & McIsaac, 1999), with evidence that computer-mediated groups develop in much the same way they do in a face-to-face classroom (Curtis & Lawson, 2001; McDonald, 1996;

McDonald & Gibson, 1998). Conceptualizing learning as socially situated, one might argue that group-based collaborative learning enables what Anderson and Garrison (as cited in Murphy et al., 1996) term learning communities and potentially communities of practice to develop (Wegerif, 1998). These learning communities can evolve into sustainable communities of practice. To do so, they need to sustain themselves, yet the interaction often stops after class ends (Brown, 2001).

Brief Discussion and Implications for Future Research

This synthesis substantiate there is a relationship between asynchronous CMC and adult learning outcomes. Satisfaction, or conversely dissatisfaction, and empowerment are affective outcomes. Reflective thinking, a focus on ideas, and high-level ("deep") thinking are cognitive outcomes. Interactive dialog, participation or alternatively non-participation, as well as socially constructed knowledge and the emergence of a group-based collaborative learning community are social and "blended" outcomes.

My intent is for this review to spark interest in empirical research studies, especially basic research (of which there is far too little) that examine the connections between asynchronous CMC and adult learning. Existing learning theories and models as well as what we know about the communication process that is asynchronously mediated need to be built upon, tested and retested. In addition, researchers might investigate whether "other ways of knowing," transformative learning, and pathological outcomes exist with asynchronous CMC. Of importance, research examining Web-based CMC is in its infancy, and all too often, much of it fails to connect to existing theory and previous research findings (Moore & Kearsley, 1996). My hope is this study will provide an impetus for further research (that is conceptually and theoretically grounded and that builds upon what is already known) into the processes of learning via the Web- and socially network-based asynchronous CMC. A rich research agenda might explore the relationship between learner independence and interdependence.

References

References will be distributed at the conference presentation.

Linda M. Black (Lmb215psu@comcast.net) directs a multimedia-based computer learning center at the Navy Information Systems Command Learning Center (717/605-1128) and instructs distance education courses for The Pennsylvania State University's World Campus Adult & Distance Education program (717/926-0066).

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Identifying Theories on Practice in Adult Literacy Education

Christopher M. Coro

Abstract: This study used a case study phenomenological approach to determine the theories on practice of four adult literacy education practitioners. Participants completed two instruments designed to assess beliefs and practices of adult educators. Each participant was then interviewed to discuss impressions of the results of these instruments. Findings suggested that the process led to greater reflection on practice for the participants. The study also found that the instruments used presented limitations to identifying participants' beliefs on practice.

Introduction

The purpose of the study was to determine what conclusions adult literacy educators might draw about their beliefs on practice as a result of participation in a three-part process involving completion of two standardized instruments and individual interviews. This study was built upon the need for more reflective practice in adult education—particularly in adult literacy education. Results suggested that the process helped participants to reflect upon practice in new ways and gain new insights into the beliefs guiding their actions.

Theoretical Framework

Schön (1987) discussed the relationship between professionals' beliefs and actions. Schön noted how professionals' actions did not always reflect their stated beliefs. Thus, it was necessary for professionals to reflect on their practice in order to close the gap between what they thought they were doing and what they actually did. Brookfield (1995) and Cranton (1996) applied Schön's analysis specifically to adult educators. Both concluded that adult educators' practice could be enhanced by reflection on practice. Brookfield (1995) and Cranton (1996) encouraged adult educators to use self-assessment as an initial step toward becoming more critically reflective.

Heimlich and Norland (1994) specifically suggested survey instruments as a means to identify beliefs and actions about adult education. They proposed two possible ways for adult educators to use survey instruments in order to assess their belief on practice. Either a deductive or an inductive method could be used to identify teaching style. Teaching style was the composite of educators' beliefs and actions (Heimlich & Norland, 1994). Applying the deductive method, an adult educator could complete a survey to identify their beliefs from a pre-designed menu of possibilities. The inductive method, on the other hand, focused on the adult educators' actions. Adult educators might inductively articulate their beliefs by assessing their actions and reflecting upon the beliefs that might prompt such actions (Heimlich & Norland (1994).

Methodology

Using a qualitative, phenomenological case study approach, this project sought to combine both the deductive and inductive methods described above in order to provide experienced adult literacy educators a means by which they might reflect upon and identify their beliefs and practices within the context of adult literacy education. To assess deductively each participant's beliefs on practice, the Philosophies of Adult Education Inventory (PAEI) (Zinn, 1999) was used. In order to inductively assess each participant's beliefs on practice, the Principles of Adult Learning Scale (PALS) (Conti, 1998) was administered to each. A semi-structured interview was conducted with each participant to gather feedback regarding the results from each instrument.

A purposive sampling (Patton, 2002) of five adult educators from one large adult literacy education provider in eastern Pennsylvania was identified. Each was selected for having 10 or more years experience in adult literacy education. The five selected were all female and had accrued all of their adult literacy education at the agency where they were employed at the time of this study. Each had worked in a variety of capacities as adult literacy educators. All participants had both teaching and administrative experience. All had worked as English as a Second Language (ESL), Adult Basic Education (ABE), and General Educational Development (GED) teachers. Because of a personal issue, one of the final five selected was unable to complete the activities of this project.

Participants took the PAEI as a group and individually scored their own results. Results on the PAEI were reported to the researcher by participants. The PALS was administered individually. Completed PALS answer sheets were then returned to the researcher for scoring. Once scored, participants were provided with final scores and interpretation data at least 72 hours prior to meeting for the interview. Also prior to each interview, participants were given a written copy of the questions to be asked.

Questions for the semi-structured interview focused on four principal themes: (a) participants' interpretation of their PAEI scores, (b) participants' interpretation of their PALS scores, (c) participants' impression of any positive or negative correlation between scores on the two instruments, and (d) participants' statement of their personal beliefs about adult education as a result of reflection upon the activities of this project. In order to promote an open and relaxed atmosphere, the researcher decided to take notes rather than record these interviews (Merriam, 1998; Patton, 2002).

Instrumentation

The PAEI is a 45-item, self-scored inventory that identifies adult educators' philosophies from among five (liberal, behaviorist, progressive, humanistic, radical) discussed by Elias and Merriam (1995). The instrument also provides an explanation of each. Thus, it lends itself to easy adoption of the deductive method of identifying beliefs (Heimlich & Norland, 1994). This instrument has been used successfully to diagnose discrepancies between espoused theories and theories-in-use (Williams, 2000). The PALS is a 44-item, self-scored questionnaire that was designed to measure frequency of activities reflective of adult education (Conti, 1998). The PALS was designed to provide feedback in terms of teacher-centered v. learner-centered behaviors. The instrument measures seven factors—learner-centered activities, personalizing instruction, relating to experience, assessing student needs, climate building, participation in the

learning process, flexibility for personal development. The PALS also provides sub-scores in each area. Because of its focus on teachers' actions, PALS lends itself to the inductive method of identifying one's beliefs (Heimlich & Norland, 1994).

To supplement data collected from these two standardized instruments, an interview protocol was created. This protocol was used to conduct semi-structured interviews with each participant in order to obtain feedback regarding the results from the PAEI and the PALS. A semi-structured format was selected in order to ensure that each participant was provided an opportunity to respond to the same questions while providing flexibility that allowed for individualized follow-up (Merriam, 1998; Patton, 2002).

Findings

The PAEI identified two of the participants (C and D) as progressives and two others (A and B) as behaviorists. A score on the PALS greater than 146 is interpreted as learner-centered whereas a score below 146 is considered more teacher-centered (Conti, 1998). Two of the participants (A and B) scored as more "learner-centered" adult educators, while the other two (C and D) scored as more "teacher-centered" practitioners. The results of the PAEI and the PALS are summarized on table 1.

Table 1. Summary of Participants' PAEI & PALS Scores

Instrument	Variable	Participant A	Participant B	Participant C	Participant D
PAEI					
	Behaviorist	98	88	76	89
	Liberal	85	76	71	76
	Progressive	90	86	89	90
	Humanist	89	78	81	85
	Radical	63	57	69	65
PALS	Total Score	150	192	145	139

Behaviorists have been described as more teacher-centered while progressive have been described as more learner-centered (Elias and Merriam, 1995; Zinn, 1999). Yet, the PAEI rated two participants as behaviorists while the PALS rated these same two participants as learner-centered. Similarly, the PAEI rated two of the participants as progressives, yet the PALS found them to be teacher-centered. Moreover, participants generally agreed with the findings of each instrument. The individual interviews provided insights into these apparent contradictions.

Participant A said that the three words she felt most accurately reflected her beliefs about adult education were "encourager, facilitator and instructor." She felt that the behaviorist PAEI

score and the learner-centered PALS score reflected the ability she had developed to be flexible and adaptive in her practice. Although she said she would not have selected the word to describe herself, she accepted Conti's (1998) description of her score as indicative of an "eclectic" (p. 77) approach to adult education. She felt the use of instruments such as the PAEI and the PALS were useful since "Most [adult educators] have a philosophy but haven't put it into words." Thus, such instruments were useful in helping adult educators "label" what they believed. However, she did observe limitations in the use of these instruments.

While she felt that adult educators needed to be first and foremost "encouragers," she did not feel that either instrument—the PAEI or the PALS—adequately captured this aspect of her personal philosophy. Thus, in addition to using these instruments and interviews, she felt that peer observation and substituting for other teachers could provide useful insights into one's personal philosophical assumptions of adult education.

Participant B stated that "exciting, beneficial and personal" were the three words that most closely reflected her personal beliefs about adult education. Like adult educator A, she articulated a great deal of flexibility in her approach to adult education. She also felt—again like A—the particular role that she was performing in adult education determined the approach she implemented. In fact, reflecting upon her responsibilities as a teacher, tutor trainer and administrator, she told of experiencing difficulty in completing the PAEI. She felt her answers depended upon which role she was exercising. Still, she agreed with participant A that such instruments were useful in facilitating professional development. "You kind of intuitively know it," she commented, "But, what I always thought was proved to me." Such insights, she suggested, enabled practitioners to see if "what they're thinking is, in fact, what they're doing." Once one's philosophy was identified, she felt, "you can give it character—give it life."

Nevertheless, participant B also felt the instruments had not captured everything. She felt neither instrument had adequately captured the importance of creating a sense of community among adult literacy learners. To supplement the use of such instruments, participant B suggested discussion and networking opportunities. Commenting that with increased demands for accountability "a lot of the beauty of adult education has been lost," she held that teachers feel "alone" and need to know that "They're OK. Other people think that way too."

Participant C had trouble responding to the question of which three words best described her philosophy of adult education. Ultimately, she responded with "facilitative," "two-way street" and "throw out the text books." She scored high in both the progressive and humanist categories on the PAEI. She scored only one point below the learner-centered cut-off on the PALS. However, neither instrument captured the sense of "struggle" she expressed when questioned about her beliefs on practice.

As an adult educator within a county prison system, participant C felt she was "walking a line most of the time and I can't walk toward either of the extreme ends." She discussed the challenges of meeting learners' needs within a highly structured system. She explained difficulties she had in interpreting PALS items related to "Learner Centered Activities" and "Climate Building" as well as the delicate balance she had to play in providing adult education for imprisoned learners. "Sometimes," she affirmed, "I am teacher-centered and I *do* know what's best for them." Still, like participants A and B, she felt the PAEI and the PALS had effectively captured important elements of her personal adult education philosophy—but not all of it.

Participant C felt that these instruments failed to capture "the struggle—the conscious struggle—to balance. You need to step away and pick your battles. Pick and choose." Likewise,

she did not feel that either instrument effectively dealt with the importance of trust "not just between teacher and student, but between student and student." Still, she urged adult educators to use such instruments as tools of professional development. "To fully develop, you need to look at that Jungian darker side. It has gifts too. Not just to benefit your own work, but your students and the others you work with." To supplement the use of these instruments, she recommended journal writing combined with mentoring. "It takes time and it isn't for everyone," she noted, "but it helped me."

Participant D listed "well-rounded," "willing to experiment," and "learner-centered" as her three words to describe her beliefs about adult education. This vision of adult education might, at first glance, seem at odds with her scores on the instruments used in this project. On the PAEI she scored highest as a progressive. And, on the PALS, she scored within one standard deviation of the mean making her slightly more teacher-centered according to that instrument (Conti, 1998). She did not feel any of these results were either inaccurate or contradictory. "You want to express your creative side with the students," she explained, "because you want their buy-in. But, you need to provide your expertise and give them the structure they expect from you." Like her co-workers, she found the use of these instruments useful in promoting reflection-on-practice (Schön, 1987). She observed that, "You have to know where you are to grow. And the more you know about yourself, the more you can help other people grow."

Participant D also felt the instruments—while informative and useful—failed to capture her entire philosophy of adult education. She felt that the instruments failed to pay adequate attention to the importance of planning and providing instruction that respected diverse learning style preferences. Similarly, as instruments for development, she felt that they were "one track, paper and pencil" methods that did not respect the variety of learning preferences among educators as learners. Regarding ways for practitioners to examine themselves in practice, she suggested videotaping educators "in action." "When you see yourself, it blows your mind. You pull yourself out of your daily situation and look at yourself from a neutral position." She felt that for many people "it's a real shock to see yourself the way other people see you."

Implications

The findings above suggest that neither the PAEI nor the PALS could singularly identify the beliefs on action of the four participants in this study. For these participants, then, neither a deductive nor an inductive approach through instruments (Heimlich & Norland, 1994) for identifying their beliefs about their practice adequately captured the complexity of those beliefs. Participants agreed that other more personalized, less standardized procedures should be included as means to gather additional insights into adult literacy educators' beliefs on action. The above findings suggest that the beliefs about practice of the participants in this study were complicated and, at times, contradictory. However, the results of this study must be interpreted within the context of its limitations.

The sample for this study was small which limits any generalization of findings. More research into the beliefs guiding adult literacy educators needs to be done (Kegan et al., 2001; Quigley, 1997). For example, how would the findings have been affected by including adult literacy educators from other institutions? Would gender differences emerge if males were included in the sample? The limitations of this study preclude any consideration of these questions. Still, participants were able to better articulate the complexities and contradictions of their personal beliefs on action regarding adult literacy practice.

Beder and Medina (2001), Grabill (2001), and Quigley (1997) have all suggested that adult literacy education has been characterized by beliefs that were incongruent with practices and the expressed needs of adult literacy learners. Greater reflection on practice has been called for (Kegan et al., 2001; Quigley, 1997). This study demonstrated a three-part process that enabled its participants to reflect in greater depth on their beliefs on practice.

Conclusions

This study examined the beliefs guiding the practice of four experienced adult literacy practitioners using standardized instruments and semi-structured interviews. The study confirmed that the process employed did lead to greater reflection on practice for the participants. Participants articulated complex understandings of their practices as adult educators. The study also suggested that the instruments used would not, on their own, have yielded the same complexity and depth of findings for participants. Merriam and Brockett (1997) warned against the danger of becoming prisoners of the labels generated by instruments used to identify teachers' beliefs of adult education. The participants in this study upheld that warning and offered insights as to how adult literacy educators' beliefs on action might be better identified.

References

Beder, H., & Medina, P. (2001). *Classroom dynamics in adult literacy education*. Cambridge, MA: National Center for the Study of Adult Learning and Literacy.

Brookfield, S. (1995). *Becoming a critically reflective teacher*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Conti, G. J. (1998). Identifying your teaching style. In Galbraith, M. W. (Ed.), *Adult learning methods: A guide for effective instruction* (2nd ed., pp. 37-42). Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Cranton, P. (1996). *Professional development as transformative learning*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Elias, J. L., & Merriam, S. B. (1995). *Philosophical foundations of adult* education (2nd ed.). Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Grabill, J. (2001). *Community literacy programs and the politics of change*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Heimlich, J. E., & Norland E. (1994). *Developing teaching style in adult education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Kegan, R., Broderick, M., Drago-Severson, E., Helsing, D., Popp, N., & Portnow, K. (2001). *Toward a new pluralism in ABE/ESOL programs: Teaching to multiple "cultures of mind."* Cambridge, MA: National Center for the Study of Adult Learning and Literacy.

Merriam, S. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education* (Rev. ed.) San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., & Brockett, R. G. (1997). *The profession and practice of adult education: An introduction*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Patton, M. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Quigley, B. A. (1997). *Rethinking literacy education: The critical need for practice-based change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Williams, S. W. (2000). Do we practice what we preach? An examination of the philosophical orientation and practice of adult educators who deliver web-based instruction. In K. P. King & T. R. Ferro (Eds.), *Proceedings of the Eastern Regional Adult Education Research Conference, March 16-18, 2000* (pp. 257-262). University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University.

Zinn, L. M. (1999). *Philosophy of adult education inventory* (Rev. ed.). Boulder, CO: Lifelong Learning Options.

Christopher Coro holds an M. S. in adult education from Capella University, where he is also a Ph.D. candidate in adult education. He is the director of adult literacy at Northampton Community College. Contact: ccoro@northampton.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

The Use of Critical Thinking and Reflective Practice with an Experienced Occupational Therapy Assistant: A Case Study

Tamera K. Humbert

Abstract: The development and use of critical thinking skills and reflective practice with workers has been identified as valuable; however, it is often difficult to articulate or describe what that actually means for the workers, particularly for those in technical- level positions. This qualitative study investigated how one occupational therapy assistant utilized critical thinking as well as reflective practice within the daily expectations of patient treatment. Results indicate that a variety of thinking skills and approaches were utilized and recognized by the assistant.

Introduction

The facilitation and use of both critical thinking skills and reflective practice has been identified as valuable in institutions of higher education as well as within the work force (Facione, 1991; Schön, 1983, 1987, 1991; Vaske, 1998). Critical thinking, as defined by Facione (as cited in Vaske, 1998), consists of both skill acquisition and disposition in the ability to interpret, analyze, evaluate, infer, explain and self-regulate. Schön (1983) has identified the need for workers to use reflective practice beyond critical thinking in order to deal competently with the uncertainties and dilemmas of the work role. According to Schön (1983), when known techniques cannot resolve the work concern, or when a problematic situation is puzzling, uncertain, or unstable, the worker follows a series of cognitive processes, described as reflection-in-action, to reconstruct and test new theory.

While it is suggested that critical thinking skills and reflective practice may be facilitated with college students (Facione, 1991; Schön, 1987), questions regarding the viability of developing these skills with individuals pursuing an associate degree are present. Criticisms have centered on the limited development of critical thinking skills in technical level education (Larson & Wissman, 2000; Prendergast, 2000), and the limited ability to develop reflective judgment with students in the first two years of undergraduate education (Brabeck, 1982; Brabeck & Wood, 1983; King, Kitchener, Davison, Parker, & Wood, 1983). Also, research has indicated that while critical thinking skills and reflective practice are valued within the work force, not all workers demonstrate the use of these skills (Ferry & Ross-Gordon, 1998).

In the field of occupational therapy, there are two levels of practitioner, the occupational therapist and the occupational therapy assistant. The occupational therapist holds either a baccalaureate or a master's degree, while the assistant generally holds an associate degree. Research has been completed with experienced occupational therapists validating the use of critical thinking and reflective practice within their daily work routines (Mattingly & Fleming, 1994). However, there has been no research conducted on how the occupational therapy assistants utilize these skills and abilities autonomously within their practice arena. In addition, there is debate over the extent and use of critical thinking and reflective practice with the

assistant (Carr, 1995; Sands, 1998). The question remains-What critical thinking skills and reflective practice are utilized with occupational therapy assistants?

Methodology

A qualitative case study was completed with an experienced occupational therapy assistant in order to investigate the use of critical thinking skills and reflective practice throughout patient treatment sessions. Two semi-structured interviews were conducted in addition to direct observation of the assistant's work day by this researcher. The first completed interview focused on the assistant's educational and work history along with the interviewee's perspective of critical thinking and reflective practice. The assistant was then observed by the researcher as she completed her daily work tasks including direct patient care. The second interview included semi-structured questions focusing on specific critical incidents observed by the researcher and questions facilitating the metacognitive process of the assistant. The interviews and observation notes were transcribed. A constant comparative analysis was completed with the transcripts resulting in the emergence of various themes.

Results

The research indicates that elements of critical thinking skills and reflective practice were utilized by the experienced occupational therapy assistant during treatment sessions. Themes of beliefs, anticipation, analysis, incorporation, determination, and judgments were evident in the rationale the assistant provided of her treatment activities.

Beliefs

The occupational therapy assistant held particular beliefs about each of the patients she treated. She had beliefs regarding what the patient's problems were and what needed to be addressed in the therapy session. She held beliefs about the underlying causes of the problem and how to address the problems. Along with the beliefs or goals of therapy, the assistant articulated some of her beliefs regarding the way the body works.

In all of these beliefs, the assistant shared a perspective in which she formulated her thoughts on what the focus of therapy should be with each of the patients and how one might respond in therapy to the problems or needs of the patients. There was an association expressed between a perceived belief and a recommendation for therapy.

Anticipation

There were also elements of anticipation seen within the assistant's thinking processes. This anticipation was generally characterized by her expecting particular events or responses to occur with the patients she was treating. Most of these expectations were based on previous knowledge or an awareness of the patient. Some of the expectations were in the immediate future, such as within the next therapy session, and some expectations were long term. In all of her anticipation, the assistant provided a response or a plan. She was able to articulate what she was going to do to manage those anticipated events or responses.

Analysis

The assistant utilized analysis in determining what therapy tasks were appropriate as well as when making interpretations of patient's behaviors and responses within the therapy session. This cognitive process shaped her decision making regarding which therapy tasks may be utilized and which of these tasks were helpful. The majority of the analyses expressed by the assistant were related to specific activities, while other incidents included analysis of the patient's response in therapy. The analysis of therapeutic activities included the complexity of the task, what aspect the task highlighted, and the time required to complete the task. It appeared that these analyses were already integrated into her understanding and that the analyses were not generated during the therapy session. However, the analyses of the patient's responses were time-limited and occurred within the therapy session. In order to select activities for the treatment session, the assistant utilized her understanding and analysis of activities, her analysis of the patient's needs and her beliefs.

Incorporation

The assistant not only utilized anticipation and analysis when planning therapy activities but she also incorporated the patients into the therapy sessions. This may be seen with recognizing patient's values, recognizing and incorporating their roles, and compromising with the patient. In all of these examples, the assistant demonstrated a level of awareness and acknowledgement of the patient's personal lives. Whether attending to the patient's goals, wishes and values, recognizing the patient's family, or reinforcing the patient's roles, she incorporated these aspects into the therapy session and intermingled her beliefs, anticipations, and analysis of the treatment needs.

Determination

As the assistant utilized anticipation, analysis, and incorporation when selecting and modifying therapy activities, she also demonstrated a level of determination with the patients. This determination was noted in the direct and committed approach in the therapy session as well as her approach to the team and the insurance companies. The determination that she demonstrated can be seen as an intensity of her approach, a willingness to fight for, and with the patients. She took it upon herself to motivate, push, confront, and challenge others. While this determination may not be a pure thinking process, it is noted that the assistant's approach to the patients and determination with each of the patients differed. There was a decision of how and when to push the patient or in other words a difference with the amount of determination she presumed with each patient.

Judgment

The assistant portrayed a thinking process in which she compared information from various sources in order to make a judgment or come to a conclusion to which she responded. These judgments often occurred when there were competing bits of information. She was able to distinguish the inconsistencies, come to a conclusion, and then take action or respond to the situation based on her conclusions. When she was unable to come to a clear decision within this judgment process, she still responded to the situation in a definite manner recommending further assessment or evaluation.

Conclusion

When utilizing critical thinking skills, one provides a logical application, analysis, and problem-solving perspective to work needs. In this case study, the experienced occupational therapist utilized a critical thinking skills process when sharing her belief system. She articulated a given problem for the patient and then shared her solution to the problem. She also articulated her beliefs about particular illnesses, diagnoses, or disabilities and how one should respond to these.

The assistant also demonstrated a level of critical thinking skills in her anticipation. She has a logical approach to the patient's activity and responsiveness of the therapy session. She provided an understanding of what to expect next in the therapy session. If the patient performed in a particular manner, then a particular approach was required

The assistant's use of analysis emphasized her understanding of the therapeutic activities and when to apply their use. She made decisions on what activities to utilize in the therapy sessions based on her observations and beliefs about the patients and the activities. She applied the use of particular activities as a means to meet the goals of the treatment session.

In regard to the assistant's levels of determination, there is also some evidence that critical thinking skills were being applied. She made decisions in regard to the level and amount of challenge she provided to the patients during the treatment session. There was a belief about the level of challenge needed in the therapy session based on the patient's status and the level of her rapport with the patient. She made decisions about this level of challenge or determination and then was able to logically articulate why she made particular decisions.

Another element of critical thinking skills is the ability to look at multiple perspectives, make a determination of the problem, and again apply a logical solution to the problem. Under the Judgment theme, the assistant recognized multiple perspectives to the patient's scenarios. She recognized and articulated conflicts within these perspectives. She was able to determine what she believed to be the correct or most accurate analysis of the situation. Based on her perception of the "real problem", she then applied her knowledge and beliefs in order to come up with a plan to address the problem.

Beyond the use of critical thinking skills, the assistant also demonstrated reflective thinking. Within this perspective, the practitioner makes meaning of the problem along with the patient and resolves the issues collaboratively with the patient. Under the incorporation theme, the assistant demonstrated evidence that she enlisted the patients to set the stage or tone of the therapy session. She understood the roles and desires of the patients and attempted to incorporate the patient's roles, daily routines, and habits into the therapy session in order for the patients to understand their own strengths and needs.

While not completely collaborative in nature, the assistant did engage the patient to help see and understand the problem or concern that she saw. She identified a need and then helped persuade or provide enlightenment to the patient through her feedback, her selection of activities, and her direct communication with the client. She helped to build a relationship where she shaped the meaning of the problem from her professional perspective. In addition, the assistant demonstrated willingness to compromise or understand the needs of the patient. Even when she utilized critical thinking to establish activities for the therapy session, she did state that she needed to modify the therapy session at times in order to meet the therapy demands as well as the patient's needs.

There is some evidence that the assistant utilized both a critical thinking and reflective thinking process within therapy sessions. She predominantly utilized a logical application or critical thinking perspective in her therapeutic approach to patients. However, there is evidence that portions of her thinking, planning, and approach to patient treatment were collaborative, emphasizing a reflective mode as well.

Recommendation

While the research is limited in scope and can not be considered conclusive, it allows further research to be considered and conducted with additional occupational therapy assistants in order to understand what critical thinking and reflective practice skills are utilized in practice.

The results of this research are applicable not only to the occupational therapy profession but also to adult education. While there is support for the facilitation of critical thinking skills and reflective practice within higher education, it is seldom understood or clearly identified as a goal for students completing an associate degree. Within the medical community, there are professional, para-professional, and technical-level positions requiring individuals with an associate degree to provide direct patient services and to make decisions regarding treatment and intervention. It is imperative to understand what critical thinking skills and reflective practices are required for the work place in order to provide realistic role expectations and to understand what skills are important to facilitate or foster in the academic arena.

References

Brabeck, M. M. (1982). Critical thinking skills and reflective judgment development. *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology, 17*(3), 12-27.

Brabeck, M. M., & Wood, P. K. (1983). A longitudinal study of well and ill-structured problem solving in college age women. In M. L. Commons & C. Armon (Eds.), *Adult Development: Vol. 2* (pp. 133-146). New York: Praeger.

Carr, S. H. (1995). The COTA heritage. In S. E. Ryan (Ed.), *The combined volume: COTA, second edition, and practice issues in occupational therapy* (pp. 21-32). Thorofare, NJ: Slack.

Facione, P. A. (1991). *Using the California Critical Thinking Skills Test in research, evaluation, and assessment*. Millbrae, CA: California Academic Press. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED337498)

Ferry, N. M., & Ross-Gordon, J. M. (1998). An inquiry into Schön's epistemology of practice: Exploring links between experience and reflective practice. *Adult Education Quarterly, 48*, 98-112.

King, P. M., Kitchener, K. S., Davison, M. L., Parker, C. A., & Wood, P. K. (1983). The justification of beliefs in young adults: A longitudinal study. *Human Development, 26*, 106-116.

Larson, E., & Wissman, J. R. (2000). Critical academic skills for Kansas Community College graduates: A Delphi study. *Community College Review, 28*(2), 43-50.

Marsick, V. J. (1988). Learning in the workplace: The case for reflectivity and critical reflectivity. *Adult Education Quarterly, 38*, 187-198.

Mattingly, C., & Fleming, M. (1994). *Clinical reasoning: Forms of inquiry in a therapeutic practice*. Philadelphia: F. A. Davis.

Prendergast, D. L. (1998). *Influences of college environments and the development of critical thinking skills in college students*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois at Chicago.

Sands, M. (1995). Readying occupational therapy assistant students for level II fieldwork: Beyond academics to personal behaviors and attitudes. *American Journal of Occupational Therapy, 49*(2), 150-155.

Schön, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner*. New York: Basic Books.

Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner: Toward a new design for teaching and learning in the professions*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Schön, D. A. (1991). The reflective turn: Case studies in and on educational practice. New York: Teachers College Press.

Vaske, J. M. (1998). *Defining, teaching, and evaluating critical thinking skills in adult education*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Drake University, Des Moines, IA

Tamera K. Humbert, M.Ed., OTR/L, The Pennsylvania State University, Berks-Lehigh Valley College, P.O.Box 7009, Reading, PA 19610-6009; tkh110@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

Four Adult Literacy Classrooms: Two Types of Learner Voice

Patsy Medina

Abstract: The autonomous and ideological models of literacy are two theoretical models that have influenced program development and instruction in adult literacy education. In this qualitative study, the two programs that demonstrated ideological model features enabled learners to evolve a revelatory voice. Learners solely displayed a school-only voice during instruction in the two programs that embodied autonomous model features.

Methodology

This study of four adult programs examined the relationship between their educational philosophy and the instruction that actually took place in their adult basic education (ABE) Level 1 classrooms. Using a multiple-case design (Yin, 1984), four classrooms from different urban adult literacy programs were selected as research sites. The reputational case selection sampling strategy (Goetz and LeCompte 1984) was implemented, whereby sites were recommended by experienced experts in the adult literacy field. Program administrators were contacted and asked to classify their instructional programs based on a four-item adult literacy program practice typology developed by Purcell-Gates, Degener, and Jacobson (1998). The authentic/school only dimension refers to the types of materials and curricula used and activities that occur in a class. The four-item continuum ranges from highly authentic to highly school-only. The collaborative/ teacher-directed dimension refers to the extent that students have input into programming and curricular decisions. This dimension also has a four-item continuum that ranges from highly collaborative to highly teacher-directed. Table 1 describes the four research sites as well as their classifications. Via participant observation (Merriam, 1998), data were collected over a period of four months at each ABE 1 classroom site by way of field notes based on classroom observations, interviews with teachers, learners and administrators, and document and artifact analysis.

Related Literature

Street (1984) maintains that there are two theoretical models of literacy: the autonomous model and the ideological model. The autonomous model is reflective of the work of Ong (1982) and Goody (1968). Simply put, proponents of the autonomous model assert that "literacy skills are discrete skills separate from society, separate and independent of a person's culture" (Whiton, 1990, p. 44). Once a person has developed these skills, he or she attains a higher psychological and sociological level of thinking that in turn betters the individual and society. Hence, literacy affects the ways members of society think. Street calls the assertions of these theorists as the autonomous view of literacy because, not only do they propose a great divide among people based on their literacy skills, but "once literacy is achieved, meaning is

regarded as being in an autonomous text" (Palacios, 2001, p. 19). According to Whiton (1990), the autonomous model has had a major influence in the instruction and development of adult literacy programs in the United States. Most of the "curricular activities in these programs imply that reading and writing are discrete skills that can be taught in order" (p. 45).

Table 1
Research Sites

Classification	Site	Setting	Teacher	Administrator
Highly authentic/highly collaborative	Learn Every-thing Together (LET)	City library	Marcy	Olivia
Somewhat authentic/some-what collaborative	Community Action Program (CAP)	Community-based organization	Sadie	Jasmine
Somewhat school-only/ somewhat teacher-directed	Workforce Investment Now (WIN)	County public school	Kate	Patty
Highly school-only/highly teacher-directed	Public Urban Program (PUP)	City public school	Velma	Rose

Street (1984) challenges the autonomous view of literacy claiming that it is ethnocentric and favors western culture that seeks to maintain a particular social order. He counters with an ideological model of literacy that defines literacy as "a social process, in which particularly socially constructed technologies are used within particular frameworks for specific social purposes" (p. 97). In other words there are multiple literacies. Barton (1994) reiterates that sentiment by underscoring that there are multiple literacies that are situated in broad social relations. He emphasizes the most appropriate view of literacy as a set of practices which are used by people in literacy events. These literacy practices and events are created out of the past. Literacy is, thus, defined as "a symbolic system used both for communicating and for representing the world to ourselves" (p.7).

According to Whiton (1990), adult literacy programs based on the ideological model understand that literacy is a socio-cultural construct and that by nature reading and writing are political. What is important in these programs is that there are "a variety or relationships and cyclical activities which all may affect the outcome of a student learning literacy skills in a program" (p. 47). These programs can also be labeled participatory literacy education programs. Participatory literacy education is based on the belief that the characteristics, aspirations, backgrounds, needs and goals of learners should be at the center of literacy instruction and programming (Fingeret, 1992; Fingeret & Jurmo,1989). Given the political nature of the ideological literacy and participatory literacy models, one might assume that instruction and other activities taking place within organizations that are grounded in these models are congruent with critical pedagogy (Freire, 1993; Lankshear & McLaren, 1993; Shor, 1992). Lately, however, researchers (Degener, 2001; Palacios, 2001) are asserting that these types of claims cannot be made. Palacios (2001) warns other researchers that taking firm positions on how literacy is defined may not be useful. He asserts that literacy should be viewed as broadly as possible which can and should include both autonomous and ideological models. He maintains that various beliefs about literacy concurrently take place in literacy programs. Along these same lines, Degener (2001) contends that although critical theorists have been compelling in their

criticisms of traditional adult education programs, these critiques have not necessarily been useful. "Unfortunately, their criticisms have resulted in an 'us versus them' mentality that often puts noncritical programs on the defensive rather than open to the idea of change" (p. 28). Degener asserts that a more useful way of conducting research in adult literacy programs, is by examining to what degree they have features that are allied with critical pedagogy. Regarding this particular study, it was clear that two of the literacy programs, WIN and PUP, were examples of autonomous models of literacy. LET and CAP, however, were somewhere in between autonomous and ideological. Both had features that reflected critical pedagogy, but some areas were characteristic of very traditional programs. The points of view of Palacios and Degener were useful during the data analysis phase of this study.

Findings and Discussion

The Power of Writing

As other studies have shown (Beder & Medina, 2001; Collins, 1992), adult basic education classes are discrete-skill endeavors. This study confirmed that conclusion. Three of the teachers from this study had an unmistakable dependency on commercially published materials that separated reading into discrete items such a comprehension skills, author's purpose, and critical thinking skills. Yet, the types of written products that were produced by learners at LET and CAP were qualitatively very different than what encompassed writing at PUP and at WIN. At PUP learners did not do any type of free writing. They copied from the board teacher produced written passages or filled in some blanks on worksheets. At WIN all written work was connected to mundane workbook topics such as shopping at the supermarket, buying a car, and the weather. At CAP and LET learners wrote personal stories "to describe their feelings and examine personal identities. They wrote to tell their children what their lives had been like, to remember the good and the bad time, and to make sense of them in light of new understandings" (Gillespie, 1991, p. 184). The following are selected sections from final drafts of written pieces from CAP and LET.

> I was lucky that for the year we were separated, he was in a very good foster home. The foster mother met me twice and invited me to her home. Foster parents are not allowed to have parents over the house. . . . The foster mother broke all the rules when it came to us. ("Stories of My Life," Hilda, LET).

> The Cardona family was in a stressful situation at this time. Because our daughter was born with C & V is a virus that destroys the lungs with respiratory problems. Maria and I were thinking about our previous life. We didn't understand why our daughter with that problem. We never took any drugs... After three years, Maria became pregnant again. She was very scared. She was crying. She thought she was going to have the same problem as before. I felt guilty. We felt guilty. And we thought we would have an abortion. We changed our minds. It was not easy for us to make a decision. ("A Stressful Situation," Fernando, CAP)

It's Not How You Teach Writing, It's Why You Teach Writing

What accounts for the difference in the way the learners from the two classes express themselves through writing? It was not the manner in which the instructors taught writing. A

close analysis of the data of teachers responding to the writings of learners indicates that they focused on mechanics first (errors) before they addressed content. For example, after Kate had corrected a learner's paper with a red pen, she wrote on his paper, "Next time skip a line. Leave me a space between lines for corrections. Recopy this carefully with corrections. Could you write more?" Often Velma from LET looked over the shoulders of learners and corrected their spelling as they were in the midst of writing. The following is indicative of the manner in which Sadie responded to writing.

> Sadie is looking over Mikaela's shoulder. She says, "Tell me what you're writing about." Before Mikaela can answer, Sadie says, "Put a capital letter there. Where are your periods? Where are your commas? How is anyone supposed to understand that?" Only after some of the mechanics were worked out, did Mikaela and Sadie discuss the content, which was about her mother being diagnosed with cervical cancer.

Yet, the personal and pedagogical beliefs about writing that were espoused by the teacher from WIN were very different than those of the teachers from CAP and LET. Kate believed that it was her responsibility to help students pass the GED, and the only way to accomplish that was by writing what one was told to write.

> You don't have to be inspired, it doesn't have to come and not come. That's why I have a young man who likes to write, but he only wants to write about something that he wants to write about. I was telling him today, "You can't go to the GED, not be inspired, because you're going to fail." He wants to write about immigration and whether there should be limits on immigration. He went on to say how people don't care much about this issue. And I told him to focus, that immigration was not the topic I had given him.

The other two teachers perceived the purpose of writing very differently. The first citation is from Sadie, the other from Velma.

> Writing has to be something that is personal to them. I allow them to choose. I never give them topics. I say, "Write about whatever you want to write about." And they write about something that means something to them. And it's always something that others would like to read. . . . You can put yourself in writing. When you put yourself in writing, it brings out your character and your feelings and everything. It is important that they express themselves, so others can feel what they feel.

> I believe that students are here to enrich their lives and that they bring a wealth of knowledge with them already. Because they are adults they have life experiences that come into the classrooms and are an integral part of their learning. Many of those life experiences are illustrated in what they write.

Revelatory Voice and School-Only Voice

What were the consequences of these distinct ways of viewing the purpose of writing? The literature on adult literacy addresses the power that authentic writing has in helping people to attain perspective transformation (Gillespie, 1991, 2001; Purcell-Gates & Waterman, 2000). However, the differences are much more intense. At PUP, where no writing activities took place,

and at WIN, where all writing was connected to workbooks, learners solely displayed a restricted school-only voice while in their programs. At CAP and LET a revelatory voice proliferated.

A school-only voice is when learners adopt a restricted way of communicating and way of being that is not connected to the rest of their lives. Revelatory voice is when learners allow their authentic selves to be revealed in the classroom. Learners integrate what they are learning in school and incorporate those elements into their real lives as parents, workers, spouses, friends, lovers, and the numerous other adult roles that learners embody. However, it is a dialectical relationship. Those adult roles are endemic to how they interact in the classroom.

At CAP and LET revelatory learner voice was manifested, in addition to very personal writing, in numerous ways. Learners were not afraid to confront their teachers. For example, Sadie often chastised the Chinese learners for using electronic dictionaries.

> The elderly Chinese man tried to tell Sadie that that he needed the dictionary—that it really helps him. Sadie cuts him off, "I don't care what you say. I don't want those in my classroom." Xai, a young Chinese woman, tells Sadie that they know what was good for them, that Sadie does not have the right to tell them not to use the dictionaries. "Mr. Chu should be treated with respect. He is like a grandfather."

When the learners were asked about this incident, all felt that Xai was right and that the teacher overreacted to the use of the dictionaries. What was especially enlightening was that the learners from CAP were willing to share this type of information during interviews. Moreover, the learners from CAP and LET shared very personal information during interviews. Several of them were also very vocal about the research being conducting in their classrooms. They asked how the research would benefit them. Many of the learners from WIN and PUP were reluctant to discuss their programs, let alone critique them or share personal information. Typically, the learners from these two programs asked before they were interviewed if approval to speak with them had been granted by their teachers. They constantly censored themselves, in essence, restricting their voices.

Autonomous Model of Literacy vs. Ideological Model of Literacy

What accounted for the differences in the evolvement of learner voice in these four adult literacy programs? What became most salient were the types of programming decisions that took place within the organization. For example, data were regularly collected in the four programs during a period of four months. Data were solely collected at WIN and PUP during classroom instruction and at year-end celebrations. There was nothing else to observe. No "extracurricular" activities were planned. At CAP, learners were observed, not only during their scheduled literacy classes, but also participating in a family quilt sewing project, taking part in a health-team to spread awareness in the community about AIDS, breast and cervical cancer, and reading at a multi-cultural day presentation and at a poetry café evening. At LET data were collected while learners took part in a stress relaxation workshop, participated in a women and violence community theatre presentation, and ran learner leadership meetings.

It was clear that although at times classroom instruction was very traditional at CAP and LET, both programs had features that blurred the distinction between community and school. In both cases the school was part of the community and the community was part of the school. The programming decisions that were made at CAP and LET ensured that learners and teachers had a multi-literacy perspective. Hence, many features within the program fit the ideological model of

literacy. At PUP and WIN, the everyday lives of learners were meant to stay outside of the four walls of the school. All the features within these two programs fit the autonomous model of literacy.

References

Barton, D. (1994). *Literacy: An introduction to the ecology of written language* (pp. 63-110). Oxford: Blackwell.

Beder, H., & Medina, P. (2001). *Classroom dynamics in adult literacy education*. Cambridge, MA: The National Center for the Study of Adult Learning and Literacy.

Collins, R. (1992). *People, programs, and politics: Two case studies of adult literacy classes*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Portland State University, Oregon.

Degener, S. (2001). Making sense of critical pedagogy in adult literacy education. In J. Comings, B. Garner, & C. Smith (Eds.), *Annual review of adult learning and literacy: Vol. 2.* San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Fingeret, H. A. (1992). *Adult literacy education: Current and future directions. An update* {Information Series #355). Columbus, OH: ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education.

Fingeret, A., & Jurmo, P. (Eds). (1989). *Participatory literacy education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Freire, P. (1993). *Education for critical consciousness*. New York: Continuum.

Gillespie, M. (1991). *Becoming authors: The social context of writing and local publishing by adult beginning readers* (pp. 26-62). Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Massachusetts, Amherst.

Gillespie, M. (2001). *Research in writing: Implications for adult literacy education*. In J. Comings, B. Garner, & C. Smith (Eds.), *Annual review of adult learning and literacy: Vol. 2.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Goetz, J. P., & LeCompte, M. D. (1984). *Ethnography and qualitative design in educational research*. Orlando, FL: Academic Press.

Goody, J. (Ed.). (1968). *Literacy in traditional societies*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Lankshear, C., & McLaren, P. (Eds.). Critical literacy: Politics, praxis, and the postmodern. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education* (Rev. ed.) San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Ong, W. (1982). *Orality and literacy: The technologizing of the word*. London: Methusen.

Palacios, I. (2001). *An ESL literacy center: A qualitative study of perspective and practices of immigrant adults and literacy facilitators*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University of Pennsylvania.

Purcell-Gates, V., Degener, S., & Jacobson, E. (1998). *U. S. adult literacy program practice: A typology across dimensions of life-contextualized/decontextualized and dialogic/ monologic*. Cambridge, MA: The National Center for the Study of Adult Learning and Literacy.

Purcell-Gates, V., & Waterman, R. (2000). *Now we read, we see, we speak*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Shor, I. (1992). *Empowering education: Critical teaching for social change*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Street, B. (1984). *Literacy in theory and practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Whiton, L. (1990). *The role of change in adult literacy program and adult literacy students*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Massachusetts, Amherst.

Yin, R. (1984). *Case study research design and methods*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Patsy Medina, Rutgers University, Graduate School of Education, Educational Theory, Policy and Administration, 10 Seminary Place, New Brunswick, NJ 08903; (732) 932-7496, x8127; patsymed@optonline.net

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Contributions of Literacy to Employment: Theoretical Perspective and Preliminary Estimates

David L. Passmore
Chang-Jung Lin
Ying-Ni Chen
Theresa Bevans-Gonzales
Evin Dogan Cebeci
Michael J. Brna, Jr.

The role of literacy in employment seems well-established. For instance, various analysts believe that large numbers of job holders and seekers are functionally illiterate. In *Illiterate America*, Kozol (1986) asserted that as many as two-thirds of adults unemployed in the 1980s had reading and writing difficulties. *Workforce 2000* cited U.S. Department of Labor estimates that 40% of jobs existing in the 1980s could have been performed by individuals with limited literacy skills, but that only 27% of jobs created in the early 21st century will require such limited skills (Johnston & Packer, 1987). Business losses attributable to basic skills deficiencies have been estimated to run into hundreds of millions of dollars because of low productivity, errors, and accidents (see reviews in Imel, 1989, and Passmore & Mohamed, 1995). Moreover, literacy skills seem essential in all job-related training, especially in training *for* jobs or *on* jobs that form the core of high skills/high wage employment forecasted for our economy (see, e.g., Bruening, 1989).

A lynchpin in the argument that literacy skills contribute to employment is studies identifying the direct relationship between measure of literacy and subsequent labor force participation. For instance, some studies link low levels of literacy with relatively high levels of unemployment and low levels of employment. Yet, from the perspective of formal labor supply theory, such studies fail to specify properly the relationship between literacy and employment. Literacy skills are part of the bundle of skills that form human capital. Labor supply theory, which has its roots in the field of labor economics (see Killingsworth, 1983, for a review), maps decisions that individuals make about whether enter employment and, if employed, how many hours of work to offer.

In this paper, we, first, describe how labor supply theory can form the foundation to study of the complex relationships between literacy skills and employment. Then we present our preliminary estimates of the relationship between a measure of literacy and hourly wages using data from the National Longitudinal Survey of Youth 1997 (NLSY97; these data are available from U.S. Department of Labor, 2002a, and are documented in U.S. Department of Labor, 2002b).

Theoretical Perspective

Complete with indifference curves, formulae, and other tools for economic analysis of

market behavior, Passmore, Olsen, and Wang (1989) provide a detailed synthesis of labor supply theory to account for the outcomes of programs and activities meant to affect human capital directly and primarily and thought to influence employment indirectly and secondarily. The theoretical perspective offered in this brief paper is derived from their synthesis and is presented here in a non-technical manner.

Models of open, non-totalitarian economies treat individual labor supply decisions as choices individuals make about their demand for leisure. In general, the demand for any good is a function of at least three general factors: (a) the opportunity cost of the good, (b) the consumer's level of wealth, and (c) the consumer's preferences. An opportunity cost is the cost of foregoing one good as a result of consuming another. For example, the opportunity costs borne by the worker who travels to work by bicycling rather than driving his car are the value of the extra time necessary to bicycle and the added risks of collision and injury posed to bicyclists. These costs must be weighed against the ecological and health benefits of bicycling. The opportunity cost is a more formal way of expressing the maxim, "Everything has its price. "

Wealth, of course, increases consumption possibilities and can remove the need to make choices among consumption alternatives. If you are wealthy enough, you can have it all. "The rich are different from us," Ernest Hemingway was claimed to have said once to F. Scott Fitzgerald, "they have money."

Consumers' preferences are revealed through their consumption choices, but the psychology behind the choices is not considered in consumer demand theory. Rather, the choices that people actually make are manifestations of their consumption preferences. After all, who is to know why, say, only one in ten thousand persons is rabid about garlic or why teenagers are wild about music recorded by people who look like bald poodle dogs? The fact that a quantity of an item sells at a certain price is all the information that suppliers need to plan the production and distribution of goods and services. In general, this approach follows the inclination in positive economics to downplay latent beliefs and desires in decision processes and to observe the consequences of acting on those beliefs and desires. *De gustibus est non disputandum*—that is, loosely translated, there is no accounting for taste.

By extension, then, of the general theory of consumer demand for goods, three factors dominate an individual's demand for leisure: (a) the opportunity cost of leisure, measured by an individual's market wage rate; (b) the individual's wealth, often measured by assets and other non-labor income; and (c) preferences of the individual for work over leisure, expressed by showing the range of work/ leisure mixtures that are equally satisfying to the individual (see examples provided by Ehrenberg & Smith, 1988).

The wage earned for every hour worked is the cost of *not* working for an hour. Some people might not have the earning potential necessary to motivate them to choose work over leisure. Work just does not "pay" for these people because they value their leisure time more than the wages they could earn in that time.

The wages that people earn through employment are determined by the value of their human capital offered in the labor market. According to Thurow (1970), human capital is the capacity of individuals to produce goods and services. Investments in human capital are made typically by individuals and society through education, training, health care, and health maintenance.

People form human capital in many forms and ways. However, the value of human capital held by an individual is determined entirely in the market. So, investments in, say, education and training for literacy or, for comparison, in buggy whip manufacturing training

both might produce human capital. However, the stock of human capital produced through investments in acquiring and maintaining literacy skills might demonstrate higher value in the labor market for more people than investments in buggy whip skill development.

Independent of the value of human capital, wealth, or non-labor income, also can determine whether people decide to work and, if they work, how much time they offer to employers. People with non-labor income can purchase goods and services even if they are not working. Non-labor income might take the form of family wealth, assets (such as land or property) that can be sold, or, in the case of the very poor, transfer payments resulting from welfare income received from governments. A transfer payment is income received for which no current or future good or service is required in return.

A person who is thought to be "rich" by common standards really does not need to work to buy goods and services. For example, winners of millions of dollars in lotteries certainly have no need to work to sustain themselves with good and services required for daily living. However, people without wealth of any sort must earn income in some way, and the legal way to earn income is through paid employment.

Preferences for participation in paid employment vary considerably among individuals. Some people might want to earn a lot of income, without spending much time at work. Perhaps this is the type of person who seeks a life characterized by a little fine tuning of a financial portfolio in the morning, followed by golf in the afternoon, and concluded by martinis and dinner to round out the day. Others might prefer high income and are willing to spend a lot of time earning it. Certainly, many entrepreneurs fit into this category. Of course, others, such as public school teachers or members of religious orders who take vows of poverty, might not be as committed to earning high incomes as they are about providing service to others. Accordingly, these people might select occupations that require relatively large amounts of work effort for little pay. And, low income resulting from very little work time might satisfy still other people (as immortalized in Shakespeare's *Under the Greenwood Tree*: "Who doth ambition shun/And loves to live i' the sun/Seeking the food he eats/And pleased with what he gets").

There are several lessons from labor supply theory that are applicable to the study of the complex relationships between literacy and employment. First, literacy is a component of human capital. The primary contribution of literacy to employment is through the influence of literacy on the market wage. Literacy that contributes to job performance and is relatively scarce in the labor market will command relatively high market wages. Yet, literacy is not an unalloyed good. Frustrated by the variability, friability, and generally low level of literacy among job applicants, employers might redesign jobs to reduce literacy inputs required for successful performance. For instance, is reading skill actually required if you include pictures of food items, not numbers, on the keys of a cash register?

The second lesson from labor supply theory is that literacy is not the only factor to consider in the literacy/employment equation. Failure to consider the wealth and preferences for paid employment yields an analysis that is specified incompletely. Also, literacy is not the sole component of human capital. A complete analysis must consider other contributors to human capital beyond literacy. Moreover, literacy never is directly related to employment. Rather, the influence of literacy on the labor supply decision is always indirect through its contribution to human capital and, thereby, the wage rate that an individual can command in the labor market.

Labor supply theory informs the analysis of the relationship between literacy and employment in the following ways:

1. The wage rate must be imputed for all individuals in the analysis, whether they are employed or not. This preliminary analysis typically is done in two stages. First, various factors affecting human capital formation and maintenance are regressed on the hourly wages of employed people. Measures of literacy are included in this ordinary least squares regression. Then, the regression equation established with employed people only is applied to the data from all people, employed or not, to impute a market wage. This imputed market wage rate is a measure of the value of human capital in the labor market, whether working or not.
2. Then, a labor supply equation is estimated. The dependent variable in a labor supply equation is some measure of hours worked over a week or a year. Some people are not working and, therefore, have zero hours worked. Other people exhibit positive work hours because they are employed. The aim of the analysis is to determine the relationship of imputed wage rates, wealth (non-labor income), and preferences for paid employment with (a) the probability of working (having positive work hours) and (b) the number of hours worked, given that that work hours are greater than zero. Hours worked in this analytical formulation is a dependent variable with a limited distribution—that is, is has a lower limit of zero. Tobit analysis (Tobin, 1958) is the choice of regression method when the dependent variable has a limited distribution. Passmore, Ay, Rockel, Wade, and Wise (1983) describe the mathematics of parsing Tobit regression coefficients into the components showing the probability that the variable, hours worked, is greater than zero and hours worked, give non-zero work hours.
3. The indirect effect of literacy on labor supply is calculated from its effect, first, on the wage rate and, then, from the effect of the wage rate on the probability having positive work hours and the number of hours worked, given that work hours are positive.

We are in the early stages of an analysis of the relationship between literacy and labor supply using the theoretical perspective and analytical tools we have described. In the next section of this paper we present some preliminary estimates of the relationship between observed hourly wages and a measure of literacy using data from NLS97, a longitudinal survey of labor market experience of young people in the United States. In this way, we are sharing our exploratory analysis representing item 1 in the three-step process of labor supply analysis that we have delineated in the current section of this paper.

Preliminary Hourly Wage Estimates

Designed to represent U.S. residents who were born between 1980 and 1984, the NLSY97 documents the transition from school to work experienced by 8,984 young people. These young people were selected to represent the noninstitutional population of the U.S. that included persons from 12 years old through 16 years old as of 31 December 1996 (see Moore, Pedlow, Krishnamurty, & Wolter, 2000, for technical sampling details).

The Armed Services Vocational Aptitude Battery (ASVAB) was administered by the National Opinion Research Center to 7,127 NLSY97 sample members (79.3% of total sample) during the summer of 1997 through the spring of 1998 through computer-aided testing. Respondents were paid $75 for their participation in ASVAB testing. Components of the ASVAB include measures of numerical operations, arithmetic reasoning, paragraph

comprehension, and word knowledge, among other aptitudes. Also, extensive information is available on the employment and earnings histories of NLSY97 sample members from 1997 through 2000.

To provide a taste of the type of findings possible with the NLSY97 data, we provide results from the ordinary least squares regression of hourly wages in the NLSY97 respondent's primary job in the survey reference week for 2000 (M = \$6.88; SD = \$2.02) on quartiles of performance on the *Paragraph Comprehension Subtest* (PCS) of the ASVAB. The logarithm of the dependent variable, hourly wages, was applied in this analysis, and, then, findings were translated back to the original wage scale by taking the antilog of the regression coefficients. In addition, respondents whose wages were less than \$1.00/hour or greater than \$15.00/hour were deleted from this analysis to eliminate the possibility of pivotal extreme values skewing our findings.

Three dummy variables were created to describe quartiles of the PCS in this regression. One dummy variable was coded "1" if the respondent performed between the 25th and 49th percentiles in the distribution of PCS scores and "0" otherwise. Another dummy variable was coded "1" if the respondent's score was between the 50th and 74th percentiles and "0" otherwise. Still another dummy variable was coded "1" if the respondent's PCS score was greater than the 74th percentile and "0" otherwise. The reference category for these three dummy variable was the PCS scores below the 25th percentile. In this way, wages for three quartiles of PCS performance are compared with the wages of young people in the lowest quartile of PCS scores. Respondents with data missing about wages or PCS scores were deleted from our analysis, leaving, after all data restrictions were satisfied, 6,039 cases remaining for analysis.

Bypassing a whole series of intermediate results in the interests of conserving space, we found that NLSY97 respondents with PCS scores between the 25th and 49th percentiles earned about 29 cents per hour more than those scoring in the lowest quartile. Also, respondents scoring between the 50th and 74th percentiles and greater than the 74th percentile earned 25 cents and 30 cents more per hour, respectively, than respondents scoring in the lowest PCS quartile.

In this one simple regression of a measure of literacy on wages, a labor market advantage is found among people at higher literacy levels. Many other measures of literacy are available in the NLSY97 data. Also, the modeling of hourly wages rates can be much more sophisticated if other control variables are added as independent variables in the analysis. When the market wage rate is imputed for all NLSY97 respondents, whether working or not, a full labor supply function can be fit.

Concluding Remarks

Labor supply theory offers a strong theoretical guide for the study of literacy/employment relationships. Preliminary estimates obtained using NLSY97 data yield promising results that are encouraging for future analyses that will apply labor supply theory to this problem.

References

Bruening, J. C. (1989). Workplace illiteracy: A threat to worker safety. *Occupational Hazards, 5*(10), 118-122.

Ehrenberg, R. G., & Smith, R. S. (1988). *Modern labor economics: Theory and public policy.* Boston: Scott, Foresman, and Co.

Imel, S. (1989). *Adult literacy issues: An update* (ERIC Digest No. 89). Columbus, OH: The Ohio State University, Center on Education for Employment and Training, ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education.

Johnston, W. B, & Packer, A. E. (1987). *Workforce 2000: Work and workers for the twenty-first century.* Indianapolis, IN: The Hudson Institute.

Killingsworth, M. R. (1983). *Labor supply.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kozol, J. (1986). *Illiterate America.* New York: New American Library.

Moore, W., Pedlow, S., Krishnamurty, P., & Wolter, K. (2000). *National Longitudinal Survey of Youth 1997 (NLSY97): Technical sampling report.* Chicago: National Opinion Research Center.

Passmore, D. L., Ay, U., Rockel, S., Wade, B., & Wise, J. (1983). Health and youth employment. *Applied Economics, 15,* 715-729.

Passmore, D. L., Olsen, N. K., & Wang, D. S. (1989). Labor supply theory and outcomes of technical and vocational education: Toward an evaluation theory. *Journal of Technical and Vocational Education, 6,* 20-36.

Passmore, D. L., & Mohamed, D. A. (1995). Labor force literacy and the economy. *The Journal of Technology Studies, 21*(2), 8-14.

Thurow, L. (1970). *Investment in human capital.* Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Tobin, J. (1958). Estimation of relationships for limited dependent variables. *Econometrica, 26,* 24-36.

U. S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. (2002a). *The National Longitudinal Surveys handbook 2002.* Washington, DC: Author.

U. S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. (2002b). *The National Longitudinal Survey of Youth 1997 event history data, including main data file, rounds 1-4, Release 4.2* [Data file]. Available from the Bureau of Labor Statistics Web site, http://www.bls.gov/nls

---

David L. Passmore, College of Education, The Pennsylvania State University, 305D Keller Building, University Park, PA 16803; (814) 863-2583, (775) 924.5928 (fax); dlp@psu.edu

Chang-Jung Lin, College of Management, Chaoyang University of Technology, Wufeng, Taichung County, Taiwan 413; vic@cyut.edu.tw

Ying-Ni Chen, College of Education, The Pennsylvania State University, 315 Keller Building, University Park, PA 16802; yxc195@psu.edu

Theresa Bevans-Gonzales, Institute for Research in Training & Development, The Pennsylvania State University, 303 Keller Building, University Park, PA 16802; tlb933@psu.edu

Evin Dogan Cebeci, Paterno Library, The Pennsylvania State University, 122 Paterno Library, University Park, PA 16802; exd191@psu.edu

Michael J. Brna, Jr., Mon Valley Renaissance, 250 University Avenue, Box 101, California, PA 15419; brna@cup.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

"From Many, One": An Exploration of Religious Pluralism and the Religious Education of Young Adults

Jeffrey A. Ritchey

Research Question and Methods

This paper is an exploration of *religious pluralism* (the active engagement of diverse, faith-based organizations working toward a common civil society) and how it is incorporated into the educative practice of youth workers from various faith communities in the area surrounding Altoona, PA. Specifically, this work addresses how youth workers from local religious groups engage and explore those faiths different than their own. It is anticipated that this work will inform the creation of a survey instrument (gathering data on the same subject) to be distributed to a larger audience in mid-2003.

Please note that this work is not a comprehensive analysis of the educative practice of all organized religious groups in Altoona. Nor does it seek to state unequivocally how all of Altoona's Catholics, Jews, Muslims, or Protestants feel about other religious faiths or how they educate their young members in their respective traditions. It is, very simply, a beginning—a small window into the educative practice of various faith communities as it relates to young adult members and the diversification of American religious belief. In research terms, this work would comprise the "preliminary exploration" of what is anticipated to be a larger study (Carspecken, 1996, p. 33).

In the education of young adults, "pluralistic" religious discussions have often focused on "defending the faith" rather than on instilling an understanding of religious belief and practice in historical and contextual terms. Instilling a combative frame creates an atmosphere of religious competition that stands in sharp contrast to Eck's vision of cooperative faith-based work (2001). Such pluralistic work inspires critical thinking and social consciousness that is, at its essence, "adult education." As Baptiste explains, "The prefix 'adult' qualifies the educative process by emphasizing the virtues of criticality and social responsibility. In short, adult education seeks to provide persons with the tools and disposition that would increase the frequency with which they act critically and socially responsibly in the world" (Baptiste, 1996, p. 3).

For this work, 13, one-hour, semi-structured interviews were conducted with youth workers (paid and volunteer) as well as with their supervising clergy (if their work was monitored) from various faith traditions: Protestant (5 interviews), Catholic (4 interviews), Jewish (2 interviews), and Muslim (2 interviews). These interviews were audio-taped and transcribed in full, resulting in roughly 230 pages of single-spaced transcript. Conversations were supplemented by tours of the religious facilities utilized for youth activities with attention being paid to their contents as it related to conceptualizations of differing faiths. These data were then examined for dominant themes related to religious pluralism and its role in the spiritual education of young adults.

As to sample selection, this work holds with the "naturalistic inquirer," referred to by Erlandson, Harris, Skipper, and Allen (1993) that "no true generalization is really possible" from research (p. 32). Issues of generalizability are left to the judgment of the reader.

Past Research Review and Critique

Little research has been done which looks at the religious learning of young adults within specific locales or contexts. While much has been written on youth outreach from within the Christian tradition, this material overwhelmingly seeks not so much to encourage readers to "act critically and socially responsibly in the world" but more so to indoctrinate within specific faith traditions.

Furthermore, recent studies in various fields (adult education included), while sensitive to the diversification of the contemporary religious landscape, have clearly sought to distance themselves from institutional religious instruction. These discussions have largely centered on *spirituality* or "one's personal belief and experience of a higher power or higher purpose" (Tisdell, 2000, p. 309). Fuller's (2001) recent work, which attempts to examine "the history and status of unchurched religion in the United States," is an outstanding example of the possibilities this area holds for future study—research that brings to the fore a population that increasingly sees itself as "spiritual but not religious" (p. 1).

Perhaps this research shift away from institutional religion is due to the perceived intransigent moralizing of faith-based groups concerning volatile cultural issues (homosexuality, divorce, abortion, etc.); perhaps it is due to a growing body of research that indicates more Americans are seeking and creating faith outside of and even across religious traditions (Wuthnow, 1998). Regardless, Hick (2001) notes that for the vast majority of people claiming religious belief, their particular conception of faith

> depends in the vast majority of cases on where he or she happens to have been born. Someone born into a devout Muslim family in Egypt or Pakistan or Albania (or for that matter in England) is very likely to grow up as a Muslim. . . . Conversions [to other faiths] are statistically marginal in comparison with the massive transmission of faith from generation to generation within the same religion. (p. 1)

In short, "Formal religion will often play a major role in shaping both the articulated worldviews and underlying patterns of shared meanings and values that make a culture possible" (Marsden, 1990, p. 4) and thus, remains an area worthy of continued exploration.

Altoona, PA: Winter 2002

According to the 1990 census, the City of Altoona, PA has a total population of almost 52,000 (Pennsylvania State Data Center, 1997a). Like many communities in the Commonwealth, Altoona's once vibrant industrial operations (driven by its legendary railroad yards) has shifted somewhat painfully into the service economy. Some 49% of working residents are now employed in sales or services of some kind (Pennsylvania State Data Center, 1997b).

The religious landscape of Altoona continues to be dominated by Christian churches, although the community has a long-standing Jewish presence in the form of both reformed and

conservative congregations. Recent events, however, have strained the relationship of the Jewish and Christian communities. During renovations, a plaque containing the Ten Commandments was removed from City Hall. Interestingly the plaque had been given to the City years earlier by a local Jewish family. The Jewish community voiced its desire to see the plaque relocated to a museum or other space commemorating area history and culture. In response, conservative elements in the Christian community insisted that the plaque be returned to its original spot after renovations are completed.

In addition, the Jewish and Christian communities recently battled over the commencement speech of a student at nearby Hollidaysburg Area High School. The young woman, a conservative Christian, wished to cite Jesus as a prominent figure in her academic success. When the high school's principal requested that the remarks be dropped from the speech, the young lady's parents contacted an attorney and the dilemma received coverage on several national news shows. This resulted in school officials allowing her to give the address, and the Jewish community's formal request that Hollidaysburg High School make future commencement programs inter-faith. If their request is denied, an alternate event for non-Christians will be held elsewhere.

Juxtaposed to these tensions, the aftermath of the September 11th terrorist attacks did much to raise local awareness to the growing Muslim population in the Altoona area. This tragic event led to inter-faith dialogues televised on the community access channel and to the addition by one local radio station of a weekly show highlighting inter-faith discussion.

Judaism

My exploration of Judaism in Altoona was limited to the area's reformed Jewish tradition (repeated telephone calls to representatives of the conservative Jewish community went unanswered). According to the temple's rabbi, Judaism is a faith focused on balance. "The world is gray; . . . faith is gray," he says. "Judaism is a present-tense faith. We are concerned with a constant movement toward righteousness that is centered in the now. You are not obligated to complete this work, neither are you permitted to desist from it."

In Altoona, this balance is also evident in the constant challenge to educate young people in the traditions of their faith while resisting the temptation to create a closed and suspicious community. "Judaism strives for ethics and justice, not domination," the rabbi continues, "we make no effort to 'convert' or 'save' anyone, thus, our focus is on nurturing our young people within a spiritual life."

Faith "is not separated out but is intertwined into Jewish life." Within this reformed temple, such a process takes place in two ways: informally through youth social gatherings and formally through educational programs in Hebrew language and history that are meant to directly connect young people to their pasts. "Our youth group is much like you'd see in a Christian church. It's a social event that usually includes some discussion relevant to our teens' current lives—organizing their time, sexuality, dealing with the opinions of others." Perhaps more importantly, the rabbi is quick to point out that "we stress that there are no right answers. Scripture and commentary inform us, they are not an end in themselves."

The youth program is coordinated by a volunteer while educational activities are directed by the rabbi. Young members are Bar or Bat Mitzvahed at ages 13 and 12 respectively, and confirmed at age 16. "This is a voluntary reaffirmation of Jewish citizenship at a time when members are more mature and more critical in their belief."

The overwhelming question for the leaders at the reformed temple is "how do we maintain our uniqueness and prepare our young people to go out into the world. What strategies of support can we offer?" To that end, the temple's rabbi is highly engaged in community activities and ecumenical dialogues. He is active in the local YWCA's Multicultural Panel (a group of diverse individuals who conduct panel discussions for community organizations on what it is like to be "the other" in Central Pennsylvania) and the area's Ecumenical Conference. "Local Jews repeatedly receive comments denigrating their faith…they are called atheists and routinely told they are going to hell. In working with young people, it is all about forming a Jewish identity that is strong enough to deal with all these challenges. But identity is not formed in isolation—identity if formed in relation to others."

Catholicism

In exploring the Catholic Church in Altoona, my interviews included priests and laity working in various contexts with varying levels of experience. Regardless, the basic template for youth work remained consistent—Catholic school for those that could afford it supported by Sunday Christian education classes for public school students in need of religious instruction.

The priests interviewed for this work come from two parishes—one in an affluent section of the city and the other in an area encompassing the community's poorest neighborhoods. Nevertheless, both priests share three key beliefs: (a) that young people are in search of moral boundaries, (b) that they are in search of leadership, and (c) that they long to be challenged to live lives of character. The means by which these two men do this, however, differs greatly. The priest from the more affluent parish speaks of "integrating kids into the life of the parish." The priest from the less privileged parish speaks of integrating the parish into the larger community. "We need to meet them where they are," he says, "and not insist that they come to us all the time. I challenge my kids to not compartmentalize their lives. Every day when they wake up, they wake up a child of God and they must live that reality in school and at home—not just in church." One of the primary ways this group has met kids "where they are" is through the creation of a rock-and-roll band. "I'm really a rock musician who wears a collar," he insists. "That ministry has been very ecumenical. We'll go anywhere and play for anyone. And we don't preach—our message is in the music and we hope people like what they hear."

In the more affluent congregation we see an almost complete reversal of focus. "Kids want a meaningful set of boundaries," the priest says, "a consistent set of values. Our parochial schools can provide that as can our church. We are here to nurture a tradition."

While both priests speak of the importance of ecumenical and inter-faith work, neither does much in either area. "We have 540 families in our parish. Frankly, I have enough to keep me busy right here" states one. "Our activities, other than the band, are fundamentally Christian" states the other.

Islam

The Islamic Center of Central Pennsylvania is based in a medium-sized, single story building on a busy road at the edge of Altoona. Twenty-five families participate in the Center's weekly services. "We are all first generation American Muslims," says the Center's president, "the test of our success will be our children. Will our children be faithful?"

In the aftermath of the September 11th terrorist attacks, the Muslim community in Altoona, under the leadership of the Center's president, began a rigorous process of educating the community as to Islamic belief and culture. Editorials in the local newspaper, participation in Altoona's Ecumenical Conference, televised inter-faith dialogues and public presentations have all done much to enhance the group's reputation even within the most conservative evangelical churches. "Our faith is very simple. We believe in one God—the God of Abraham. We follow the rules as they have been handed down through the prophets, including no alcohol, no drugs, no gambling, no pre-marital sex. We contribute to the poor. We pray five times each day. We follow Jesus more closely than most Christians."

Indeed, the Muslim people at the Center are most inviting and anxious for others to understand their faith. They are, however, insistent that you adhere to their customs while interacting with them. "Faith is not about convenience," he says. "There are rules and we obey them—all the time, no exceptions." Nevertheless, the Center regularly hosts non-Muslims at weekend prayer services and other gatherings. On one weekend I visited, two van loads of men and women arrived from a nearby Quaker congregation. "We love when people visit," he said.

The education of young people in the Muslim tradition is primarily and fundamentally the responsibility of the parents. "If a young person learns to say their prayers, if they learn the names of the prophets, if they learn how to ritual bath and how to respect their husband, wife and kids, they learn this from their parents. The mosque is not where you will learn this best—it is in the home." The Center has no youth group; indeed, upon reaching adolescence, young people are not permitted to interact in ways common to most Christian churches. "Our activities are family activities," he continues. "We play volleyball and have picnics, but the family comes, not just the kids."

Protestantism

In examining Protestant young adult religious education, interviews were conducted with both clergy and laity from mainline and independent congregations. The overall structure of the youth programs remained consistent in both groups. Programs consisted mainly of recreation/ social time followed by a brief Bible lesson, discussion and prayer. All churches also offered traditional Sunday school programs for junior and senior high students. In addition, all of the groups participated at some level in local service projects; nevertheless, these remained minimal with an average of perhaps two per year.

However, while Protestant youth programs evidenced great consistency in size and structure they divided sharply on intent. Mainline denominations differed sharply from their independent counterparts in several key areas. First is the area of inclusiveness. Youth leaders at independent churches indicated a need to "disciple kids" and to keep them from the "unsound doctrine" not only of other faiths but of other Christian denominations. "I think we've been secondary-sourced to death," said one pastor. "For our program, we rely almost exclusively on the Bible and what it is saying to our specific group of kids." Another youth leader noted his belief that proper thinking required the church to serve as a filter for contemporary culture. "We don't do much with other churches in the area," he noted. "I find that activities like that just tend to confuse our kids at a time when they need something solid to stand on. We do go to some rallies and concerts but only if I know what the message will be."

The clergy and staff at mainline churches differed sharply on their approach. One pastor has organized concerts by local punk, ska and rock-and-roll bands. These events regularly draw

over 100 young people. "We used to advertise them as 'Christian concerts.' But then we realized that this might put some kids off. What we really want to do is offer kids a safe, non-threatening place to be kids. We want to love them first-and-foremost. There's no preaching, no prayer, no Bible reading." Says another, "Kids have real problems and real questions—and the world's not as black-and-white as some would have you believe. It's about struggle and the comfort in knowing that we're all struggling. If you're not, you're probably not thinking much!"

Conclusions

"One thing I have learned in over 30 years of working with people," said one study participant. "Whatever you don't give people, somebody else will. Unfortunately, as people of God, our cultural differences—our differing traditions and histories—have separated us to the point where we often can't connect on a spiritual level. We become suspicious of other groups, even hateful. It's very damaging."

This comment hints at the ultimate intent of this study—to begin "building bridges" between local faith communities so that they might connect on a spiritual level and live out the socially constructive principles at the heart of their faiths. Nevertheless, this exploration reveals that little of this work is being conducted with young adults in mind. Indeed, within the Jewish, Muslim and Christian communities included in this study, indoctrination and assimilation remains the dominant vision for "youth ministry." While several programs evidence an interest in creating greater tolerance for religious difference among their young members, none have taken the additional step of creating programs that educate their young people as to other faith traditions. Nor have they substantively promoted any inter-faith interaction between their respective groups.

References

Baptiste, I., & Heaney, T. (1996, October). The *political construction of adult education*. Paper presented at the Midwest Research-to-Practice Conference in Adult, Continuing, and Community Education, University of Nebraska-Lincoln. Retrieved January 13, 2003, from http://www.nl.edu/ace/Resources/Documents/Construction.html

Carspecken, P. F. (1996). *Critical ethnography in educational research: A theoretical and practical guide*. New York: Routledge.

Eck, D. L. (2001). *A new religious America: How a "Christian Country" has now become the world's most religiously diverse nation*. New York: HarperCollins.

Erlandson, D. A., Harris, E. L., Skipper, B. L., & Allen, S. D. (1993). *Doing naturalistic inquiry: A guide to methods*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Fuller, R. C. (2001). *Spiritual but not religious: Understanding unchurched America*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Hick, J. (2001). *Is Christianity the only true religion, or one among others?* Paper presented to the Theological Society, Norwich, England.

Marsden, G. (1990). *Religion and American culture*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich.

Pennsylvania State Data Center (1997a). *Municipal demographic profile. Census of Population and Housing*. Retrieved January 13, 2003 from http://pasdc.hbg.psu.edu/pasdc/mcd_profiles/c013/m010/stf1_profile.html

Pennsylvania State Data Center (1997b). *Municipal demographic profile. Census of Population and Housing*. Retrieved January 13, 2003 from http://pasdc.hbg.psu.edu/pasdc/mcd_profiles/c013/m010/stf3_profile.html

Tisdell, E. (2000). Spirituality and emancipatory adult education in women adult educators for social change. *Adult Education Quarterly, 50*, 308-335.

Wuthnow, R. (1998). *After heaven: Spirituality in America since the 1950s*. Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Dr. Jeff Ritchey is Director of Youth Ministries at the First United Methodist Church of Hollidaysburg, PA, and Adjunct Assistant Professor of Adult Education at the Pennsylvania State University. He can be reached at jar9@psu.edu or jritchey@hollidaysburgumc.org

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Factors Deterring Adult Undergraduate Students from Participation in Study Abroad

Robert W. Surridge

Abstract: To identify and measure deterrents to adult student participation in study abroad programs the researcher developed the 34 item Likert-type Deterrents to Adult Student Participation in Study Abroad Scale (DAPSAS). The scale was administered as part of a mail survey of adult undergraduate students at Penn State Harrisburg. The study findings indicate that adult undergraduate students at Penn State Harrisburg are deterred from participation in study abroad due to the factors of Multicultural Indifference, Institutional Shortcomings, Family Responsibilities, and Financial Considerations. The factor that was found to be the most discouraging to students is Multicultural Indifference (i.e., indifference to living in and learning about another culture).

Background and Study Purpose

Both general interest and participation in study abroad programs at U.S. colleges and universities are growing. At Penn State University the number of students earning academic credit by engaging in study abroad experiences is increasing. In academic year 1991-1992 581 Penn State students participated in a study abroad program (Laubscher, 1994). Ten years later the number increased by over 61%, to 946 students (J. Keller, personal communication, January 13, 2003).

Increased participation in study abroad at Penn State responds to the strategic direction set by Penn State's International Council, which is an advisory body to the University's Executive Vice President and Provost. In 1994 the International Council recommended that Penn State set a goal "to provide international experiences through study abroad for twenty percent of each undergraduate graduating class" (International Council, 1994, p. 1).

Faculty and administrators at the Penn State Harrisburg campus, which is primarily an upper-division campus and graduate center, share the interests and objectives of the University's International Council. However, from 1987 to 1997 only nine Penn State Harrisburg students participated in a study abroad program. To serve better its undergraduate students, in 1998 Penn State Harrisburg established an Office of International Programs. The mission of this office is to address the University's objective of internationalizing by dramatically increasing the number of Penn State Harrisburg students, faculty, staff, and community constituents participating in significant international and/or intercultural learning experiences.

To accomplish this mission, it was determined that simply duplicating the study abroad program marketing strategies utilized by Office of Education Abroad at the University Park campus would not be overly effective for Penn State Harrisburg. Penn State students currently participating in study abroad are mostly traditional full-time students. The former director of the Office of Education Abroad at University Park estimated that more than 95% of the participants are full-time students between the ages of 18 and 23 years (M. R. Laubscher, personal communication, November 4, 1998). At Penn State Harrisburg-the median age of undergraduate

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

students is 24 years and it is estimated that more than 40% of the students work full-time (T. Streveler, personal communication, September 9, 1998).

The adult students at Penn State Harrisburg should not be excluded from an educational opportunity as significant as international education through study abroad. Given this imperative, and realizing the paucity of literature and studies regarding adult students and study abroad, this applied research study was initiated. The purpose of this study, therefore, is to identify and analyze the factors that deter adult undergraduate students at Penn State Harrisburg from participation in study abroad. With this information as a guide, faculty and professional staff can improve their efforts to increase the number of adult students participating in study abroad programs at Penn State Harrisburg.

Conceptual Framework and Study Purpose

The study attempts to contribute to theory building in the area of adult education participation through constructing and piloting a scale that measures deterrents to adult student participation in study abroad. The study is based on the assumption that there is an underlying structure to the several reasons given by adult students for not participating in study abroad. Specifically, the study assumes that participation in study abroad is a function of institutional factors, such as course offerings and accommodations, personal factors such as time and language ability, and the student's disposition regarding study abroad. As suggested by Darkenwald and Valentine (1985), this study utilizes a deterrent to participation scale to identify and measure deterrents to participation within a specific population. The design of the current study follows a similar process to address the question of identifying deterrents to participation in study abroad faced by adult students at Penn State Harrisburg.

Related Research

Deterrents to Adult Participation in Education Programs

In adult education literature, a great deal of attention is afforded to the factors that discourage adults from participating in purposive educational activities. Several adult education researchers placed understanding of participation as a pivotal concern of adult education in application situations including program planning, marketing, recruitment, retention and administration (Courtney, 1992; Cross, 1981; Henry, 1994). In addition, the idea of deterrents to participation contributes to theoretical formulations of participation in adult education (Cross, 1981; Rubenson, 1977).

The terms situational, institutional, and dispositional are frequently used to categorize deterrents to adult education (Cross, 1981; Henry, 1994). Cross (1981) and Valentine and Darkenwald (1990) note specifically that their analysis of the participation studies validate this conceptual framework of deterrents to adult education.

Darkenwald and Hayes (1988) and others (Hayes & Darkenwald, 1990; Martindale, 1989), while identifying similar categories of deterrents, also suggest that non-participation is the result of interaction among various deterrents. In addition, Darkenwald and Valentine (1990) note that the practical importance of identifying lists of deterrents to participation is not clear. They ask what does the program planner do with such lists, except to know that there are certain factors that impede participation in adult education.

To address the issue of deterrent interaction, Valentine and Darkenwald (1990) developed a multivariate categorization of adult non-participants. They based their analysis on an earlier study (Darkenwald & Valentine, 1985) that identified factors that are deterrents to participation. Using the same data base that generated the deterrent factors, they found that people clustered into groups with respect to non-participation. Valentine and Darkenwald (1990) argue that practitioners who use this methodology to identify categories of non-participants could realistically develop strategies to hurdle deterrents to participation.

Participation in Study Abroad

There are several accounts of the characteristics of students who participate in study abroad programs (Council on International Educational Exchange [CIEE], 1988; King & Young, 1994; Szekely & Krane, 1997). Based on these sources, it is possible to state that the students who study abroad are from a narrow spectrum of the population on college and university campuses.

In this narrow spectrum the students who study abroad are proportionately more likely to be Caucasian, from middle-income to upper-income families and enrolled in majors in the liberal arts and foreign languages. Males are under-represented and proportionately there are too few students in science, engineering, and professional fields. Minorities, part-time or working students and members of lower income groups are under-represented. For example, nationally, two out of three students who study abroad are women (Szekely & Krane, 1997), but minority women and older women students do not participate at the same

Michigan State University (MSU) is a perennial leader among U.S. institutions in the number of students it sends abroad (Davis, 1998). In 1993 MSU conducted a study of its study abroad participants. It found that 67% of the participants were female; nearly 40% were either liberal arts or science majors. Eighty-three percent of the MSU students were white, but over 90% of the study abroad students were white. The MSU researchers took their analysis a step further and identified predictor variables of the probability of participating in study abroad. The results of this analysis revealed two variables that significantly influenced the probability of participating in study abroad were (a) being female and (b) not being an African American. While, the MSU study did not address the age of the participants, it is apparent that the students who enroll in study abroad programs are not representative of the overall student body.

Methodology

To identify and measure deterrents to participation in study abroad a 34-item, Likert-type Deterrents to Adult Student Participation in Study Abroad Scale (DAPSAS) was developed and distributed as the major section of a self-administered mail questionnaire to adult students at Penn State Harrisburg. The DAPSAS was assembled by identifying 34 discrete deterrents to participation found in the literature review and/or student interviews and/or interviews of the study abroad administrators. Measuring respondents' perceptions of the amount of influence of each deterrent item was accomplished by means of a ten point rating scale. For each DAPSAS item, respondents were asked to indicate, on a scale of 1 to 10, how influential each variable was in their decision to participate or not to participate in a study abroad program. Using this response technique, the scores are responsive to standard data analysis procedures (Nunnally, 1978).

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The study population was 1,144 Penn State Harrisburg undergraduate students 25 years of age or older who enrolled in undergraduate classes in the Fall of 1999. Using standard survey research procedures resulted in a 55.6% (636 students) response rate to the survey. The overall study addressed three major research questions: (a) What relative degree of influence is ascribed by Penn State Harrisburg adult undergraduate students to the variables perceived as deterring them from participation in a study abroad program? (b) Does a theoretically meaningful factor pattern characterize the set of items constituting the DAPSAS? (c) Do significant differences in mean deterrent factor scores exist among selected demographic and environmental categories of respondents? The DAPSAS reliability coefficient was .9208.

Findings

An exploratory factor analytic design was used to determine that adult undergraduate students are deterred from participation in study abroad due to the factors of (a) Multicultural Indifference, (b) Institutional Shortcomings, (c) Family Responsibilities, and (d) Financial Considerations. In total seven factors accounted for 61.66% of the total scale variance. All seven factors had an eigenvalue greater than one and, therefore, met the criteria for inclusion. However, the four-factor solution was selected as the most theoretically comprehensible representation of the data. The four factor solution accounted for 50.7% of the total variance and 82.2% of the variance explained in the initial solution. Following generally accepted practice (Nunnally, 1978), variables with factor loading greater than or equal to .40 were used to define each of the factors.

There were fourteen variables with loading greater than .40 that comprised the first factor. The five variables with the highest loading (>.662) were "lack of interest in other cultures," "study abroad locations are not interesting," "study abroad courses are not quality," "fear of discrimination," and "fear of danger." The emergence of a factor that represents student's negative disposition toward study abroad is not surprising. Creating positive student perceptions about international and multicultural activities is believed by many study abroad supporters to be the essence of the study abroad experience (American Association of State College and Universities [AASCU], 1983; Cassell & Cassell, 1987; CIEE, 1990; Goodwin & Nacht, 1988). Negative or ambivalent attitudes about other people and other cultures are attitudes common to individuals who do not understand or value multiculturalism (Cross, Bazron, Dennis, & Isaacs, 1989). Based on this interpretation, this factor was labeled Multicultural Indifference.

Thirteen variables comprised the factor labeled Institutional Shortcomings. The five variables with the highest loading (> .682) were "lack of faculty encouragement," "lack of information," "lack of a loan to study abroad," "lack of a scholarship to study abroad," and "lack of advisor encouragement." Consistent with findings of previous studies, many institutional policies and procedures for study abroad programs are not meeting the expectations of student respondents (AASCU, 1983; CIEE, 1988; Kashlak & Jones, 1996). Indeed, Penn State's International Council reported that there are many Penn State rules and regulations that constrain participation in study abroad (PSU, 1994).

In the third factor four of the five variables that have loadings greater than .400 are based on the family and home responsibilities of the undergraduate student. These variables included "leaving family to study abroad," "time away from home," "need childcare," and "lack of family encouragement." A factor of this nature was not unexpected and similar to other adult student

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

populations where respondents indicated the need to balance their academic pursuits with other adult roles, such as parenting (Hayes & Flannery, 2000). Based on these considerations this factor was labeled the "Family Responsibilities" factor.

Like Factor III, the fourth factor is comprised of situational deterrents to participation in study abroad. The fourth factor is identified by three variables all with loadings greater than .500. The variables are "lose income to participate," "having to leave work to participate," and "more important things to spend money on." This factor is labeled the Financial Considerations factor. It is noteworthy that the "cost of study abroad" is an Institutional Shortcomings factor and not a Financial Considerations factor. However, this construct is not without precedent. In the study abroad literature, for example, there are a number of reports in which administrators and faculty identify the cost of study abroad as an institutional deterrent to participation (AASCU, 1983; CIEE, 1988, 1990; Goodwin & Nacht, 1988). In the traditional adult education view, on the other hand, cost is usually considered a situational variable, which often competes with "lack of time" as the primary deterrent to adult participation in education (Cross, 1981).

Discussion

The four factors identified in this study fit the conceptual and empirical construct of deterrents to participation found in the adult education literature. Within the four factors, each of the three categories of deterrents (i.e., situational, institutional, and dispositional) found in the adult education literature is readily recognizable (Cross, 1981; Darkenwald & Valentine. 1985; Martindale & Drake, 1989; Scanlan, 1982). The factor Multicultural Indifference, is mainly comprised of dispositional reasons caused by internal beliefs, fears, and doubts that students have about themselves and the study abroad experience. The Institutional Shortcomings factor is comprised of student reactions to the institutional policies, practices, and procedures that students perceive as obstacles to participation in study abroad. The factors Family Responsibilities and Financial Considerations are comprised of reasons not to participate because of the respondent's current life situation.

The dispositional Multicultural Indifference factor emerged as the factor that explained the greatest amount of the variance in the student ranking of reasons not to participate in study abroad. This finding clearly illustrates that the underlying structure of deterrents to adult participation in study abroad is very complex and includes much more than the cost and time constraints faced by adult students.

Conclusion

Study abroad is an important form of multicultural education that is highly valued because it helps students understand diversity and develops the student's ability to live and work in multicultural environments. This study found that Penn State Harrisburg adult undergraduate students are deterred from participation in study abroad due to a range of complex factors. In 2001 the Chronicle of Higher Education reported that 25.8% of all undergraduate students in the country are age 25 and older ("Almanac Issue," 2001). These adult students are underrepresented in study abroad programs. To address this disparity, this study suggests that study abroad planners consider the complex nature of the dispositional, situational, and institutional factors that deter students from participation in study abroad. For example, providing financial incentives such as loans and scholarships to increase adult student

participation may not be the best use of institutional resources. Resources might be better placed in support of activities that increase the adult student's level of multicultural understanding and vision.

Because of the limited population of this study, generalizations should not be made to other student populations. It is hoped, however, that this study and its findings may serve as a stepping stone leading to increased adult student participation in study abroad.

References

Almanac issue 2001-2002. (2001). *The Chronicle of Higher Education, 48*(1).

American Association of State College and Universities. (1983). *Internationalizing the curriculum and the campus.* Washington, DC: Author.

Council on International Educational Exchange. (1988). *Educating for global competence: The report of the Advisory Council for International Educational Exchange.* New York: Author.

Council on International Educational Exchange. (1990). *A national mandate for education abroad: Getting on with the task. Report of the national task force on undergraduate education abroad.* New York: Author. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED331340)

Cassell, W. C., & Cassel, J. T. (1987). A small college opens a window to the world. *Educational Record, 68*(2), 12-16.

Courtney, S. (1992). *Why adults learn: Towards a theory of participation in adult education.* London: Routledge.

Cross, P. K. (1981). *Adults as learners: Increasing participation and facilitating learning.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Cross, T., Bazron, B., Dennis, K. W., & Isaacs, M. R. (1989). *Towards a culturally competent system of care, Vol. 1.* Washington, DC: Georgetown University Child Development Center, CASSP Technical Assistance Center.

Darkenwald, G. G., & Hayes, E. R. (1988). Assessment of adult attitudes towards continuing education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 7*, 197-204.

Darkenwald, G. G., & Valentine, T. (1985). Factor structure of deterrents to public participation in adult education. *Adult Education Quarterly, 35*, 177-193.

Davis, T. M. (Ed.). (1998). *Open doors 1997-98: Report on international education exchange.* New York: Institute on International Education.

Goodwin, C. D., & Nacht, M. (1988). *Abroad and beyond: Patterns in American overseas education.* New Rochelle, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Hayes, E. R., & Darkenwald, G. G. (1990). Attitudes toward adult education: An empirically-based conceptualization. *Adult Education Quarterly, 40*, 158-168.

Hayes, E., & Flannery, D. D. (with Brooks, A. K., Tisdell, E. J., & Hugo, J. M.). (2000). *Women as learners: The significance of gender in adult learning.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Henry, G. T., & Basille, K. C. (1994). Understanding the decision to participate in formal adult education. *Adult Education Quarterly, 44*(2), 64-82.

International Council, The Pennsylvania State University. (1994). *University-wide strategic plan for international education at The Pennsylvania State University.* University Park, PA: Author.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Kashlak, R. J., & Jones, R. M. (1996). Internationalizing business education: Factors affecting student participation in overseas study programs. *Journal of Teaching in International Business*, *8*(2), 57-75.

King, L. J., & Young, J. A. (1994). Study abroad: Education for the 21st century. *Unterrichtspraxis, 27*(1), 77-87.

Laubscher, M. R. (1994). *Encounters with difference: Student perceptions of the role of out-of-class experiences in education abroad.* Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.

Martindale, C. J., & Drake, J. B. (1989). Factor structure of deterrents to participation in off-duty adult education programs. *Adult Education Quarterly*, *39*, 63-75.

Nunnally, J. C. (1978). *Psychometric theory* (2nd ed.). New York: McGraw Hill.

Rubenson, K. (1977). *Participation in recurrent education: A research review.* Paris: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, Center for Educational Research and Innovation.

Szekely, B. B., & Krane, M. (1997). The current demographics of study abroad. In W. Hoffa & J. Pearson (Eds.), *NAFSA's guide to education abroad: For advisers and administrators* (pp. 143-164). Washington, DC: NAFSA Association of International Educators.

Valentine, T., & Darkenwald, G. G. (1990). Deterrents to participation in adult education: Profiles of potential learners. *Adult Education Quarterly*, *41*, 29-42.

Robert Surridge, The Pennsylvania State University; surridge113@earthlink.net

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

Making Meaning of Nonformal Education in State and Local Parks

Edward W. Taylor

Abstract: The purpose of this study was to investigate how practicing park educators make meaning of nonformal education in local natural settings. Findings reveal that nonformal education, is much more complex than what is purported in the literature. Three broad insights are offered, they include that of roles and responsibilities of the nonformal educator, various approaches, and conceptions and characteristics of nonformal education. The implications are significant for training future nonformal educators in local and state parks.

Introduction

Nonformal education refers to "any organized, systematic, education activity carried on outside the framework of the formal system to provide selected types of learning to particular subgroups in the population, adults as well as children" (Coombs & Ahmed, 1974, p. 7). Often associated with international development programs (Bock & Papgiannis, 1983; Ewert, 1989; Jarvis, 2001), an area a nonformal education that has received little attention in the field is local cultural (e.g., museums), historical (e.g., battlefields), and natural (e.g., parks) settings. In addition, these nonformal education experiences pose a variety of challenges often not found to such degree in formal educational settings. For example, participants can usually arrive and leave at their choosing; there is generally a wide variety of abilities and age-range among participants; there are constant environmental distractions particularly in outdoor education settings; and educational personnel are often hired to teach for their content expertise and have had little systematic teaching training and preparation.

Nonformal education generally refers to settings and methods that are considered nontraditional and where the learner controls the learning objectives, but not the means to accomplish them. Other characteristics include non-bureaucratic setting (Jarvis, 1987; Tight, 1996), process oriented, innovative (Ewert, 1989; Watkins & Marsick, 1990), non-hierarchical teacher/student relationship, and a responsiveness to localized needs (Merriam & Caffarella, 1999; Reed & Loughran, 1984). Despite this understanding, much of which is anecdotally-based, little is offered in the literature empirically to assist our understanding of how nonformal adult educator make meaning of their practice in these local cultural, natural, or historical settings. In particular, there is a lack of understanding regarding discussion that characterize nonformal education as having "its own standards of control" (Courtenay, 1989, p. 19) or having unspecified "covert, procedures of interaction" (Jarvis, 1987, p. 70) found in nonformal education.

One approach to better understanding the implicit and everyday experience of nonformal adult education is to begin with the nonformal educator. More specifically, it means exploring questions such as: What is nonformal education from the perspective of those that practice it? What is the role of the nonformal educator in practice? What expectations do they have for their

participants/learners? How do they understand learning in the nonformal setting? How does nonformal context shape their practice?

An ideal nonformal educational site for exploring these questions as well as others is in outdoor education. Outdoor education shares many of the characteristics found in nonformal educational experiences (Gair, 1997; Miles & Priest, 1999). Of particular relevancy, are the environmental nonformal educational programs offered by the local and state parks. The local and state parks are cultural institutions that play a significant role in society teaching adults about our natural resources and the care taking of our environment (Carr, 1991). In 1991 over 290 million people visited the various units of the state and national parks. During these visits, many adults meet a park interpreter and participate in nonformal environmental educational programs, such as a trail tour of the local park vegetation and wildlife, a discussion on land management practices, or hands-on exploration about the geology in the park. All of these park activities pose similar educational challenges to what was described earlier about nonformal learning and teaching experiences. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to investigate how practicing adult educators make meaning of nonformal education in these local natural settings.

This study is significant several ways, because it provides the opportunity to investigate a number of interrelated phenomena that have been given minimal attention in the field of adult education. First, it offers the opportunity to investigate the practice of adult educators in a setting that is quite prevalent, but one of the least researched, that of nonformal education in natural settings. Second, this research begins a process of investigating an area that is receiving ever increasing attention by the general population, that of education in the outdoors. As attendance in outdoor recreational activities continues to grow it becomes increasingly important to understand how these activities manifest themselves as nonformal educational experiences, particularly from the perspective of the outdoor educator. Third, this investigation can contribute to a better understanding of the educational role of park interpreter with the implication of helping improve their approach to environmental education for the public.

Methodology

The methodological design involved an interpretive qualitative orientation (Merriam, 1998) inclusive of a purposeful sample of 14 practicing state and local park educators (Northeastern United States) who regularly lead nonformal educational activities (e.g., interpretive hikes, bird walks, wildlife treks). Most of the participants worked seasonally or full-time for the park as a naturalists or environmental educators, although, there were a few volunteers among the participants who led regular park outdoor activities. These nonformal activities all met the following criteria, they were: delivered outdoors at a natural park, had voluntary participation, open to the general public, offered as a stand alone session, and included adult age participants. The selection of park educators was limited to those who work in natural settings and did not include those who work at historical parks (e.g., Gettysburg, Washington Monument). The participants were drawn from conveniently located state and local parks near central Pennsylvania. The primary methods of data collection were semi-structured interviews, accompanied by a photo-elicitation technique. Photo-elicitation or photo-interviewing is the use of photographs or video recordings to stimulate the interview process, assisting the participant in the expression of their understanding about their practice. This technique is used with "the express aim of exploring participants' values, beliefs, attitudes, and meanings and in order to trigger memories, or to explore group dynamics or systems" (Prosser, 1998, p. 124). To initiate

this process each participant was video-recorded (roughly 30 minutes) while leading an environmental educational experience at a state or local park. Following the video session a semi-structured interview (60 to 90 minutes) was arranged with the participant. The video elicitation interview began like most semi-structured interviews, with a collection of basic demographic and background information. Modeling a process carried out in similar studies (Dirkx & Taylor, 2002; Taylor & Dirkx, 2002) involving adult educators, the recording of the observation was played back during the interview on a portable computer and questions were raised about the participants' conceptions and interpretation of their nonformal educational practice. Each interview was then transcribed and analyzed using a constant comparative method (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). Through comparative analysis, data is separated from the original transcript, in order to view the data in its unique form, bracketing and identifying its essential elements. The findings are then organized into categories and themes using a graphic organizer to display dominant themes. Furthermore, to enhance the trustworthiness of the findings follow-up interviews were conducted as member checks as apart of the data analysis.

Findings

The findings of this study were arranged thematically, resulting in eight themes outlining how the nonformal educator made meaning of their practice in local and state parks. The first three themes describe their role and responsibilities: Jack-of-all-trades, comforter, and assessor. The second group of themes offers insight into the park educator's approach to teaching and learning: an appreciation of difference, hands-on, and knowledge as external to the learner. The last two themes focus on inherent conceptions of nonformal education held by the park educator, usually in comparison to formal education. Each theme is discussed below with data provided for support from the interviews.

Jack-of-All-Trades

Most of the participants in this study saw themselves as generalist, not experts in these nonformal environmental educational settings. They felt the need to be knowledgeable in a variety of areas, but with little specialization. For example, BJ stated, while viewing a video of a nature walk he led, "I feel like I'm sort of a jack of all trades but a master of none. . . . You have to have a little bit of knowledge in every aspect or area—trees, wild flowers, insects, birds, mammals, reptiles, amphibians—but you really don't have time to specialize." RS further confirms this non-expert role by stating, "I don't think in our job, being a park naturalist, that you're an expert in anything. I think you're a generalist. . . . You don't know everything; . . . that's who we are. We're not these experts."

Comforter

A second finding of the park educator's role was the essentiality of reducing fear and promoting comfort among the participants. This was important not only for helping establish a relationship during the educational activity, but also to help the audience feel safe in an environment many were not familiar with. For example, RS saw part of her role as: "Trying to develop some kind of relationship with them, making them feel more comfortable with me, me being more comfortable with them. Building a little bit of rapport with them." HJ took the role of promoting comfort even further and saw it as essential for interacting with the environment. She stated: "People that aren't going to interact with nature aren't going to feel comfortable with

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

it. . . . So the main thing is being comfortable outside, . . . and the more they know, the more comfortable they feel."

Assessor

A third significant characteristic that seems unique to the nonformal setting is the emphasis placed by the nonformal educator on assessing their audience. This was a strong finding which participants saw not only as a means to understand what their audience needed, but as a means to foster a sense of engagement with them. For example, BH describes her approach as she initially meets her audience prior to a "bat walk." She states: "I make sure I have my objectives in there that are important from an educational standpoint, but I try to assess the audience, not only to keep them involved, but to find out where they are and what they know." BR takes this idea of assessing even further and demonstrates its importance in facilitating a connection with the audience. He states "By engaging the audience, you find out what people know so if they know a whole lot. . . . If they don't know much at all, or have a lot of misconceptions, . . . then you can address that. It's also part of what keeps people connected and interested in what you're talking about and getting information back from them. It's sort of like, "Oh, this leader is interested in what I know."

An Appreciation of Individual Differences

The fourth finding that seems to emerge naturally as a result of the previous finding is an appreciation for difference among participant in how they learn. It seems a logical outcome that by placing a high degree of emphasis on getting to know their audience, nonformal educators in this setting would develop a recognition of differences in learning among the members of their audience. For example, BR, spoke to how "people learn different ways," and PA, a park volunteer, stated it was important to know "how to impart knowledge or a skill, in a way that the learner can accept it, and knowing that people learn different ways."

Doing/Hands-on

Despite this emphasis on an appreciation of individual learning differences, there is a preference by nonformal educators in this particular setting for an experiential active hands-on approach to teaching. For example, WD, an environmental educator, states while watching himself on video leading a bird walk: "I think hands-on activity is one of the best way that people learn, actually doing things. There's different learning styles and different ways that people learn, but being involved and doing hands-on activities seems to make a connection." Also, this preference is further confirmed by BJ. He states: "If you do something that the people can actually participate in rather than just listening, if they can become an active participant in something, I think their experience is much better and they will tend to learn a little more."

Knowledge seen as external to the learner

A sixth finding offers insight into the epistemological views of the nonformal educator. Most participants conceptualized knowledge separate from the learner, something that is traditionally transferred from the educator to the audience. For example, KS describes her role as "conveying my knowledge to people who are interested in that particular topic. . . . It's people who want knowledge on a particular topic show up at a program. . . . Basically I just try to think of what kind of information they're looking for and, and present that information to them." This emphasis on the external nature of knowledge is further highlighted in how many of the

nonformal educators' prepare and plan for an upcoming educational activity. LS's efforts are strongly content driven, ensuring she has the proper knowledge for the task at hand. She states while viewing a video of a nature walk she led: "For this particular walk, I do a lot of research at night, so I've read and throughout all different kind of programs, whenever somebody would ask me a question, if I didn't have the answer, I'd go look it up, and then I'd read a little bit further than that in case the next question was a little bit more advanced."

Nonformal vs. Formal

The final two categories focus on the how the participants in the study conceptualize nonformal education. Interestingly, the participants make a distinction between what they do on the interpretive walks and what happens in a formal education setting. There were a variety of descriptive words used by the participants, such as "fun," "impromptu," "voluntary," that characterize nonformal education in this setting as different from what happens in a formal setting. For example, PA describes a scene from the video where children on a hike were playing carelessly on a bridge. She states: "That doesn't often happen in a classroom, and you have to pay attention to make sure that no kids fall in the creek." BJ makes the distinction in reference to the kind of content that is covered. He states: "With interpretive programs, you're more or less interpreting what you see. You aren't dealing with as heavy duty of concepts. Environmental education programs, you might be talking about certain concepts like predator/prey relationships."

Learning Without Knowing

An eight finding offers insight into perceptions held by nonformal educators about their participants. Although, not a strong finding, several felt their audience participated in an outdoor activity primarily for the experience in of itself and were unaware that they could be learning something. For example, PA talks about her participants: "I'm helping somebody discover it. That might be why I ask questions sometimes, 'Do you know what this is?' so that the learner might be learning without even realizing that they're learning." Similarly, BR sees participants learning occurring outside their conscious awareness. She states: "They'll learn without knowing they're learning."

Discussion and Implications

The findings of this study are quite significant as they reflect a much more complex conception of nonformal education than what is purported in the literature. It appears that nonformal education in an outdoor setting is shaped and influenced by a number of factors not found to the degree in more formal settings. First, there seems to be a shared set of understandings and practices about nonformal environmental education. In essence, there is an explicit "community of practice" (Wenger, 1998, p. 85) unique to this context. This is a practice that is strongly influenced by its learning environment, with an emphasis on individual difference, hands-on learning, and ensuring a sense of comfort and safety. This seems to imply that each nonformal setting needs to be explored within its own context, recognizing that each possibly has its own unique conceptions of practice. Secondly, is the influence of time in nonformal education, a concept that has been inadequately explored. Park educators have little time, since most will see their participants only once and for a short period. This lack of time would explain the high degree of emphasis by the park educator on assessing their participants,

not only to understand their needs, but also to establish some semblance of a relationship early on in the activity. More research is needed in how nonformal educators conceptualize time and the influence it has on their practice. Third is the contrasting conceptions of practice, that of hands-on approaches and not viewing themselves as experts, but at the same time epistemologically, understanding knowledge to be external, something not constructed but transferred, predominantly from the teacher to the student. One explanation is that park educators desire to not only transfer knowledge, but to do so in an interesting and stimulating manner and believe hands-on activities as the most effective means for accomplishing this task. Fourth, is the emphasis of comfort in the nonformal setting. This is consistent with other findings of adult educators in formal settings as well (Taylor & Dirkx, 2002). One explanation is that of behavior management. Park educators spoke of few behavior problems among adult participants. The high degree of emphasis placed on promoting comfort and safety of adults by the park educator, most likely helped lesson the anxiety experienced by adult students in natural settings and indirectly acts as a form of behavior management. Understanding the emphasis on comfort and its relationship to the adult learner warrants further research.

The implications of this study are quite significant. It brings to the fore that nonformal education is much more complex than what has historically been reported. In addition, identifying the varied perspectives offer insight into designing training programs for adult educators who teach in nonformal education settings. Maximizing the educational potential of nonformal education programs is essential considering the limited time and access they have with their audiences.

References

Carr, D. (1991). Minds in museums and libraries: The cognitive management of cultural institutions. *Teachers College Record, 93*(1), 6-27.

Coombs, P. H., & Ahmed, M. (1974). *Attacking rural poverty: How nonformal education can help*. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Courtenay, S. (1991). Defining adult and continuing education. In S. B. Merriam & P. M. Cunningham (Eds.), *Handbook of adult and continuing education* (pp. 15-25). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Dirkx, J., & Taylor, E. W. (2002). Computer-mediated instruction: Beliefs of practicing adult educators. In S. Mojab & W. McQueen (Eds.), *Proceedings for the 2002 Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education*, (pp. 73-78). Toronto: University of Toronto.

Ewert, D. M. (1989). Adult education and international development. In S. B. Merriam and P. M. Cunningham (Eds.), *Handbook of adult and continuing education* (pp. 84-98). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Gair, N. P. (1997). *Outdoor education*. London: Cassell.

Heimlich, J. E. (1993). *Nonformal environmental education: Toward a working definition*. Columbus, OH: Clearinghouse on Science, Mathematics, and Environmental Education. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED360154)

Heimlich, J. E., & Meyers, R. B. (1999). Method boundness among zoo and park educators. *Environmental Education Research, 5*(1), 67-75.

Jarvis, P. (1987). Adult learning in a social context. London: Croom Helm.

Marsick, V. J., & Watkins, K. E. (1990). *Informal and incidental learning in the workplace.* London: Routledge.

Merriam, S. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., & Caffarella, R. S. (1999). *Learning in adulthood: A comprehensive guide* (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Miles, J. C., & Priest, S. (Eds.). (1999). *Adventure programming.* State College, PA: Venture Publishing.

Reed, H. B., & Loughran, E. L. (Eds.). (1984). *Beyond schools: Education for economic, social and personal development.* Amherst, MA: Community Education Resource Center.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Taylor, E. W., & Dirkx, J. (2002). The relationship between espoused and enacted beliefs about teaching adults: A photo-elicitation perspective. In S. Mojab & W. McQueen (Eds.), *Proceedings for the 2002 Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 275-281). Toronto: University of Toronto.

Tilden, F. (1977). *Interpreting our heritage.* Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press.

Tight, M. (1996). *Key concepts in adult education and training.* London: Routledge.

Edward W. Taylor, The Pennsylvania State University—Harrisburg

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

2003 Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference

Refereed Papers

From Research to Practice: Toward a Spiritually Grounded and Culturally Relevant Pedagogy

Elizabeth J. Tisdell

Abstract: This paper summarizes the results of a qualitative study where the purpose was to examine the role of spirituality in developing a positive cultural identity among a multicultural group of 31 adult educators. It then considers what the findings suggest for the further development of culturally relevant teaching practices within adult and higher education settings.

Spirituality is an important part of human experience. So is culture. In recent years there has been much discussion about dealing with culture, race, gender, class, sexual orientation in teaching for social change and greater equity in society in the adult education literature (Guy, 1999; Hayes & Colin, 1994; Hayes & Flannery, 2000; Johnson-Bailey, 2001). There has also been some discussion about the role of spirituality in. adult development and learning (English & Gillen, 2000; Glazer, 1999), but most discussions of it have focused on its individual dimension. While there has been some consideration of how spirituality relates to the practice of emancipatory adult education and cultural identity development from a conceptual perspective (Hart & Holton, 1993; Tisdell, 2000; Tolliver & Tisdell, 2001), there has been limited discussion of the role of spirituality in developing a positive cultural identity based on data based research. *Thus the purpose of this paper is two-fold: (a) to discuss briefly the results of a qualitative study where the purpose was to examine the role of spirituality in developing a positive cultural identity among a multicultural group of 31 adult educators, and (b) to discuss a spiritually grounded and culturally relevant approach to pedagogy that was developed as a result of the study's findings.*

Related Literature

There is a cultural dimension to spirituality, and a spiritual dimension to culture. Faith development theorist James Fowler (1981) notes that spirituality is also about how people construct knowledge through image, symbol and unconscious processes. While Fowler has not discussed the connection of spirituality to culture, obviously image, symbol and unconscious processes are often deeply cultural.

The fields of adult and higher education have given little attention to how people construct knowledge through unconscious and symbolic processes in general, as well as those related to cultural identity development as connected to spirituality. While some authors touch on the connection, in book-length discussions, their focus has generally been on another aspect of spirituality. For example, many of the authors in Kazanjian and Laurences's (2000) recent edited book are of different cultural groups; yet their focus is more on religious pluralism. The increased presence of people of color and those who are interested in cultural issues in the

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

academy, who are beginning to give voice to the cultural dimensions of symbolic knowledge construction processes, is beginning to call attention to the connection of culture to spirituality. As hooks (2000) notes, there are more of us trying to "break mainstream cultural taboos that silence or erase our passion for spiritual practice" (p. 82) and the spiritual underpinning to cultural work. Dillard, Abdu-Rashid, and Tyson (2000), in discussing what it means to be African American women professors note, "Many scholars and activists involved in the reformation of the academy have worldviews deeply embedded in the spiritual. The heretofore silencing of the spiritual voice through privileging the academic voice is increasingly being drowned out by the emphatic chorus of those whose underlying versions of truth cry out 'We are a spiritual people!'" (p. 448).

Earlier my colleague and I have discussed the relationship of spirituality and cultural identity development from more of a conceptual perspective (Tolliver & Tisdell, 2001) and have drawn on the work of Cross (1971) who initially posed a five-stage model of racial identity, and others who have drawn on Cross's model and applied it to other ethnic minorities or non-dominant groups. According to these models, in addition to the positive views of their culture they may have inherited from their families, individuals from these cultural groups may have internalized (from the White dominant culture) some negative attitudes towards themselves. This results partially in the phenomenon of internalized oppression, an internalized but mostly unconscious belief in the superiority of those more representative of the dominant culture. Latino writer, David Abalos (1998), suggests that in order to deal with internalized oppression, and/or for particular cultural groups to be able to create and sustain positive social change on behalf of themselves and their own cultural communities, it is necessary to claim and re-claim four aspects or "faces" of their cultural being: the personal face, the political face, the historical face, and the sacred face. This "sacred face" is related to the spirituality that is grounded in their own cultural community, by claiming and reclaiming images, symbols, ways of being and celebrating that are sacred to individuals and the community as a whole. Those who re-claim their sacred face and its connection to cultural identity, often experience the process of working for transformation of themselves and their communities as a spiritual process. In the words of Abalos (1998), "The process of transformation takes place first of all in the individual's depths, . . . but each of us as a person has four faces: the personal, political, historical and sacred. . . . To cast out demons in our personal lives and in society means that we have freed our sacred face" (p. 35). Most of us would probably like to "free our sacred face" in the way Abalos describes. Understanding how some adult educators are attempting to do this in their own lives and with adult learners can offer new insight to developing culturally relevant and transformative approaches to adult education.

Given the fact that this discussion is about spirituality, it is important to be as clear as possible about what is meant by the term "spirituality" as it is used here. As noted elsewhere (Tisdell, 2003; Tolliver & Tisdell, 2001), spirituality is about the following: (a) a connection to what is discussed as the Lifeforce, God, a higher power or purpose, Great Mystery; (b) a sense of wholeness, healing, and the interconnectedness of all things; meaning-making; (c) the ongoing development of one's identity (including one's cultural identity) moving toward greater authenticity; (d) how people construct knowledge through largely unconscious and symbolic processes manifested in such things as image, symbol, music which are often cultural; (e) as different, but in some cases, related to religion; and (f) spiritual experiences happen by surprise. Understanding how these dimensions of spirituality have played out in the lives of adult educators who conceive of this process of positive cultural identity development as a spiritual

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

process can offers new direction to culturally relevant adult education.

Methodology

The qualitative study itself was informed by a poststructural feminist research framework which suggests that the positionality (race, gender, class, sexual orientation) of researchers, teachers, and students affects how one gathers and accesses data, and how one constructs and views knowledge, in research and teaching. Thus, my own positionality as a White, middle-class woman, who grew up Catholic and has tried to negotiate a more relevant adult spirituality, in addition to the fact that I teach classes specifically about race, class, and gender issues, were factors that affected the data collection and analysis processes.

Of the 31 participants in the study, there were 22 women and 9 men (6 African American, 4 Latino, 4 Asian American, 2 Native American, 1 Indo-Pak, 14 European American,). Criteria for participant selection were that all participants (a) be adult educators dealing with cultural issues either in higher education or as community activists, (b) have grown up and be educated in a specific religious tradition as a child, and (c) note that their adult spirituality (either based on a re-appropriation of the religious tradition of their childhood, or a different spirituality) strongly motivated them to do their cultural work. The primary means of data collection was a.1.5 to 3-hour taped interview that focused on how their spirituality has developed over time, relates to their cultural identity and overall identity development, informs their adult education practice. Interviews were approached as a shared conversation as I was trying to avoid what Fine (1998) calls "othering" (p. 130) participants. Data were analyzed according to the constant comparative method (Merriam, 1998).

Findings

Major findings of the study have been discussed in depth elsewhere (see Tisdell, 2003) and focus on the role of spirituality in (a) dealing with internalized oppression and re-claiming cultural identity; (b) mediating among multiple identities (race, gender, class, sexuality); (c) crossing culture to facilitate spiritual and overall development that result in the ongoing development of a more authentic identity; and (4) unconscious knowledge construction processes that are connected to image, symbol, ritual, and metaphor that are often cultural. Due to space limitations, these will be summarized only briefly.

Dealing with Internalized Oppression

Many of the participants discussed the role of spirituality in unlearning internalized oppression based on race or culture, sexual orientation, or gender. For example, Penny, a Jewish woman, spoke specifically about this, and noted, "I felt uncomfortable around people who looked and/or behaved in ways that were 'too Jewish.' When told I didn't 'look Jewish,' I replied, 'Thank you.' . . . In brief, I had learned to internalize societal attitudes of disgust at those who were 'too Jewish'; I had learned to hate who I was, and I did not even know it." She describes the process of reclaiming her Jewish heritage, her sacred face. In summing up and reflecting on how this relates to her spirituality she noted, "My spirituality is all about how I relate to my world, how I make meaning of life. From Jewish prophetic tradition and mysticism (via the Kabbalah) comes the concept of 'tikkun olam' or the repair and healing of the world. This aptly expresses my core motivation in life, towards social justice, towards creating a life

that is meaningful and makes a difference. I believe I get this from my Jewishness/Judaism, which for me is a blend of culture and spirituality."

Mediating Among Multiple Identities

We are not only people of a particular race or culture; we also have a class background, a gender, sexual orientation, language, and national identity. All of us negotiate these aspects of our identity all the time, but those who are immigrants to North America (or elsewhere) generally negotiate various aspects of their identity and their spirituality against the backdrop of a very different cultural context than that of their home countries. Aiysha is a Muslim woman of East Indian descent, born in East Africa, and after living in Africa, England, Canada, she immigrated to the U.S in her late teens. Moving a number of times, and having to negotiate being a member of a privileged group in some contexts but being a member of an oppressed or lower status group in other contexts has made Aiysha have to negotiate her own shifting identity in a constantly shifting cultural context. These moves and identity shifts, along with her education and the fact that she is a professor dealing with these issues, has forced her to think a lot about the development of her religious and cultural identity as an immigrant and a Muslim in the U.S. She has developed the ability to cross cultural borders to be able to speak to many different groups and in many different contexts fairly comfortably at this point in her adult life, in spite of pressure to "blend in." In reflecting on the process and on being both Muslim and East Indian she noted, "Before it was just a matter of fact for me. Now, it's still a matter of fact, but it's also a matter of pride. I've taken the attitude 'This is WHO I AM. If you are going to know me and like me, you're going to know the whole of me, not just parts of me.' So in a sense the dichotomization of my identity that I described at the beginning, I'm beginning to take that and create a whole from it in the way that I interact." But she notes that this sense of "the whole" is related to her spirituality. Like nearly all the participants in the study, Aiysha has drawn on her spirituality and her growing sense of her "authentic" and more centered self to mediate among these multiple identities.

Crossing Culture to Facilitate Spiritual Development

In light of her immigrant status, Aiysha Ali obviously crosses culture as a daily part of her life experience, and draws on her spirituality in all aspects of her life. Others in the study specifically crossed culture to facilitate their spiritual development. One example is David Preston, who is heavily involved in the Vedanta tradition, an East Indian tradition with its roots in Hinduism. David specifically went looking for another tradition to develop what was missing in his own Irish-Anglo Catholic tradition. Similarly, Maureen Abbott left her Methodist tradition and became heavily involved in the Siddha Yoga tradition. They are like many in North America who are drawing on various Eastern spiritual traditions to facilitate their own spiritual development.

Unconscious and Cultural Knowledge Construction Processes

People construct knowledge in powerful ways through unconscious processes, and ritual, music, art, has enduring power, even when one has moved away from their childhood religious tradition which is often connected to culture. Anna Adams, an African American woman who has long since moved away from the African American Christian religious tradition of her childhood, but discussed Aretha Franklin and her music as an important spiritual symbol for her that connects to her cultural identity and her spirituality, a spirituality that has become more important to her as she has gotten older. In further reflecting on the

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

connection of Aretha's music to her own cultural identity, Anna explained: "I grew up in a Black community doing and understanding and experiencing things of Black culture, so when I say Aretha takes me back, she takes me back to my childhood and the things that I understood then—things like music and dance, and the way of walking, the way of talking, the way of knowing, the interactions, the jive talk, the improvisations, you know all those things that I learned coming up—the music of the church, the choir that I sang in, all of that. And because I was raised in that community with that knowledge her music takes me back even farther than I know, because I don't know where all of those things come from." Obviously, for Anna, Aretha Franklin's music is a great source of inspiration because of its connection to her ancestors, her own spirituality, and its rootedness in her own cultural experience.

Implications for Practice

By drawing on the connection between spirituality and culture, adult educators can potentially create educational experiences that are both culturally relevant and transformative. It seems that, for all participants in this study, the claiming of the "sacred face" was key to developing a positive cultural identity. Participants discussed the spiritual search for wholeness, by embracing their own cultural identity by dealing with their own internalized oppression and through the experience of crossing cultural borders, and finding what was of spiritual value that was more prevalent in cultures other than their own. They also discussed ways of drawing on the spiritual and cultural identities of adult learners in their own educational work to increase the claiming of the "sacred" face, and to increase greater cross-cultural understanding among participants in these contexts.

The findings offer some specific implications for practice. Many of these adult educators also draw on their own spirituality in their teaching by developing ways students can "claim their sacred face" in developing culturally relevant educational practices, not so much by talking directly about spirituality. As noted elsewhere (Tolliver & Tisdell, 2001; Tisdell, 2003), some general guidelines for the implications of practice include the following seven principles or elements of a spiritually grounded, culturally relevant pedagogy for higher education classrooms that is potentially transformational:

(1) An emphasis on authenticity of teachers and students(both spiritual and cultural);
(2) An environment that allows for the exploration of:
- The cognitive (through readings and discussion of ideas),
- The affective and relational (through connection with other people and of ideas to life experience), and
- The symbolic (through artform—poetry, art, music, drama);

(3) Readings that reflect the cultures of the members of the class, and the cultural pluralism of the geographical area relevant to the course content;
(4) Exploration of individual and communal dimensions of cultural identity;
(5) Collaborative work that envisions and presents manifestations of multiple dimensions of learning and strategies for change;
(6) Celebration of learning and provision for closure to the course; and
(7) Recognition of the limitations of the higher education classroom, and that transformation is an ongoing process that takes time.

Obviously, in teaching for cultural relevance, it is important to incorporate readings by and about people from many cultural groups, and in higher education reading and writing about the world of ideas is central. But for learning to be transformative it is necessary to incorporate the affective, and activities that touch the heart. In addition, it is also possible to connect the cultural potentially with the spiritual by drawing on the symbolic domain. At relevant points in the course participants might bring a symbol, create or share an art piece, a poem, a drama, piece of music that encapsulates their learning, and connects to their cultural backgrounds. This ties the theoretical and cognitive world to their affective and experiential world, and further anchors it in the symbolic world, which creates a more holistic approach to learning. Further, spiritual experiences are those that get at the wholeness and interconnectedness of all things. Thus, creating culturally relevant learning experiences that are more holistic is perhaps more spiritually grounded, and can potentially lead to transformative learning.

References

Abalos, D. (1998). *La Communidad Latina in the United States.* Westport, CT: Praeger.

Cross, W. (1971). Toward a psychology of black liberation: The Negro-to-Black convergence experience. *Black World, 20*(9), 13-27.

Dillard, C., Abdu-Rashid, D., & Tyson, C. (2000). My soul is a witness: Affirming pedagogies of the spirit. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 13*, 447-462.

English, L., & Gillen, M. (Eds.). (2000). *Addressing the spiritual dimensions of adult learning: What educators can do.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. (New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, No. 85)

Fine, M. (1998). Working the hyphens. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *The landscape of qualitative research* (pp. 130-155). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Fowler, J. (1981). Stages of faith: The psychology of human development and the quest for meaning. San Francisco: Harper & Row.

Glazer, S. (Ed.). (1999). *The heart of learning: Spirituality in education.* New York: Putnam.

Guy, T. (1999). (Ed). *Providing culturally relevant adult education: A challenge for the 21st century.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. (New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, No. 82)

Hart, M., & Holton, D. (1993). Beyond God the father and mother: Adult education and spirituality. In P. Jarvis & N. Walters, *Adult education and theological interpretations* (pp. 237-258). Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Hayes, E., & Colin, S. (Eds). (1994). *Confronting racism and sexism.* San Francisco: Jossey Bass. (New Directions in Adult and Continuing Education, No 61)

Hayes , E., & Flannery, D. (with Brooks, A., Tisdell, E. & Hugo, J.). (2000). *Women as learners: The significance of gender in adult learning.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass

hooks, b. (2000). *All about love.* New York: William Morrow.

Johnson-Bailey, J. (2001). *Sistahs in college: Making a way out of no way.* Malabar, FL: Krieger.

Kazanjian, V. H., & Laurence, P. L. (Eds.). (2000). *Education as transformation: Religious pluralism, spirituality, and a new vision for higher education in America.* New York: Peter Lang.

Lerner, M. (2000). *Spirit matters.* Charlottesville, VA: Hampton Roads Publishing Company.

Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Tisdell, E. (2000). Spirituality and emancipatory adult education in women adult educators for social change. *Adult Education Quarterly, 50*, 308-335

Tisdell, E. (2003). *Exploring spirituality and culture in adult and higher education.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Tolliver, D., & Tisdell, E. (2001). Going deeper: The role of spirituality, cultural identity, and sociopolitical development in teaching for transformation. In W. C. Hine (Ed.), *Proceedings of the 20th Annual Midwest Research to Practice Conference* (pp. 127-132). Charleston, IL: Eastern Illinois University.

Elizabeth J. Tisdell, Associate Professor of Adult Education, School of Behavioral Sciences and Education, The Pennsylvania State University—Harrisburg, W351 Olmsted, 777 W. Harrisburg Pike, Middletown, PA 17057-4898; 717-948-6640; ejt11@psu.edu

Presented at the Sixth Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference, Temple University, Harrisburg, PA, March 15, 2003.

CE084752

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI)
National Library of Education (NLE)
Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC)

REPRODUCTION RELEASE

(Specific Document)

I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title:	Proceedings of the 6th Pennsylvania Adult and Continuing Education Research Conference
Author(s):	Trenton R. Ferro, Editor
Corporate Source: Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education & Temple University	Publication Date: March 15, 2003

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, *Resources in Education* (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

Level 1

☒

Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic) and paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2A documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2A

Level 2A

☐

Check here for Level 2A release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche and in electronic media for ERIC archival collection subscribers only

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2B documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2B

Level 2B

☐

Check here for Level 2B release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche only

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits.
If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Sign here, → please

Signature: Trenton R. Ferro	Printed Name/Position/Title: Trenton R. Ferro, Professor	
Organization/Address: Indiana University of Pennsylvania 206 Stouffer Hall, Indiana, PA 15705	Telephone: 724-357-2470 E-Mail Address: trferro@iup.edu	FAX: 724-357-7821 Date: 3/18/03

(over)

III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, *or*, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

Publisher/Distributor:
Address:
Price:

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

Name:
Address:

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

Acquisitions Coordinator
ERIC/ACVE
1900 Kenny Road
Columbus, OH 43210-1090

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to:

ERIC Processing and Reference Facility
1100 West Street, 2nd Floor
Laurel, Maryland 20707-3598

Telephone: 301-497-4080
Toll Free: 800-799-3742
FAX: 301-953-0263
e-mail: ericfac@inet.ed.gov
WWW: http://ericfac.piccard.csc.com

EFF-088 (Rev. 9/97)
PREVIOUS VERSIONS OF THIS FORM ARE OBSOLETE